

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

1 Transfer of *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *arecae*, and *Xanthomonas campestris* pv.
2 *musacearum* to *Xanthomonas vasicola* (Vauterin) as *Xanthomonas vasicola* pv. *arecae* comb.
3 nov., and *Xanthomonas vasicola* pv. *musacearum* comb. nov. and description of *Xanthomonas*
4 *vasicola* pv. *vasculorum* pv. nov.

5 Authors

6 David J. Studholme, Emmanuel Wicker, Sadik Muzemil Abrare, Andrew Aspin, Adam
7 Bogdanove, Kirk Broders, Zoe Dubrow, Murray Grant, Jeffrey B. Jones, Georgina Karamura,
8 Jillian Lang, Jan Leach, George Mahuku, Gloria Valentine Nakato, Teresa Coutinho, Julian
9 Smith, Carolee T. Bull

10

11 Corresponding author: David J. Studholme (d.j.studholme@exeter.ac.uk)

12

13

14 Author addresses

15

16 David J. Studholme: Biosciences, University of Exeter, Exeter, United Kingdom

17 Emmanuel Wicker: IPME, Univ Montpellier, CIRAD, IRD, Montpellier, France

18 Sadik Muzemil Abrare: Southern Agricultural Research Institute (SARI), Areka
19 Agricultural Research Center, Areka, Ethiopia

20 Andrew Aspin: Fera Science Ltd. York, UK

21 Adam Bogdanove: Plant Pathology and Plant-Microbe Biology Section, School of Integrative
22 Plant Science, Cornell University, 334 Plant Science Building, Ithaca, NY 14853, USA

23 Kirk Broders: Department of Bioagricultural Sciences and Pest Management, Colorado State
24 University

25 • Zoe Dubrow: Plant Pathology and Plant-Microbe Biology Section, School of Integrative
26 Plant Science, Cornell University, 334 Plant Science Building, Ithaca, NY 14853, USA

27 • Murray Grant: School of Life Sciences, Gibbet Hill, University of Warwick, Coventry,
28 CV4 7AL, UK

29 • Jeffrey B. Jones: University of Florida, Plant Pathology Dept. , 1453 Fifield Hall ,
30 Gainesville, Florida, United States , 32611

31 • Georgina Karamura: Bioversity International, Uganda

32 • Jillian Lang: Department of Bioagricultural Sciences and Pest Management, Colorado
33 State University, Fort Collins, CO 80523

34 • Jan Leach: Bioagricultural Sciences and Pest Management, Colorado State University,
35 Ft Collins, CO 80523

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

- 36 • George Mahuku: International Institute of Tropical Agriculture (IITA), East Africa Hub,
37 IITA-Tanzania P.O. Box 34441, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania
- 38 • Gloria Valentine Nakato: International Institute of Tropical Agriculture (IITA), Plot 15B,
39 Naguru East Road, Upper Naguru, P.O. Box 7878, Kampala, Uganda
- 40 • Teresa Coutinho: Department of Microbiology and Plant Pathology, Centre for
41 Microbial Ecology and Genomics (CMEG), Forestry and Agricultural Biotechnology
42 Institute (FABI), University of Pretoria, Private Bag X28, Pretoria 0028, South Africa
- 43 • Julian Smith: Fera Science Ltd. York, UK
- 44 • Carolee T. Bull: Department of Plant Pathology and Environmental Microbiology, Penn
45 State University, University Park, Pennsylvania, USA
- 46

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

47 **LETTER TO THE EDITOR**

48 Members of the genus *Xanthomonas*, within the gamma-Proteobacteria, collectively cause
49 disease on more than 400 plant species (Hayward 1993), though some members are
50 apparently non-pathogenic (Vauterin et al. 1996) and some have been isolated from clinical
51 samples such as skin microbiota (Seité, Zelenkova, and Martin 2017). Historically, taxonomy
52 of *Xanthomonas* was tied to the host of isolation (Starr 1981; Wernham 1948), with the genus
53 being split into large numbers of species, each defined by this single phenotypic feature (Dye
54 1962). Subsequently, most of the species were transferred (lumped) into a single species, *X.*
55 *campestris*, and designated as nomenspecies because the organisms could not be
56 distinguished from one another by phenotypic and physiological tests (Lapage et al. 1992; Dye
57 and Lelliott 1974). As a temporary solution, and to help to maintain a connection with the
58 historical and plant pathological literature, these nomenspecies were designated as
59 pathovars within *X. campestris*, each defined by host range or disease syndrome (Dye et al.
60 1980). More recently, DNA sequence comparisons and biochemical approaches revealed that
61 some of the host ranges of pathovars of *X. campestris* were not correlated with inferred
62 phylogenies (Parkinson et al. 2007, 2009; Rodriguez-R et al. 2012). There have been heroic
63 advances to improve the taxonomy of the genus as a whole (Vauterin et al. 1990; Vauterin,
64 Rademaker, and Swings 2000; Rademaker et al. 2005; Vauterin et al. 1995) and of individual
65 taxa (da Gama et al. 2018; Constantin et al. 2016; Trébaol et al. 2000; Timilsina et al. 2019;
66 Jones et al. 2004), based on phenotypic, chemotaxonomic and genotypic analyses. But in a
67 number of taxa there remain unresolved issues.

