

- 1 **Deliver on Your Own: Disrespectful Maternity Care in rural Kenya.**
- 2 **Adelaide M Lusambili**, Centre For Excellence in Women and Child Health, Aga Khan University/ East
- 3 Africa
- 4 **Violet Naanyu** , Centre For Excellence in Women and Child Health, Aga Khan University, East Africa
- 5 **Terrance J. Wade**, Department of Health Sciences, Brock University
- 6 **Lindsay Mossman**, Aga Khan Foundation, Canada Ottawa, ON, Canada
- 7 **Michaela Mantel**, Centre For Excellence in Women and Child Health, Aga Khan University, East
- 8 Africa.
- 9 **Rachel Pell**, Aga Khan Foundation, Canada Ottawa, ON, Canada
- 10 **Angela Ngetich**, Aga Khan Foundation, East Africa
- 11 **Kennedy Mulama**, Aga Khan Foundation, East Africa
- 12 **Lucy Nyaga**, Centre For Excellence in Women and Child Health, Aga Khan University, East Africa
- 13 **Jerim Obure**, Centre For Excellence in Women and Child Health, Aga Khan University, East Africa
- 14 **Marleen Temmerman**, Centre for Excellence in Women and Child Health, Aga Khan University, East Africa

15 **Deliver on your own: Disrespectful Maternity Care in Kenya**

16 **ABSTRACT**

17 **Background:** Under the Free Maternity Policy (FMP), Kenya has witnessed an increase

18 health facility deliveries rather than home deliveries

19 with Traditional Birth Attendants (TBA) resulting in improved maternal and neonatal

20 outcomes. Despite these gains, maternal and infant mortality and morbidity rates in

21 Kenya remain unacceptably high indicating that more work needs to be done.

22 **Aim:** Using data from the Access to Quality Care through Extending and Strengthening

23 Health Systems (AQCESS) project's qualitative gender assessment, this paper

24 examines and describes women's experience of disrespectful care during pregnancy,

25 labour and delivery. The goal is to promote improved understanding of actual care

26 conditions in order to develop interventions that can lift the standard of care, increase

27 maternity facility use, and improve health outcomes for both women and newborns.

28 **Methodology:** We conducted sixteen focus group discussions (FGDs) with female

29 adolescents, women, men and community health committee members. Twenty four key

30 informants interviews (KII) including religious leaders, local government representatives,

31 Ministry of Health (MOH) and local women's organizations were conducted. Data were

32 captured through audio recordings and reflective field notes.

33 **Research site:** Kisii and Kilifi Counties in Kenya.

34 **Findings:** Findings show Nursing and medical care was sometimes disrespectful, humiliatings,  
35 uncompassionate, and neglectful. In both sites, male health workers were the most preferred by women  
36 as they were friendly and sensitive. Young women were more likely to be abused and women with  
37 disabled children were stigmatized.

38 **Conclusions:** Kenya needs to enforce the implementation of the quality of care guidelines for pregnancy  
39 and delivery, including respectful maternity care of pregnant women. To make sure these procedures are  
40 enforced, measurable benchmarks for maternity care need to be established, and hospitals need to be  
41 regularly monitored to make sure they are achieved. Quality of care and compassionate and  
42 caring staff may lead to successful and sustainable use of facility care.

43 **Key words:** *Disrespectful maternity care, physical abuse, rural facility, facility care, gender, adolescents,*  
44 *Kenya*

## 45 INTRODUCTION

46 Few health interventions have greater potential impact on the overall health of society  
47 than good quality facility-based, care to women while pregnant and during and  
48 after childbirth. In Kenya, under the Free Maternity Policy (FMP), more women have  
49 been choosing to give birth in maternity care facilities rather than at home with  
50 traditional birth attendants (TBA) (1,2) . Despite these gains, infant mortality and  
51 morbidity rates in Kenya remain unacceptably high and anecdotal evidence shows that  
52 not all pregnant women may be willing to attend facility care services. One of the factors  
53 that has been shown to affect utilization of facility-based, maternal health care services

54 is the experience of disrespectful care received by women . In the maternity health  
55 services context, ‘respectful care entails respect for beliefs, traditions and culture, and  
56 [the] empowerment of the woman and her family to become active participants in health  
57 care. Respectful care also encompasses continuity of care, the right to information and  
58 privacy, good communication between client and provider, and use of evidence-based  
59 practices’ (3–5).

60 A wealth of evidence confirms that women who perceive receiving substandard and  
61 disrespectful care during a childbirth are far less likely to seek skilled birth care during  
62 subsequent pregnancies (6–8). In addition to increasing their own and their newborns’  
63 risk for poor outcomes, women with these experiences may also discourage others from  
64 seeking facility-based care (9).

65 Research evidence indicates that gender inequalities and unequal power distribution  
66 may act as a barrier to respectful maternity care (10,11) . Women from low-resource poor  
67 settings are likely to experience gender inequalities and to be discriminated against by  
68 service providers due to their low status in the society (11,12). Further evidence illustrates  
69 that the unequal distribution of power between men and women, and women’s lack of  
70 autonomy in decision making at the household levels in these low resource settings  
71 exposes them to long term health risks – with enormous social and economic implications (13).  
72 Over the past two decades, the Respectful Maternity Care movement has gained considerable

73 attention worldwide as a basic right of women throughout pregnancy, labour, and delivery. The  
74 World Health Organization (WHO) further recognizes the principle of respectful care as a major  
75 factor for increasing the use of pregnancy and maternity healthcare services, and ultimately,  
76 better maternal and neonatal outcomes (3,4,14).