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

68 The bacterial pathogen *X. campestris* pv. *musacearum* (Yirgou and Bradbury 1968) Dye 1978
69 presents a major threat to cultivation of banana and enset crops in central and eastern Africa,
70 where it causes banana Xanthomonas wilt (BXW) and enset Xanthomonas wilt (EXW).
71 Originally described as *X. musacearum* (Yirgou and Bradbury 1968), this pathogen was first
72 isolated from enset and banana in the 1960s and early 1970s, respectively in Ethiopia (Yirgou
73 and Bradbury 1968, 1974). Symptoms consistent with EXW were reported for Ethiopia as
74 early as the 1930s (Castellani 1939). However, only in the 21st century did the disease
75 establish in the banana-growing areas of Burundi, Democratic Republic of Congo, Kenya,
76 Rwanda, Tanzania and Uganda (Biruma et al. 2007; Tushemereirwe et al. 2004; Ndungo et al.
77 2006; Reeder et al. 2007; Carter et al. 2010). In this region around the Great Lakes of eastern
78 and central Africa, BXW disease severely challenges the livelihoods and food security of
79 millions (Blomme et al. 2017; Shimwela et al. 2016; Tinzaara et al. 2016; Blomme et al. 2013;
80 Biruma et al. 2007; Nakato, Mahuku, and Coutinho 2018).

81 There is confusion in the literature about the taxonomy of this bacterium. Subsequent to its
82 assignment to *X. campestris* (Young et al. 1978), molecular sequence and biochemical data
83 indicated that this pathogen is more closely related to *X. vasicola* (Parkinson et al. 2007; Aritua
84 et al. 2007) as detailed below. Thus, the first objective of this letter is to propose the transfer
85 of *X. campestris* pv. *musacearum* (Yirgou and Bradbury 1968) Dye 1978 to *X. vasicola* Vauterin
86 1995. The second objective is to give a clear overview of the different evolutionary lineages
87 that constitute the species *X. vasicola*, in the light of recent genomics analyses. Strains
88 described as [*X. campestris* pv. *zeae*] (Qhobela, Claflin, and Nowell 1990; Coutinho and Wallis
89 1991) fall within a clade of *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum* (Cobb 1894) Dye 1978 that belongs
90 within the species *X. vasicola* Vauterin 1995. Furthermore, *X. campestris* pv. *arecae* (Rao and

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

91 Mohan 1970) Dye 1978 is closely related to the type strain of *X. vasicola*, as judged by its *gyrB*
92 sequence (Parkinson et al. 2009). In this manuscript, pathovar names that have no valid
93 standing in nomenclature are presented with square brackets as is standard (Bull et al. 2012).
94 The species *X. vasicola* Vauterin 1995 was created to encompass *X. campestris* pv. *holcicola*
95 (Elliott 1930) Dye 1978 and a subset of strains (not including the pathotype) of *X. campestris*
96 pv. *vasculorum* (Cobb 1894) Dye 1978 (Young et al. 1978; Vauterin et al. 1995). Taxonomic
97 studies revealed that *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum* contained groups of strains that are clearly
98 distinguishable from its pathotype strain by phenotypic and molecular traits, despite their
99 shared host ranges (Vauterin et al. 1992; Péros et al. 1994; Dookun, Stead, and Autrey 2000;
100 Stead 1989; Vauterin et al. 1995; Destéfano et al. 2003). Vauterin's type-B strains are
101 distinguished from type-A by SDS-PAGE of proteins, gas chromatography of fatty acid methyl
102 esters and DNA-DNA hybridization (Yang et al. 1993). Type-A and type-B strains can also be
103 distinguished by PCR-RFLP analysis (Destéfano et al. 2003). The pathotype strain of *X.*
104 *campestris* pv. *vasculorum* belongs to type-A. Table 1 lists examples of *X. campestris* pv.
105 *vasculorum* (Cobb 1894) Dye 1978 strains that were classified in one or more of those studies.
106 Vauterin and colleagues assigned type-A strains to [*X. vasicola* pv. *vasculorum*], along with
107 the pathotype, to *X. axonopodis* pv. *vasculorum* (Cobb) Vauterin, Hoste, Kersters & Swings
108 and type-B (Vauterin et al. 1995). However, we note that this pathovar is invalid because of
109 the lack of a formal proposal differentiating it from other pathovars (Young et al. 2004) and
110 no designation of a pathotype strain.

111 Competing classifications and invalid names have led to the potentially confusing use of three
112 different valid species names, *X. campestris*, *X. axonopodis* and *X. vasicola* to describe this

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

113 group of bacteria in the literature. For example, various authors have referred to the single
114 strain NCPPB 1326 as *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum*, *X. axonopodis* pv. *vasculorum* (to which
115 the strain clearly does not belong) or [*X. vasicola* pv. *vasculorum*] (Wasukira et al. 2014; Lewis
116 Ivey, Tusiime, and Miller 2010; Qhobela, Claflin, and Nowell 1990; Qhobela and Claflin 1992).
117 Type-B strains NCPPB 702, NCPPB 1326 and NCPPB 206 were erroneously described as *X.*
118 *axonopodis* pv. *vasculorum* (Lewis Ivey, Tusiime, and Miller 2010) though they are clearly
119 members of *X. vasicola*. However, we acknowledge that examples of mistakes such as these
120 will not likely be resolved by transfer of the pathovars from *X. campestris* into *X. vasicola*.

121 A further source of confusion is the status of strains isolated from maize for which some
122 authors use the invalid name [*X. campestris* pv. *zeae*] (Qhobela, Claflin, and Nowell 1990;
123 Coutinho and Wallis 1991). Adding to the muddle, at least one strain of *X. campestris* pv.
124 *vasculorum* (NCPPB 206) isolated from maize has the fatty-acid type characteristic of *X.*
125 *vasicola* (Dookun, Stead, and Autrey 2000); consistent with this, on the basis of phylogenetic
126 analysis of DNA sequence, this strain (NCPPB 206) clearly falls among strains assigned to
127 Vauterin's invalid [*X. vasicola* pv. *vasculorum*] (Wasukira et al. 2014). A useful nomenclature
128 for this group has become more pressing since the recent outbreak of leaf streak on corn in
129 the USA, caused by bacteria very closely related to strains previously described as [*X.*
130 *campestris* pv. *zeae*]. One of these strains, NCPPB 4614 (=SAM119), has been suggested to be
131 the eventual pathotype strain of *X. vasicola* pv. *vasculorum* though no valid proposal has been
132 made (Lang et al. 2017; Korus et al. 2017). Although [*X. vasicola* pv. *vasculorum*] (Vauterin et
133 al. 1995) is invalid, this name has come to be understood by the community to represent a
134 meaningful biological reality; that is a set of *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum* strains that are
135 biochemically and phylogenetically similar to *X. vasicola*. Therefore, below we propose a

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

136 formal description of *X. vasicola* pv. *vasculatorum* pv. nov., which should be considered valid,
137 to harmonize the formal nomenclature with that which is in use. Further, we therefore
138 propose that [*X. vasicola* pv. *vasculatorum*] group B, [*X. campestris* pv. *zeae*] and
139 phylogenetically closely related strains isolated from sugarcane and maize be assigned into
140 the newly described *X. vasicola* pv. *vasculatorum* pv. nov.; this follows the previous suggestion
141 (Lang et al. 2017) that strains classified to [*X. vasicola* pv. *vasculatorum*] and [*X. campestris* pv.
142 *zeae*] (Vauterin et al. 1995) are insufficiently distinct to warrant separate pathovars.

143 Vauterin et al. (1995) designated the pathotype strain of *X. vasicola* pv. *holcicola* (LMG 736,
144 NCPPB 2417, ICMP 3103 and CFBP 2543) as the type strain of *X. vasicola*, although they did
145 not use the pathovar epithet for the specific epithet of the species as is most appropriate to
146 indicate this relationship. The natural host range of *X. vasicola* pv. *holcicola* includes the cereal
147 crops millet and sorghum on which it causes bacterial leaf streak (Table 2). The host range of
148 the strains that Vauterin et al. (1995) called [*X. vasicola* pv. *vasculatorum*] is less well defined
149 because in most of the relevant pre-1995 literature it is impossible to distinguish between
150 type-A and type-B of *X. campestris* pv. *vasculatorum* and therefore between *X. axonopodis* pv.
151 *vasculatorum* and strains belonging to *X. vasicola*. However, *X. campestris* pv. *vasculatorum* type-
152 B strains (that is, members of *X. vasicola*) have been isolated from sugarcane and maize and
153 shown to infect these hosts on artificial inoculation (Vauterin et al. 1995; Karamura et al.
154 2015).

155 Previous studies suggested a close relationship between *X. campestris* pv. *musacearum*
156 (Yirgou and Bradbury 1968) Dye 1978b and *X. vasicola* pv. *holcicola* (Elliott 1930) Vauterin et
157 al. 1995 based on fatty acid methyl ester analysis, genomic fingerprinting using rep-PCR and

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

158 partial nucleotide sequencing of the *gyrB* gene (Aritua et al. 2007; Parkinson et al. 2009).
159 Draft or complete sequence assemblies are now available for more than a thousand
160 *Xanthomonas* genomes, including those of type strains for most species and pathotypes for
161 most pathovars. Genome-wide sequence data can offer some advantages, such as generally
162 applicable threshold values for species delineation (Glaeser and Kämpfer 2015; Meier-
163 Kolthoff et al. 2013; Meier-Kolthoff, Klenk, and Göker 2014; Richter and Rosselló-Móra 2009).
164 Therefore, we further explored relationships among these organisms using whole genome
165 sequences. We calculated pairwise average nucleotide identity (ANI) between *X. campestris*
166 *pv. musacearum* and representative *Xanthomonas* strains, including all available species type
167 strains and relevant pathotype strains. A representative subset of these pairwise ANI
168 percentages is tabulated in Figure 1. This revealed that the pathotype strain (NCPBP 2005), of
169 *X. campestris pv. musacearum* (Yirgou and Bradbury 1968) Dye 1978b shares 98.43 % ANI
170 with the type strain of *X. vasicola* (NCPBP 2417) but only 87.27 % with the type strain of *X.*
171 *campestris* (ATCC 33913). As expected, strains of *X. vasicola pv. holcicola* share high ANI (>
172 99.6 %) with the *X. vasicola* type strain, which is also the pathotype strain of *X. vasicola pv.*
173 *holcicola* (Elliott 1930) Vauterin et al. 1995. Also as expected, strains of *X. campestris pv.*
174 *vasculorum* previously called [*X. vasicola pv. vasculorum*] or [*X. campestris pv. zaeae*], including
175 the sequenced strain SAM119 (=NCPBP 4614) isolated from corn by T. Coutinho (Qhobela,
176 Claflin, and Nowell 1990), share > 98.5 % ANI with the type strain of *X. vasicola*, supporting
177 the need to transfer these strains to this species. Furthermore, unclassified strains NCPBP
178 902, NCPBP 1394, NCPBP 1395 and NCPBP 1396, from *Tripsacum laxum* (Mulder 1961) and
179 the pathotype strain of *X. campestris pv. arecae* (Rao and Mohan 1970) Dye 1978 (NCPBP
180 2649) all share more than 98 % ANI with the type strain of *X. vasicola*, which places them

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

181 unambiguously within *X. vasicola*. The next-nearest species to *X. vasicola* is *X. oryzae*; ANI
182 between the respective type strains of these two species is 91.7%. It has been proposed that
183 the boundary of a prokaryotic species can be delimited by 95 to 96% (Richter and Rosselló-
184 Móra 2009). By this criterion, *X. campestris* pv. *arecae*, *X. campestris* pv. *musacearum* and
185 strains from corn that are referred to by the invalid name [*Xanthomonas vasicola* pv. *zeae*]
186 clearly fall within *X. vasicola* and outside *X. campestris*.