77 Even in HICs, where there are professional standards and documented policies with  
78 respect to delivery of care, legal consequences for violations in providing care, and  
79 patient familiarity with their rights when receiving care , literature  
80 illustrates that vulnerable women in low social economic status may experience  
81 disrespectful care (15) .

82 Research evidence from low resource settings has reported some incidents of individual  
83 behaviour and practices of caregivers at health facilities who violate the principles of  
84 respectful and compassionate maternity care (16–19). In part, this research points to a lack  
85 of adequate staffing, outdated equipment, and a lack of enforcement of explicit standards for  
86 professional ethics as a cause of disrespectful care.

87 Lacking adequate basic components to ensure the delivery of respectful and suitable health  
88 care, it is easy for health care workers to engage in substandard and disrespectful care such as  
89 routinely ignoring patient requests. In fact, evidence from some LMICs demonstrate that  
90 women about to give birth, especially poor and rural women, are more likely to be neglected,  
91 humiliated, and often subjected to verbal and, at times, physical abuse (16,18,19). In Kenya, anecdotal

92 evidence indicates that some pregnant women seeking maternity care are likely to be abused,  
93 however, there is little research evidence that corroborates these views.  
94 In an attempt to begin to address this gap in the literature, this study analyzed data from a  
95 qualitative gender assessment of the Access to Quality Care through Extending and  
96 Strengthening Health Systems (AQCESS) project to describe and shed new light on how Kenyan  
97 women in two dissimilar rural settings experienced maternity care. The project was executed by  
98 Aga Khan Foundation Canada (AKFC) and implemented by agencies of the Aga Khan  
99 Development Network (AKDN) with financial support from the Government of Canada, through  
100 Global Affairs Canada (GAC) and the Aga Khan Foundation Canada (AKFC).

## 101 **METHODS**

102 Qualitative in design, the overall aim of the study was to provide preliminary evidence to  
103 begin to understand the gendered dimensions of access to and control over resources,  
104 decision-making, social norms and perceptions and practices related to access and use  
105 of MNCH services in LMIC countries.

106 The data come from two target communities -in Kenya's rural Kisii and Kilifi Counties.  
107 Kisii area is located in south-western Kenya and Kilifi is a historical coastal county located  
108 northeast of Mombasa. These two locations were chosen because they are the target  
109 locations for the AQCESS project. The intention was to inform the AQCESS project

110 implementation in these two locations to ensure gender responsiveness of interventions.

111 This paper aims to build on the learnings of that assessment and focus in more  
112 detail on the experience of some participants related to disrespectful maternity care.

113 Seeking to elicit representative views, the researchers conducted 24 Key Informant  
114 Interviews (KIIs) with a wide variety of stakeholders including health workers,  
115 government and religious leaders, women representatives, and service providers. In  
116 addition, 16 Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) were conducted across the two research  
117 sites, eight (8) in each. To allow full and free participation, two gender responsive FGDs  
118 from each category, - adult males, adult females, adolescent females, and members of  
119 the community health committees were interviewed separately.

120 Based on the mounting evidence that distance plays a central role in gaining access to  
121 health care (20,21) , focus group participants and interviewees were selected from sites where  
122 half of each FGDs were located  $\leq 5$  km long distance and half were located  $\geq 5$  km  
123 from the nearest maternity health facility.

124 The Aga Khan University's (AKU's) Ethics Review Board and the National Commission for  
125 Science, Technology, and Innovation (NACOSTI) approved the study. In addition,

126 approval to commence data collection was also approved by the County offices at both  
127 sites. Data in both sites were collected in April 2017. Before participating, all  
128 respondents gave informed consent. Researchers explained the purpose of the study,  
129 the potential risks, and that participation was voluntary and participants could  
130 withdraw at any time. Community Health Volunteers (CHV) oversaw and confirmed the  
131 consent of participants younger than 18 years old, who also provided their individual  
132 assent to participate.

133 Qualified moderators conducted FGDs in Swahili, local dialects, or English, as  
134 appropriate. All discussions and Interviews took no more than 2 hours. The field team received training  
135 on the protocol, tools, and on gender sensitive research and ethics. Interview guides for  
136 both participants and interviewers were available in relevant languages. During the  
137 interviews, all sessions were recorded with permission of respondents. Data needing  
138 translation from Swahili or local dialects to English were translated. Transcribed data  
139 were coded, encrypted, and saved securely in accordance with the AKU's Ethics and  
140 Data Protection Act.



141 **DATA ANALYSIS**

142 Upon the completion of the fieldwork in 2017, qualitative data were analyzed using a continuous iterative process (22) . Each  
143 transcript was coded independently by two analysts and reviewed by one study investigator who was the chief data analyst.  
144 Where coding discrepancies occurred, at least two analysts re-examined the transcripts and discussed all possible meanings  
145 associated with the text in question until agreement was achieved. This paper aims to build on the learnings of that assessment  
146 and focus in more detail on the experience of participants related to disrespectful maternity care. An additional coding of key  
147 themes is illustrated in table 1 below. The current analysis relied on the users' own report of their experience of disrespectful  
148 maternity care services.