187 The high ANI levels clearly delineate a genomospecies that includes the type strain *X. vasicola*
188 NCPPB 2417. Nevertheless, despite the usefulness of ANI for delimiting species boundaries, it
189 does not include any model of molecular evolution and thus is unsuited for phylogenetic
190 reconstruction. Therefore, we used RaxML via the RealPhy pipeline (Bertels et al. 2014;
191 Stamatakis, Ludwig, and Meier 2005) to elucidate phylogenetic relationships, using a
192 maximum-likelihood method based on genome-wide sequencing data. This approach has the
193 additional advantage of being based on sequence reads rather than on genome assemblies,
194 where the latter may be of variable quality and completeness (Bertels et al. 2014).

195 Figure 2 depicts the phylogeny of *X. vasicola* based on RealPhy analysis of genome-wide
196 sequence data. Pathovars *X. vasicola* pv. *holcicola* and *X. campestris* pv. *musacearum* are
197 monophyletic, comprising well supported clades within the *X. vasicola* genomospecies. A
198 third well supported clade includes the four *Xanthomonas* strains originating from the grass
199 *Tripsacum laxum*. A fourth clade consists of mostly *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum* strains
200 isolated from sugarcane but also includes *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum* strain NCPPB 206
201 isolated from maize and several strains from maize attributed to the invalid name [*X.*
202 *campestris* pv. *zeae*]. This indicates that sequenced strains of [*X. campestris* pv. *zeae*] from

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

203 corn (Sanko et al. 2018; Lang et al. 2017; Qhobela, Claflin, and Nowell 1990; Coutinho and
204 Wallis 1991) are monophyletic and fall within the clade containing type-B strains of *X.*
205 *campestris* pv. *vasculorum* (Figure 2). The single sequenced pathotype strain of *X. campestris*
206 pv. *arecae* falls immediately adjacent to the *X. vasicola* clade containing strains from corn and
207 *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum* type B strains (Figure 2).

208 Overall, our molecular sequence analyses strongly point to the existence of a phylogenetically
209 coherent species, *X. vasicola* Vauterin 1995, that includes strains previously assigned to *X.*
210 *campestris* pathovars *musacearum*, *arecae*, some strains of *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum*, and
211 strains collected from corn and *T. laxum* grass that have not been previously assigned to
212 species nor pathovar. Here we propose that the pathovar *Xanthomonas vasicola* pv.
213 *vasculorum* pv. nov. includes strains formerly classified as *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum* but
214 distinguishable from *X. axonopodis* pv. *vasculorum* (Cobb) Vauterin, Hoste, Kersters & Swings
215 by protein SDS-PAGE, fatty acid methyl esterase (FAME) analysis and DNA hybridisation
216 (Vauterin et al. 1992; Yang et al. 1993; Vauterin et al. 1995). Our analyses also support the
217 transfer of *X. campestris* pv. *arecae* (Rao and Mohan 1970) Dye 1978 to *X. vasicola*. Although
218 only a single genome of this pathovar has been sequenced, that genome belongs to the
219 pathotype strain of the pathovar (Rao and Mohan 1970; Bull et al. 2010).

220 Our results are consistent with previous evidence for similarity between *X. campestris* pv.
221 *musacearum* and strains of *X. vasicola*, based on FAME, genomic fingerprinting with rep-PCR
222 and *gyrB* sequencing (Aritua et al. 2007; Parkinson et al. 2007). The formal species description
223 for *X. vasicola* Vauterin 1995 states that this species can be clearly distinguished by its FAME
224 profiles (Vauterin et al. 1995). Pathogenicity studies demonstrated phenotypic distinctiveness

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

225 of *X. campestris* pv. *musacearum* (Yirgou and Bradbury 1968) Dye 1978 on banana; *X.*
226 *campestris* pv. *musacearum* produces severe disease on this host whereas *X. vasicola* pv.
227 *holcicola* NCPPB 2417 and *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum* NCPPB 702 (which belongs to *X.*
228 *vasicola*) induced no symptoms (Aritua et al. 2007). The species description (Vauterin et al.
229 1995) also states that *X. vasicola* is characterised by metabolic activity on the carbon
230 substrates D-psicose and L-glutamic acid, and by a lack of metabolic activity on a range of
231 carbon substrates (see below). We are not aware that these metabolic activities have been
232 tested for *X. campestris* pv. *arecae*, *X. campestris* pv. *musacearum* and [*X. campestris* pv.
233 *zuae*]; it is possible that the species description may need to be amended to accommodate
234 any deviation from this definition among the repositioned pathovars.

235 Overall, it seems that the species *X. vasicola* (including *X. vasicola* pv. *holcicola*, *X. campestris*
236 pv. *vasculorum* type-B strains, [*X. campestris* pv. *zuae*] strains, *X. campestris* pv. *arecae* and
237 some strains isolated from *T. laxum*) is almost exclusively associated with monocot plants of
238 the families Palmae and Gramineae. In this respect, it is similar to its closest sibling species *X.*
239 *oryzae*, whose host range is limited to Gramineae (Bradbury 1986). The exception is a report
240 of leaf blight and dieback in *Eucalyptus* caused by *X. vasicola* (Coutinho et al. 2015),
241 remarkable given the phylogenetic distance between this dicot plant and the usual monocot
242 hosts of *X. vasicola*; the infected South African plantation was in an area where sugarcane is
243 grown.

244 In conclusion, analysis of available genome sequence data, combined with published
245 pathogenicity and biochemical data, strongly support the transfer of the *X. campestris*
246 pathovars *musacearum* and *arecae* to the species *X. vasicola* as, respectively, (i) *X. vasicola*

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

247 *pv. musacearum* comb. nov. with NCPPB 2005 as the pathotype strain (being the type strain
248 of *X. musacearum* and pathotype strain of *X. campestris pv. musacearum*) and (ii) *X. vasicola*
249 *pv. arecae* comb. nov with NCPPB 2649 as the pathotype strain (being the type strain of *X.*
250 *arecae* and pathotype strain of *X. campestris pv. arecae*). Strains NCPPB 206, NCPPB 702,
251 NCPPB 795, NCPPB 890, NCPPB 895, NCPPB 1326, NCPPB 1381, and NCPPB 4614 form a
252 phylogenetically and phenotypically coherent group with a distinctive host range causing
253 symptoms on maize and sugarcane but not on banana (Aritua et al. 2007; Karamura et al.
254 2015) that falls within *X. vasicola pv. vasculatorum pv. nov.* The strains isolated from *T. laxum*
255 are also clearly within the phylogenetic bounds of *X. vasicola* but cannot be assigned to any
256 pathovar and form a distinct clade. The previous proposal of [*X. vasicola pv. vasculatorum*] was
257 invalid due to the lack of a designated pathotype strain (Vauterin et al. 1995). We designate
258 NCPPB 4614 as the pathotype strain for this pathovar, following the previous suggestion by
259 Lang and colleagues (Lang et al. 2017). This strain was previously proposed as the pathotype of
260 *X. vasicola pv. vasculatorum* (Lang et al. 2017) and causes disease symptoms on maize and
261 sugarcane (Lang et al. 2017) but not on banana (Supplementary Figure S1). Furthermore,
262 given that strains from corn formerly described by the invalid name [*X. campestris pv. zaeae*]
263 are members of *X. vasicola* and have host ranges that cannot be distinguished from the
264 pathotype strain of *X. vasicola pv. vasculatorum*, we propose that these strains are members of
265 this pathovar. Phylogenetic data support this as the corn strains represent a sub-clade within
266 strains of *X. campestris pv. vasculatorum* that fall within the emended *X. vasicola*.

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

267 **EMENDED DESCRIPTION OF *XANTHOMONAS VASICOLA* VAUTERIN ET.**
268 **AL., 1995.**

269 The characteristics are as described for the genus and the species (Vauterin et al., 1995)
270 extended with phylogenetic data from this study. The species can be clearly distinguished
271 from other xanthomonads by MLSA and whole genome sequence analysis with members
272 having more than 98 % ANI with the type strain. SDS-PAGE protein and FAME profiles have
273 been shown to be distinguishing for some pathovars (Yang et al. 1993; Vauterin et al. 1992;
274 Aritua et al. 2007), by the presence of metabolic activity on the carbon substrates D-psicose
275 and L-glutamic acid, and by a lack of metabolic activity on the carbon substrates N-acetyl-D-
276 galactosamine, L-arabinose, α -D-lactose, D-melibiose, P-methyl-D- glucoside, L-rhamnose, D-
277 sorbitol, formic add, D-galactonic acid lactone, D-galacturonic acid, D-gluconic acid, D-
278 glucuronic acid, p-hydroxyphenylacetic acid, α -ketovaleric acid, quinic acid, glucuronamide, L-
279 asparagine, L-histidine, L-phenylalanine, urocanic acid, inosine, uridine, thymidine, DL-a-
280 glycerol phosphate, glucose 1-phosphate, and glucose 6-phosphate. The G+C content is
281 between 63.1 and 63.6 mol % as calculated from whole-genome sequence data. The type
282 strain is *X. vasicola* pv. *holcicola* LMG 736 (= NCPPB 2417 = ICMP 3103 = CFBP 2543).

283 ***X. vasicola* pv. *holcicola* Vauterin et al., 1995.**

284 = *X. campestris* pv. *holcicola* (Elliott) Dye 1978.

285 Description is as presented by Vauterin et al. (1995). The pathovar is distinguished on
286 the basis of phytopathogenic specialization. As shown here and elsewhere (Lang et al.
287 2017), the pathovar is distinct from other pathovars by MLSA and genome-wide
288 sequence analysis. According to Bradbury (1986), gelatin and starch are hydrolysed by
289 most isolates examined. The natural host range includes: *Panicum miliaceum*,
290 *Sorghum* spp., *S. alnum*, *S. bicolor* (*S. vulgare*), *S. caffrorum*, *S. durra*, *S. halepense*, *S.*
291 *sudanense*, *S. technicum* (*S. bicolor* var. *technicus*), *Zea mays*. The artificial host range
292 (by inoculation) includes *Echinochloa frumentacea*, *Pennisetum typhoides*, *Setaria*
293 *italica*.

294 Pathotype strain: PDDCC 3103; NCPPB 2417.

295 ***X. vasicola* pv. *vasculorum* pv. nov.**

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

296 Description as for the species and this pathovar is distinguished on the basis of
297 phytopathogenic specialization and includes the strains of the former taxon *X.*
298 *campestris* pv. *vascolorum* type B and pathogens from corn. The pathovar is identified
299 to species and distinguished from other pathovars by its *gyrB* gene sequence
300 (Parkinson et al. 2009) and genome-wide sequence analysis. It is not known whether
301 the strains being transferred to this taxon conform to the species description for
302 metabolic activity. According to previously published work (Coutinho et al. 2015;
303 Aritua et al. 2007; Karamura et al. 2015; Hayward 1962) the natural host range
304 includes: *Saccharum* spp., *Zea mays*, *Eucalyptus grandis* and does not cause symptoms
305 on banana (Supplementary Figure S1).