149

150

151

152

153 Table 1: Codes, Categories and Themes

142. CODES	CATEGORIES	THEMES
1. Left alone in pain; Health workers refused to assist; Delivered on my own; Staff read newspapers; Woman waited for long hours without help; Health workers ignored woman; health workers told woman to deliver on her own.	Lack of professionalism; Lack of compassion; Lack of respect and dignity.	<b>Women were told to deliver on their own.</b>
2. Young woman harassed; Young woman isolated; Doctors harsh to young woman; Young woman forced to share information about the child's father; Young woman quarreled; Young woman humiliated while in pain; Young woman slapped; Young woman contemplated killing her baby; Young woman called prostitute.	Mistreatment; Age based discrimination; Physical and verbal abuse; Woman's dignity; Woman's basic right.	<b>Adolescent women get the brunt.</b>
3. Slapped by women nurse; Delivered by a male nurse; Male nurse angry with women nurse for not helping; Male nurse was very kind; male nurse was helpful; I prefer male nurse; Male nurse preferred; Women nurse proud; Women nurse has no mercy; I fear women nurse; abused by female nurse for having child with disabilities. Called prostitute for having child with Disabilities.	Differential gendered experience of care; Treatment of women by women health workers causes fear; Inappropriate obstetric; Discrimination, equality to care.	<b>Patients differential gender experience of health workers</b>

---

4. The hospital was far; wheeled on a wheelbarrow and baby died. Staff were few; Carried a Jerry can of water on my head to the hospital while in labor. Delivered on the floor; Few beds in the ward; Few wards; Few theatres.

Resources; Lack of water;

Inadequate facilities; Low staffing;

Physical environment.

**Structural factors as a barrier to respectful care**

155 **FINDINGS:** Pregnant women seeking antenatal care as well as women in labour  
156 during and after delivery report that some health care workers in Maternity Care Facilities are at  
157 times disrespectful, demeaning, humiliating, verbally or physically abusive, dismissive, and neglectful of  
158 patient-reported pain, and suffering. Although our results illustrate that women of all ages experienced  
159 these types of inappropriate care and neglect and abuse, younger women and especially adolescent  
160 women, were more likely to report verbal and physical abuse. As well, both male and women focus group  
161 participants reported that female health workers were more likely to demonstrate abusive behaviors and,  
162 as a result, many participants indicated that they preferred to be tended to by male health workers.  
163 Below, we present the specific themes that emerged from the data analysis and provide vignettes to  
164 illustrate and support them.

165 *The following themes emerged from the data.*

- 166 1. Women were told to deliver on their own
- 167 2. Adolescent women get the brunt
- 168 3. Patients differential gender experience of health workers
- 169 4. Structural factors a barrier to respectful maternity care

170 **1. Women were told to deliver on their own**

171 Data from both research sites confirmed cases in which patients' basic right to care was  
172 violated. Speaking of her own personal experience with maternity healthcare workers, a  
173 participant one of the women FGDs reported that some of the health workers refused timely help to  
174 women at the time of delivery.

175

176 ...My experience with my first-born delivery was not good with a women nurse. I told .  
177 her I was in pain, and she abused me saying I should ‘stop my nonsense and wait to give .  
178 birth in the morning.’ Soon after, a male nurse came and assisted me [to] give birth. He  
179 even quarreled [with the women nurse], asking her why she was treating me that way.  
180 (Women FGD, Kisii).

181 In the following, a mother described her experience while accompanying her relative,  
182 and the treatment her cousin received convinced her to never again go back to a public  
183 health care facility.

184 Haaa, I can’t, I better go to the private clinic ... With those mockery and abuses I can’t.  
185 1Like when we went at night with my cousin. There was a male doctor who we think was  
186 1on drugs—chewing miraa, was sitting outside, maybe he was taking bhang. He told the  
187 1girl ‘it’s not you [who can] tell us what to do!’ When the pain was too much, she went to  
188 the bed on her own, and the man came wore glove inserted his fingers and literally tore  
189 the lady... (Adolescent Women FGD, Kisii).

190  
191 Key informant interview with a local politician highlights the pattern of neglectful and  
192 uncompassionate approach to care at the facility.

193 ...I have witnessed a case at the hospital where there was a woman who came for the first.  
194 time and she was told she would not be attended to until she brings her husband and get.  
195 tested, she went and never came back (Women representative KII- Kisii).

196 In the following example, a participant in an adult male FGD speaks of his experience with staff while  
197 accompanying his relative to the hospital.

198 I took my sister in-law to hospital, and after assessing her, they left her alone in bed. She  
199 called for assistance, but they said, ‘It’s not yet time.’ She pushed and delivered on her

200 own, that's when the health workers came running wiping the child...at times they can  
201 beat you because you gave birth on the floor, as if the mistake is yours. Yet they don't  
202 respond when called (Male FGD, Kisii).

203 Some healthcare staff who neglected patients were reading newspapers. Healthcare workers sometimes  
204 left the facility altogether, going for long lunch "hours" and leaving patients for hours on end, waiting to  
205 be attended to:

206 I can add that medical providers are very... abusive especially for young ladies and  
207 adolescents. Some medical staff decide to go for early lunch. Some read newspapers 208.  
208 while patients are waiting for services (Male FGD, Kisii).