306 Pathotype strain: NCPPB 4614; SAM119.

307 ***X. vasicola* pv. *arecae* (Rao & Mohan) Dye 1978 comb. nov.**

308 = *X. campestris* pv. *arecae* (Rao & Mohan) Dye 1978.

309 Description as for the species and this pathovar is distinguished on the basis of
310 phytopathogenic specialization. The pathovar is identified to species and
311 distinguished from other pathovars by its *gyrB* gene sequence (Parkinson et al. 2009)
312 and by genome-wide sequence analysis. According to Bradbury (1980) the natural
313 host range includes: *Areca catechu* (areca nut). Bradbury (1986) reports the artificial
314 host range to include: *Cocos nucifera* (coconut). Needle prick into sugar cane produced
315 limited streaks, but the bacteria did multiply to some extent and could be re-isolated.
316 Disease: leaf stripe. Long, narrow water-soaked lesions, becoming dark brown or black
317 with age. It is not known if the strains being transferred to this taxon conform to the
318 species description for metabolic activity.

319 Pathotype strain: NCPPB 2649; PDDCC 5791.

320 ***X. vasicola* pv. *musacearum* (Yirgou & Bradbury) Dye 1978 comb. nov.**

321 = *X. campestris* pv. *musacearum* (Yirgou & Bradbury) Dye 1978.

322 Description as for the species and this pathovar is identified to species and
323 distinguished on the basis of phytopathogenic specialization and is distinct from other
324 pathovars by its *gyrB* gene sequence (Parkinson et al. 2009) and genome-wide
325 sequence analysis. Gelatin slowly liquefied, starch not hydrolysed. Growth quite rapid

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

326 and very mucoid when cultured on Yeast-Peptone-Sucrose-agar based media for 48h
327 at 28°C. According to Bradbury (1986), the natural hosts include: *Ensete ventricosum*
328 (enset), *Musa* spp. (banana). Additional hosts by inoculation: *Saccharum* sp.
329 (sugarcane), *Zea mays* (maize) and disease is exhibited as a bacterial wilt where leaves
330 wilt and wither; yellowish bacterial masses are found in vascular tissue and
331 parenchyma. It is not known if the strains being transferred to this taxon conform to
332 the species description for metabolic activity.
333 Pathotype strain: NCPPB 2005; PDDCC 2870.

334

335

336

337 **REFERENCES**

338

339 Aritua, V., Parkinson, N., Thwaites, R., Heeney, J. V, Jones, D. R., Tushemereirwe, W., et al. 2007.

340 Characterization of the *Xanthomonas* sp. causing wilt of enset and banana and its proposed

341 reclassification as a strain of *X. vasicola*. *Plant Pathol.* 57:170–177.

342 Bertels, F., Silander, O. K., Pachkov, M., Rainey, P. B., and van Nimwegen, E. 2014. Automated

343 reconstruction of whole-genome phylogenies from short-sequence reads. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 31:1077–

344 88.

345 Biruma, M., Pillay, M., Tripathi, L., Blomme, G., Abele, S., Mwangi, M., et al. 2007. Banana

346 *Xanthomonas* wilt: A review of the disease, management strategies and future research directions.

347 *African J. Biotechnol.* 6:953–962.

348 Blomme, G., Dita, M., Jacobsen, K., Pérez-Vicente, L., Molina, A., Ocimati, W., et al. 2017. Bacterial

349 diseases of bananas and enset: current state of knowledge and integrated approaches towards

350 sustainable management. *Front. Plant Sci.* 8:1290.

351 Blomme, G., Ploetz, R., Jones, D., De Langhe, E., Price, N., Gold, C., et al. 2013. A historical overview of

352 the appearance and spread of *Musa* pests and pathogens on the African continent: highlighting the

353 importance of clean *Musa* planting materials and quarantine measures. *Ann. Appl. Biol.* 162:4–26.

354 Bradbury, J. F. 1986. *Guide to plant pathogenic bacteria*. CAB International.

355 Bull, C. T., De Boer, S. H., Denny, T. P., Firrao, G., Fischer-Le Saux, M., Saddler, G. S., et al. 2012. List of

356 new names of plant pathogenic bacteria (2008-2010). *J. Plant Pathol.* 94:21–27.