209 It happened that since she declined going to theatre the health workers ignored her and  
210 told her to deliver on her own, but God intervened [by chance]. So the nurse's attitude,  
211 Ignorance could be one of the things that contributes to this. (Male FGD, Kisii)

212 The above vignettes demonstrate some of the ways women were treated while under the care of service  
213 providers. The vignettes also demonstrate a lack of professionalism and compassion  
214 among some health workers.

215 **2. Adolescent women get the brunt**

216 While some of the adult women reported that they experienced different kinds of incivility and  
217 poor care, the adolescent women focus groups reported that healthcare workers in both Kisii and  
218 Kilifi were more likely to abuse very young women, both verbally and physically. A focus group  
219 discussion among adolescent girls in Kisii confirmed that some doctors also share this prejudice. In this  
220 case, a doctor uses harsh and humiliating language when speaking to young pregnant  
221 women during the delivery process.

222 ... During the pain, they [doctors] abuse you and tell you to deliver. Yet you don't  
223 know anything. They tell you to push, and you don't know how." (Women  
224 Adolescents FGD, Kisii).

225 ...We (adolescents) are attended to, but harshly. For example, me, I'm young and 225.  
226 they told me, 'Young as you are, you went opening your legs to men.'  
227 (Women Adolescents FGD, Kisii)

228 Some adolescent women reported being slapped during the labour process. One  
229 was so upset by abusive nature of some staff, she contemplated killing the child.

230 she [the nurse] was slapping me. I said, 'I'll kill the baby and give birth to a dead  
231 baby,' but the lady . who escorted me went and called for a male doctor, who  
232 assisted me... (Women Adolescents FGD, Kilifi)

233 ... Some doctors are harsh because you're a girl, during the pain they abuse you  
234 and tell you...'Young girl, when you were loitering looking for that pregnancy,  
235 were we there?'Imagine! Instead of helping you... (Women Adolescents FGD,  
236 Kisii).

237 ... They ask you questions, 'When did you get pregnant? Who gave you this  
238 pregnancy?' You don't know what to answer them. If you don't answer, the  
239 leave you there unattended, and say 'Till you answer ...' (Women Adolescents  
240 FGD, Kisii).

241 As the following discussion from the male FGDs illustrates, this kind of poor treatment appears to stem  
242 from social disapproval, leading to disrespect for adolescent girls who become pregnant.

243 *Respondent:* Our young wives, usually they encounter a lot of problems.

244                                    *Moderator:*     Oh, young wives? Ha!

245                                    *Respondent:*    Yes, the young ones. You know us. We have been, ah, so

246                                    (laughter) ... when they go there, and especially because they are young, they

247                                    complain that they are harassed and asked: ‘You! As young as you are you ...,’

248                                    [and] such like harassment.

249                                    *Moderator:*     Why such harassment?

250                                    *Respondent:*    Because they are young and are already pregnant. And what are

251                                    they expected to do, and it has already happened?

252                                    *Moderator:*     Okay. So how is she harassed? (Group reaction)

253                                    *Respondent:*    She gets uncomfortable.

254                                    *Respondent:*    They begin to think ‘this young girl has already conceived,’ so

255                                    when she goes there to be served, she feels out of place and fearful, hence feel

256                                    she has not been served well. She feels like she has been isolated (Male FGD,

257                                    Kilifi).

258     While some women generally suffer abuse from maternity facility caregivers, levels of physical abuse

259     were reported to be greater for younger women during the actual delivery.

260

261                                    *Respondent:*    Actually, it is during delivery that there are usually a lot of

262                                    difficulties.

263                                    *Moderator:*     Kindly mention all.



264                                    *Respondent:*    Some of [the women] are slapped, and that story became a talk  
265                                    of the town some time back, yeah. Some of the doctors [show] that behavior.  
266                                    (Okay). ‘You did it willingly, and you want to cause us trouble now.’ You see,  
267                                    that’s bad to tell somebody. She might decline to come back again, when she is  
268                                    pregnant in the future, and will prefer to home delivery. ... Yeah, there is such a  
269                                    one [who slaps the women] here, only that I cannot disclose, but they are there.  
270                                    Very short-tempered, even tells you not to come back to that hospital (Male  
271                                    FGD, Kisii).

272    Poor treatment of young women was also reported in some of the Key Informant Interviews. In the  
273    following vignettes, two Ministry of Health (MOH) representatives observe:

274                                    ...the way they [staff] handle these mothers , somebody may harass the mothers and  
275                                    next time... or even when she goes back she will go with a bad picture and says,’ I cannot  
276                                    go back to that facility , they do not handle people properly, they call us with very abusive  
277                                    words .... (MOH representative KII –Kisii).

278                                    ...“I guess once again I would say the adolescents are quite disadvantaged because even  
279                                    the stigma is within the medical care providers, so in terms of the MCH, it is very difficult  
280                                    for the adolescent mothers because they need to seek health care, yet providers’  
281                                    attitude is the worst when dealing with adolescent mothers.” (MoH representative -Kisii)

282    These vignettes illustrate the differential experience of maternity care among adolescent mothers in two  
283    settings. Moreover, the similarity among the vignettes from both the FGDs and key informants show a  
284    consensus regarding the greater level of disrespectful care that these adolescent mothers must tolerate.