357 Bull, C. T., De Boer, S. H., Denny, T. P., Firrao, G., Saux, M. F.-L., Saddler, G. S., et al. 2010.

358 Comprehensive List of Names of Plant Pathogenic Bacteria, 1980–2007. *J. Plant Pathol.* 92:551–592.

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

- 359 Carter, B. A., Reeder, R., Mgenzi, S. R., Kinyua, Z. M., Mbaka, J. N., Doyle, K., et al. 2010. Identification
360 of *Xanthomonas vasicola* (formerly *X. campestris* pv. *musacearum*), causative organism of banana
361 xanthomonas wilt, in Tanzania, Kenya and Burundi. *Plant Pathol.* 59:403.
- 362 Castellani, E. 1939. Su un marciume dell'*Ensete*. *L'Agricoltura Colon.* 33:297–300.
- 363 Cobb, N. A. 1894. Plant diseases and their remedies. Diseases of the sugarcane. *Agric. Gaz. N. S. W.*
364 4:808–833.
- 365 Constantin, E. C., Cleenwerck, I., Maes, M., Baeyen, S., Van Malderghem, C., De Vos, P., et al. 2016.
366 Genetic characterization of strains named as *Xanthomonas axonopodis* pv. *dieffenbachiae* leads to a
367 taxonomic revision of the *X. axonopodis* species complex. *Plant Pathol.* 65:792–806.
- 368 Coutinho, T. A., and Wallis, F. M. 1991. Bacterial Streak Disease of Maize (*Zea mays* L.) in South Africa.
369 *J. Phytopathol.* 133:112–112.
- 370 Coutinho, T. A., van der Westhuizen, L., Roux, J., Mcfarlane, S. A., and Venter, S. N. 2015. Significant
371 host jump of *Xanthomonas vasicola* from sugarcane to a *Eucalyptus grandis* clone in South Africa.
372 *Plant Pathol.* 64:576–581.
- 373 Destéfano, S. A. L., Almeida, I. M. G., Rodrigues Neto, J., Ferreira, M., and Balani, D. M. 2003.
374 Differentiation of *Xanthomonas* species pathogenic to sugarcane by PCR-RFLP analysis. *Eur. J. Plant*
375 *Pathol.* 109:283–288.
- 376 Dookun, A., Stead, D. E., and Autrey, L. J. 2000. Variation among strains of *Xanthomonas campestris*
377 pv. *vasculorum* from Mauritius and other countries based on fatty acid analysis. *Syst. Appl. Microbiol.*
378 23:148–55.
- 379 Dye, D., and Lelliott, R. 1974. Genus II. *Xanthomonas* Dowson 1939. In *Bergey's Manual of*
380 *Determinative Bacteriology*, eds. R. E. Buchanan and N. E. Gibbons. Williams and Wilkins Co.,

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

- 381 Baltimore, U.S.A., p. 243–249.
- 382 Dye, D. W. 1962. The inadequacy of the usual determinative tests for the identification of
383 *Xanthomonas* spp. New Zeal. J. Sci. 5:393–416.
- 384 Dye, D. W., Bradbury, J. F., Goto, M., Hayward, A. C., Lelliott, R. A., and Schroth, M. N. 1980.
385 International standards for naming pathovars of phytopathogenic bacteria and a list of pathovar
386 names and pathotype strains. Rev. Plant Pathol. 59:153–168.
- 387 Elliott, C. 1930. Bacterial streak disease of Sorghums. J. Agric. Res. 40:963–976 pp.
- 388 da Gama, M. A. S., Mariano, R. de L. R., da Silva Júnior, W. J., de Farias, A. R. G., Barbosa, M. A. G.,
389 Ferreira, M. Á. da S. V., et al. 2018. Taxonomic Repositioning of *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *viticola*
390 (Nayudu 1972) Dye 1978 as *Xanthomonas citri* pv. *viticola* (Nayudu 1972) Dye 1978 comb. nov. and
391 Emendation of the Description of *Xanthomonas citri* pv. *anac*. Phytopathology. 108:1143–1153.
- 392 Glaeser, S. P., and Kämpfer, P. 2015. Multilocus sequence analysis (MLSA) in prokaryotic taxonomy.
393 Syst. Appl. Microbiol. 38:237–45.
- 394 Harrison, J., and Studholme, D. J. 2014. Draft genome sequence of *Xanthomonas axonopodis* pathovar
395 *vasculorum* NCPPB 900. FEMS Microbiol. Lett. 360:113–6.
- 396 Hayward, A. C. 1962. *Studies on Bacterial Pathogens of Sugar Cane*. Mauritius Sugar Industry Research
397 Institute.
- 398 Hayward, A. C. 1993. The hosts of *Xanthomonas*. In *Xanthomonas*, eds. J G Swings and E L Civerolo.
399 Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands, p. 1–119.
- 400 Jacques, M. A., Bolot, S., Charbit, E., Darrasse, A., Briand, M., Arlat, M., et al. 2013. High-quality draft
401 genome sequence of *Xanthomonas alfalfae* subsp. *alfalfae* strain CFBP 3836. Genome Announc.
402 1:e01035-13-e01035-13.

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

- 403 Jones, J. B., Lacy, G. H., Bouzar, H., Stall, R. E., and Schaad, N. W. 2004. Reclassification of the
404 *Xanthomonas* associated with bacterial spot disease of tomato and pepper. *Syst. Appl. Microbiol.*
405 27:755–762.
- 406 Karamura, G., Smith, J., Studholme, D., Kubiriba, J., and Karamura, E. 2015. Comparative pathogenicity
407 studies of the *Xanthomonas vasicola* species on maize, sugarcane and banana. *African J. Plant Sci.*
408 9:385–400.
- 409 Korus, K., Lang, J. M., Adesemoye, A. O., Block, C. C., Pal, N., Leach, J. E., et al. 2017. First Report of
410 *Xanthomonas vasicola* causing bacterial leaf streak on corn in the United States. *Plant Dis.* 101:1030.
- 411 Kumar, S. N. S. 1983. Epidemiology of bacterial leaf stripe disease of arecanut palm. *Trop. Pest Manag.*
412 29:249–252.
- 413 Kumar, S. N. S. 1993. Perpetuation and host range of *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *arecae* incitant of
414 bacterial leaf stripe disease of arecanut palm. *Adv. Hortic. For.* 3:99–103.
- 415 Lang, J. M., DuCharme, E., Ibarra Caballero, J., Luna, E., Hartman, T., Ortiz-Castro, M., et al. 2017.
416 Detection and characterization of *Xanthomonas vasicola* pv. *vasculorum* (Cobb 1894) comb. nov.
417 causing bacterial leaf streak of corn in the United States. *Phytopathology.* 107:1312–1321.
- 418 Lapage, S. P., Sneath, P. H. A., Lessel, E. F., Skerman, V. B. D., Seeliger, H. P. R., and Clark, W. A., eds.
419 1992. *International Code of Nomenclature of Bacteria: Bacteriological Code, 1990 Revision.*
420 Washington (DC).
- 421 Leinonen, R., Sugawara, H., and Shumway, M. 2011. The Sequence Read Archive. *Nucleic Acids Res.*
422 39:D19–D21.
- 423 Lewis Ivey, M. L., Tusiime, G., and Miller, S. A. 2010. A polymerase chain reaction assay for the
424 detection of *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *musacearum* in banana. *Plant Dis.* 94:109–114.