### 285            **3. Patients differential gender experience of health workers**

286 The data showed that some women in Kenyan maternity care facilities generally found that female health  
287 care workers were more likely to be disrespectful and abusive compared to male care workers. Some  
288 participants in the focus groups expressed their preference for male health workers, who they indicated  
289 treated them better and were more willing to help when asked. Young women, as a group, were the  
290 most vocal in expressing their opinion of female staff and their preference for male health care workers.

291 ...especially ladies, they are so harsh; they think they dropped from heaven [special than  
292 everyone] and us were collected. Men are better; they can tell you to push while  
293 assisting you. But females will slap you, yelling at you to open your legs while shouting 'I  
294 want to see the child!' with abuses. She tells [me] 'I am waiting to hold the child! (Female  
295 Adolescebt FGD, Kisii).

296 ... Especially female doctors are the worst. Men don't have problems. If you come with a  
297 Range Rover [or a Mercedes] Benz, they will wheel you to the ward. But if brought with a  
298 wheelbarrow, you'll be told to move from here to there—they don't mind the pain you  
299 have. You'll be locked inside a room, and be told to yell there. I was locked [in] and told  
300 go for long call there (Female Adolescents FGD, Kisii).

301 While participants interviewed for this study preferred male attendants as they provided more respectful  
302 care, Muslim patient's desire for male caregivers was tempered by cultural and religious beliefs. A  
303 Muslim participant in the adult male focus group reported how his wife resisted being assisted by a male  
304 worker.

305 I think the most interesting thing is that the women prefer to be served by male health  
306 workers rather than the females...Yes that is the truth but not so for us as Islamic. My wife  
307 declined totally to be assisted by a male nurse. Even during the clinic, she forbids the  
308 male nurse to even touch her when she is to be injected...Actually, it happened that the

309 baby's head was already out before she could even be assisted. The only person that was  
310 available was a male nurse. You know in our religion we prefer not to show the  
311 nakedness of a woman - it is sacred... (Male FGD, Kilifi).

312 Female health workers were reported as being more likely to be verbally and physically abusive. As a  
313 result, patients therefore generally preferred to be attended by male health workers.

314 *Moderator:* So, you are saying that women prefer the male health workers to the  
315 female?

316 *Respondents:* Yes! (Chorus answer)

317 *Respondent:* Yes, because the male nurse has a patient heart. He will even try to  
318 console the mother, unlike the female nurse, who can inflict slaps. Then  
319 she goes about her businesses, leaving the mother behind without even  
320 caring (Women FGD, Kisii).

321 Participants reported that women who gave birth to children with disabilities were likely to be humiliated  
322 by some female staff who blamed the mother for the child's disability.

323 They are women and maybe they've also given birth. They should know the pain they  
324 went through ... If you give birth to a disabled child, they ask you when coming to the  
325 clinic, 'Were you moving with men when pregnant?' Or, 'Your man did fix you well'  
326 (hakuingisha [penetrate] vizuri [good or satisfactory]) so the child didn't reproduce  
327 properly. The man didn't have energy.' (Female Adolescents FGD, Kisii).

328 ...female health workers have contempt. When we went with my cousin, who is also  
329 young, we brought a disabled child. Another lady nurse abused us, till we also abused her  
330 back.... We looked for another doctor, the nurse abused her saying: 'She was sleeping

331 with men while pregnant, that's why she gave birth to a disabled child!,’ and we reported  
332 the case to the senior doctor...We don't know if she was reprimanded. My cousin wanted  
333 to kill the child, saying she is abused because of her child status. We later took the child  
334 to my grandmum, who took care of the child (Female Adolescents FGD, Kisii).

335 These vignettes illustrate some of the gendered experience of health workers by service users. The  
336 vignettes also illustrates some of the attitudes and beliefs associated with giving birth to a child with  
337 disabilities, an area that has not been examined in both research and policy in the Kenyan context.

#### 338 **4. Structural factors a barrier to maternity respectful care**

339 Our analysis confirmed that, in both Kisii and Kilifi, public prenatal and maternity health care failed to  
340 treat some women with dignity and respect. Respectful care is a process in that women must have  
341 available structures to support them on their journey through maternity. Findings from this study reveal  
342 that some maternity health centres may lack facilities such as water, beds or readily fueled vehicles and  
343 ambulances to transport patients that are referred to larger facilities. Participants reported that in some  
344 cases women carried water along with them to the hospitals during delivery.

345 ...You can find a woman who is in labour carrying a jerrican of water on her head going to  
346 the hospital. Simply because she knows there is no water at the hospital... (Male FGD,  
347 Kilifi).

348 ..I saw a woman groaning in pain she had come to deliver and there was no water.  
349 Usually there is scarcity of water in this area. It happened that that day the care provider  
350 present was not supposed to be on duty that night. So it happened as I was talking with  
351 her that is when that mother came in but she had to be send elsewhere because the  
352 hospital was not functioning to the lack of water... (Male FGD, Kilifi).

353 Spaces and beds were not adequate to meet the demand of pregnant women seeking care at some  
354 facilities.

355 The beds in the labour ward should be added. The wards are also small. Some women are  
356 usually waiting to give birth while lying down on the floor because the beds are  
357 occupied...When I was delivering, I gave birth while lying on the floor because the beds  
358 were occupied and there was nowhere to deliver. I knelt and the baby came... (Women  
359 FGD, Kilifi).

360 The available spaces were not gender inclusive and thus discouraging uptake of services.

361 For some women, structural barriers such as poor road systems and inadequate means of transport  
362 hindered accessing the facilities. The male FGDs, both in Kisii and Kilifi observed the difficulties some  
363 women face in navigating social structures that are unsupportive and the deleterious impact this had on  
364 maternal outcomes.

365 ...I come from a place called Ibencho, roads are in bad condition. There is a woman who  
366 wanted to deliver and was carried using a bed and because of the distance, she died  
367 before reaching the hospital...this was less than five years ago. From Ibencho, people are  
368 only carried using beds or wheelbarrows to Sengera...Things are not different with  
369 Riokindo.” (Male FGD, Kisii)

370 ... I have always witnessed women suffering and having a rough time in accessing the  
371 facilities due to long distances that they have to cover. And if it is a must they get to  
372 hospital the only available means of transport is the motor bikes. So you can imagine a  
373 pregnant mother being rode on a motorbike, it is usually a hard task. This is a challenge.  
374 So that is what I have been able to witness also sometimes it happens that some due to  
375 that they end up having complications and some even may die before getting to the

376 health facility. This I have witnessed many times and secondly, when they get to the  
377 hospital you find that midwives are not available (Male FGD, Kilifi)

378 These vignettes demonstrate that on a woman's journey through pregnancy and delivery, there are many  
379 barriers that she must navigate both at the micro and the macro levels. Disrespectful care cannot only be  
380 considered from the way health workers treat women but must consider additional factors such the  
381 availability of resources required to provide respectful and appropriate care.

## 382 **DISCUSSIONS AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

383 In this analysis, women in both research sites reported mistreatment and lack of respect by some health  
384 care workers, and particularly by female staff. These reports, coming both from people who have  
385 experienced the public maternity care facilities in geographically separate rural contexts of different sizes  
386 as well as those key informants who work in or oversee these facilities suggest that there is a tendency  
387 for disrespectful care of pregnant women and women giving birth. Moreover, this deficit in appropriate  
388 care appears to be even greater for women who are poor, young, or have children with birth defects,  
389 potentially undermining the efficacy and reputation of the entire Kenyan public maternity health care  
390 system.

391 Our findings raise issues around various aspects of delivering acceptable and respectful care including  
392 social cultural norms with regard to gendered nature of maternity care, the stigma around age,  
393 pregnancy and disabilities, and structural barriers and inadequacies of resources for maternal care. As a  
394 result, there is an urgent need to address these various issues to ensure that the Kenyan Free Maternal  
395 Policy to provide safe, satisfactory care to reduce infant and maternal mortality is realized. There is also  
396 need for a training on cultural change in norms and attitudes that are associated with age and disability  
397 across the health system structures. To combat negative attitudes and behaviors, existing standards of

398 care must be enforced. Maternity care facility staff must be supported to understand and deliver these  
399 standards of care, with their implementation of these standards consistently monitored.

400 The consistency of these reports, especially when it comes to the treatment of very young women, shows  
401 that these are not isolated cases as they are consistent with research from other low and middle income  
402 countries (16–19). Rather than looking at the disrespectful and neglectful nature of some health workers  
403 in isolation, a systems perspective theoretical approach can provide insights on how to address some of  
404 the mishaps. A system perspective approach posits that behaviors are part of a larger system including all  
405 the structures that support that system [in this case: policy makers, leaders, medical boards, national  
406 governments, local governments, international regulators (WHO), the patient, service providers,  
407 environments etc]. Therefore, to ensure that women receive timely and respectful health care at all  
408 times, all health system actors must be engaged to promote an equilibrium functional environment  
409 where acceptable behavior in provision of care is monitored and sustained. For example, the World  
410 Health Organisation (WHO) guidelines on ‘Care During Pregnancy’ prohibits the routine shaving of hair as  
411 it increases infections. How do we ensure that women are not subjected to this without consenting? And  
412 do the health workers know that these guidelines exist?. Facilities should employ more midwives –for  
413 example, in Kilifi, the nurse to patient ratio is 3 midwives per 10,000 population compared to 23 per 1000  
414 population recommended by WHO. Increase in staffing should be accompanied by incentives to staff, a  
415 training package on respectful care and a locum policy.

416 While it is our responsibility to strive to promote respectful maternity care, we acknowledge that placing  
417 the blame solely on health care workers in isolation will not solve the inadequate services pregnant  
418 women receive. There is a need for a systemic and institutionalized effort spanning from policies to  
419 address community-based, socio-cultural norms, health care educational training, and documented  
420 professional associations standards of care and enforcement of these standards. Instituting standards of  
421 care in Maternity Care Facilities; re-educating health care workers at all levels; and instituting monitoring

422 plans to make sure that pregnant women, women, and newborns are treated with dignity and respect  
423 while receiving obstetrical and neonatal care including coaching and mentorship is critical for shifting  
424 attitudes and behaviors.

425 The fact that female health workers were reported as being more likely than male health workers to  
426 abuse women under their care requires further study to determine the underlying factors for these  
427 attitudes and behaviour, and measures to address this issue. Maternity Care Facilities will need to  
428 monitor all staff closely to make sure patients are treated with kindness, respect, consideration, and  
429 professionalism. To reach that goal, staff attitudes towards patients, and the way they treat them needs  
430 to be a key element in both hiring and retention, and in the most egregious cases, abusers need to be  
431 reported to the police for redress under the law. A structure for reporting and response must be devised  
432 and instituted to make sure that, when dealing with patients, staff understand and carry out the  
433 principles of Respectful Care and gender responsiveness.

434 Lastly, the findings raise issues as to whether sufficient training and professional development for health  
435 service providers in Kenya is delivered, particularly around respectful maternity care and gender  
436 responsive services. There may be a need to review the current curriculum and identify potential areas  
437 for interventions.



438 Table 2 below provides a summary of our findings, suggestions and possible future research.

What is the problem?	Who is responsible?	Proposed interventions	Future research
<p>1. Verbal and physical abuse of pregnant women attending Facility care.</p> <p>2. Age: Abuse and humiliation of young pregnant women seeking maternity care.</p> <p>3. Gender: Female health workers likely to abuse pregnant mothers</p> <p>4. Gender: Mother-attending services with a disabled child likely to be stigmatized and humiliated.</p> <p>5. Health system: Inadequate facilities e.g water at the</p>	<p>Using a system theory perspective:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. World Health Organization (WHO) must set standards, follow up on enforcement, demand audits and monitor progress.</li> <li>2. The government of Kenya (GOK) through the Ministry of Health must enact and enforce standards of operation.</li> <li>3. Following the devolved government in Kenya, the Local county governments must provide adequate facilities for pregnant women, initiate relevant training on respective maternity care and increase incentive to staff.</li> <li>4. Medical Boards: Kenya Medical Association (KMA) and Kenya Nursing and</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Training of clinical and non-clinical staff to combat negative attitudes on age and stigma around disabilities</li> <li>2. Enforcing standards of care with clear benchmarks</li> <li>3. Mandatory Continued Medical Training on respectful maternity care.</li> <li>4. Engaging all health systems actors and</li> </ol>	<p>There is need for research to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(1) Understand culturally appropriate interventions that can promote respectful maternity care</li> <li>(2) To examine the experience of pregnant women with disabilities /or/with children living with disabilities to improve our understanding on the scope of their blight.</li> <li>(3) To explore Facility preparedness of handling</li> </ol>

<p>Facility level to support pregnant women during delivery</p>	<p>Midwifery of Kenya must institute and enforce standards for health professionals.</p> <p>5. Legislators: Must formulate policy and ensure that it is implemented and enforced.</p> <p>6. Hospital Boards: Mandated with managing health facility must ensure that staff are well trained and standard operating procedures are followed included patients right to respectful care.</p>	<p>stakeholders through multiagency group panels</p> <p>5. Improvement of facility infrastructure</p>	<p>pregnant women living with disabilities.</p> <p>(4) To explore factors associated with disrespectful maternity care from the service provider's point of view.</p> <p>(5) To establish prevalence of disrespectful care at the Facility level</p> <p>(6) To find out what tools are in place with healthcare providers</p>
	<p>Source: Lusambili et al (2019).</p>		

## 440 CONCLUSIONS

441 This paper presents women’s experiences of disrespectful care during pregnancy, labour and delivery.  
442 Findings established that the health care service industry’s culture of disrespect and abuse has  
443 established a hostile environment for women in two communities’ maternity health care facilities that  
444 discourage their use for childbirth in future. And there is no reason to believe that these findings are not  
445 generalizable across other Kenyan communities. It is therefore not only bad for maternal and neonatal  
446 outcomes but also a significant barrier to the utilization of facility-based pregnancy and utilization  
447 throughout Kenya. A concerted effort from relevant stakeholders is needed to develop policies,  
448 standards, and intervention tools that can ensure gender responsive and respectful care for all women  
449 during pregnancy, labour and delivery. Stakeholders in various parts of the country including Ministry of  
450 Health (MOH), Kenya Medical Association (KMA), Kenya Nursing Association (KNA), and board members  
451 in different healthcare facilities have a vested interest and must all take steps to rectify disrespectful  
452 attitudes and practices that currently permeate Kenya’s public maternal health care services. Innovative  
453 approaches that are contextually congruent must be developed to integrate respectful maternity care as  
454 a routine quality component along a woman’s journey of pregnancy and delivery.

## 455 STUDY STRENGTH

456 As noted in the methodology, the study elicited views from service users [women] and community  
457 members in two different contexts [men and local leaders] as well as interviews with key informants. This  
458 approach strengthened the data quality and trustworthiness meaning that the findings can be used to  
459 develop intervention tools in a rural context. The findings for this study are not intended to be  
460 generalizable in terms of statistical significance, but provide insight into challenges with promoting facility  
461 ante natal care, delivery and pre - natal care

## 462 ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

463 Authors wish to acknowledge all the study participants from the Kisii and Kilifi Counties. We acknowledge  
464 the funder –Government of Canada and Aga Khan Foundation Canada. We also acknowledge the  
465 feedback provided on the original manuscripts by Dr Abdulrahman Mohiddin, Sofia Jadavji and Dr Anisa  
466 Omar from Kilifi County.

#### 467 **FUNDING**

468 This research has been supported by Aga Khan Foundation Canada and the Government of Canada, grant  
469 no. 7540280.

#### 470 **CONFLICT OF INTEREST**

471 N/A

#### 472 **AUTHORS CONTRIBUTION**

473 All authors have substantially contributed to the writing of this paper and have approved the version to  
474 published.

#### 475 **DATA AVAILABILITY.**

476 Data cannot be shared publicly because of ethical consideration. Data are available from the Aga Khan  
477 University Monitoring and Evaluation Research Unit (MERL). Contact Institutional Data Access  
478 research.supportea@aku.edu for researchers who meet the criteria for access to confidential data.

#### 479 **REFERENCES**

- 480 1. Gichuhi E, Lusambili A. iMedPub Journals Efficacy of Free Maternity Health Policy at Machakos  
481 Level 5 County Hospital ( Kenya ): An Exploratory Qualitative Study Keywords Beneficial changes  
482 observed after introduction. 2019;4–7.
- 483 2. Gitobu CM, Gichangi PB, Mwanda WO. The effect of Kenya’s free maternal health care policy on

- 484 the utilization of health facility delivery services and maternal and neonatal mortality in public  
485 health facilities. BMC Pregnancy Childbirth. 2018;
- 486 3. Tunc Ö, Were W, Maclennan C, Oladapo O, Bahl R, Daelmans B, et al. Quality of care for pregnant  
487 women and newborns—the WHO vision. BJOG. 2015;
- 488 4. WHO. WHO recommendation on respectful maternity care during labour and childbirth.  
489 2018;(February):1–11.
- 490 5. Alliance WR. Respectful maternity care: the universal rights of childbearing women. Survey Report.  
491 2011.
- 492 6. Moindi RO, Ngari MM, Nyambati VCS, Mbakaya C. Why mothers still deliver at home:  
493 Understanding factors associated with home deliveries and cultural practices in rural coastal  
494 Kenya, a cross-section study Global health. BMC Public Health. 2016;
- 495 7. Bohren MA, Vogel JP, Tunçalp Ö, Fawole B, Titiloye MA, Olutayo AO, et al. Mistreatment of women  
496 during childbirth in Abuja, Nigeria: A qualitative study on perceptions and experiences of women  
497 and healthcare providers Prof. Suellen Miller. Reprod Health. 2017;
- 498 8. Kumbani L, Bjune G, Chirwa E, Malata A, Odland JØ. Why some women fail to give birth at health  
499 facilities: A qualitative study of women’s perceptions of perinatal care from rural Southern Malawi.  
500 Reprod Health. 2013;
- 501 9. Oyerinde K, Amara P, Harding Y. Barriers to Uptake of Emergency Obstetric and Newborn Care  
502 Services in Sierra Leone: A Qualitative Study. J Community Med Health Educ. 2014;
- 503 10. Namasivayam A, Osuorah DC, Syed R, Antai D. The role of gender inequities in women’s access to  
504 reproductive health care: A population-level study of Namibia, Kenya, Nepal, and India. Int J  
505 Womens Health. 2012;

- 506 11. Singh K, Bloom S, Haney E, Olorunsaiye C, Brodish P. Gender equality and childbirth in a health  
507 facility: Nigeria and MDG5. *Afr J Reprod Health*. 2012;
- 508 12. Banda PC, Odimegwu CO, Ntoimo LFC, Muchiri E. Women at risk: Gender inequality and maternal  
509 health. *Women Heal*. 2017;
- 510 13. Mmari K, Blum RW, Atnafou R, Chilet E, de Meyer S, El-Gibaly O, et al. Exploration of Gender  
511 Norms and Socialization Among Early Adolescents: The Use of Qualitative Methods for the Global  
512 Early Adolescent Study. *Journal of Adolescent Health*. 2017.
- 513 14. World Health Organization. WHO statement: The prevention and elimination of disrespect and  
514 abuse during facility-based childbirth. WHO press. 2015.
- 515 15. Mohale H, Sweet L, Graham K. Maternity health care: The experiences of Sub-Saharan African  
516 women in Sub-Saharan Africa and Australia. *Women and Birth*. 2017;
- 517 16. Gebrehiwot T, Goicolea I, Edin K, Sebastian MS. Making pragmatic choices: Women's experiences  
518 of delivery care in Northern Ethiopia. *BMC Pregnancy Childbirth*. 2012;
- 519 17. Gebremichael MW, Worku A, Medhanyie AA, Edin K, Berhane Y. Women suffer more from  
520 disrespectful and abusive care than from the labour pain itself: A qualitative study from Women's  
521 perspective. *BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth*. 2018.
- 522 18. Abuya T, Warren CE, Miller N, Njuki R, Ndwiga C, Maranga A, et al. Exploring the prevalence of  
523 disrespect and abuse during childbirth in Kenya. *PLoS One*. 2015;
- 524 19. Okafor II, Ugwu EO, Obi SN. Disrespect and abuse during facility-based childbirth in a low-income  
525 country. In: *International Journal of Gynecology and Obstetrics*. 2015.
- 526 20. Gabrysch S, Campbell OMR. Still too far to walk: Literature review of the determinants of delivery

- 527 service use. BMC Pregnancy Childbirth. 2009;
- 528 21. Kyei NNA, Campbell OMR, Gabrysch S. The Influence of Distance and Level of Service Provision on  
529 Antenatal Care Use in Rural Zambia. PLoS One. 2012;
- 530 22. Tong A, Flemming K, McInnes E, Oliver S, Craig J. Enhancing transparency in reporting the  
531 synthesis of qualitative research: ENTREQ. BMC Med Res Methodol. 2012;
- 532