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

- 425 Marçais, G., Delcher, A. L., Phillippy, A. M., Coston, R., Salzberg, S. L., and Zimin, A. 2018. MUMmer4:
426 A fast and versatile genome alignment system ed. Aaron E. Darling. PLOS Comput. Biol. 14:e1005944.
- 427 Meier-Kolthoff, J. P., Auch, A. F., Klenk, H.-P., and Göker, M. 2013. Genome sequence-based species
428 delimitation with confidence intervals and improved distance functions. BMC Bioinformatics. 14:60.
- 429 Meier-Kolthoff, J. P., Klenk, H.-P., and Göker, M. 2014. Taxonomic use of DNA G+C content and DNA-
430 DNA hybridization in the genomic age. Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol. 64:352–6.
- 431 Mulder, D. 1961. A Bacterial Disease of Guatemala Grass. Tea Q. 32:143–144.
- 432 Nakato, V., Mahuku, G., and Coutinho, T. 2018. *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *musacearum*: a major
433 constraint to banana, plantain and enset production in central and east Africa over the past decade.
434 Mol. Plant Pathol. 19:525–536.
- 435 Ndungo, V., Eden-Green, S., Blomme, G., Crozier, J., and Smith, J. J. 2006. Presence of banana
436 xanthomonas wilt (*Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *musacearum*) in the Democratic Republic of Congo
437 (DRC). Plant Pathol. 55:294.
- 438 Parkinson, N., Aritua, V., Heeney, J., Cowie, C., Bew, J., and Stead, D. 2007. Phylogenetic analysis of
439 *Xanthomonas* species by comparison of partial gyrase B gene sequences. Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol.
440 57:2881–7.
- 441 Parkinson, N., Cowie, C., Heeney, J., and Stead, D. 2009. Phylogenetic structure of *Xanthomonas*
442 determined by comparison of *gyrB* sequences. Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol. 59:264–74.
- 443 Péros, J. P., Girard, J. C., Lombard, H., Janse, J. D., and Berthier, Y. 1994. Variability of *Xanthomonas*
444 *campestris* pv. *vasculorum* from sugarcane and other Gramineae in Reunion Island. Characterization
445 of a different xanthomonad. J. Phytopathol. 142:177–188.
- 446 Potnis, N., Krasileva, K., Chow, V., Almeida, N. F., Patil, P. B., Ryan, R. P., et al. 2011. Comparative

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

- 447 genomics reveals diversity among xanthomonads infecting tomato and pepper. BMC Genomics.
448 12:146.
- 449 Qhobela, M., and Claflin, L. E. 1992. Eastern and southern African strains of *Xanthomonas campestris*
450 pv. *vasculorum* are distinguishable by restriction fragment length polymorphism of DNA and
451 polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis of membrane proteins. Plant Pathol. 41:113–121.
- 452 Qhobela, M., Claflin, L. E., and Nowell, D. C. 1990. Evidence that *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *zeae* can
453 be distinguished from other pathovars capable of infecting maize by restriction fragment length
454 polymorphism of genomic DNA. Can. J. Plant Pathol. 12:183–186.
- 455 Rademaker, J. L. W., Louws, F. J., Schultz, M. H., Rossbach, U., Vauterin, L., Swings, J., et al. 2005. A
456 comprehensive species to strain taxonomic framework for *Xanthomonas*. Phytopathology. 95:1098–
457 111.
- 458 Rao, Y. P., and Mohan, S. K. 1970. A new bacterial leaf stripe disease of arecanut (*Areca catechu*) in
459 Mysore State. Indian Phytopathol. 23:702–704.
- 460 Reeder, R. H., Muhinyuza, J. B., Opolot, O., Aritua, V., Crozier, J., and Smith, J. 2007. Presence of banana
461 bacterial wilt (*Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *musacearum*) in Rwanda. Plant Pathol. 56:1038.
- 462 Richter, M., and Rosselló-Móra, R. 2009. Shifting the genomic gold standard for the prokaryotic species
463 definition. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 106:19126–31.
- 464 Rodriguez-R, L. M., Grajales, A., Arrieta-Ortiz, M., Salazar, C., Restrepo, S., and Bernal, A. 2012.
465 Genomes-based phylogeny of the genus *Xanthomonas*. BMC Microbiol. 12:43.
- 466 Sanko, T. J., Kraemer, A. S., Niemann, N., Gupta, A. K., Flett, B. C., Mienie, C., et al. 2018. Draft genome
467 assemblages of 10 *Xanthomonas vasicola* pv. *zeae* strains, pathogens causing leaf streak disease of
468 maize in South Africa. Genome Announc. 6:1–2.

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

- 469 Seité, S., Zelenkova, H., and Martin, R. 2017. Clinical efficacy of emollients in atopic dermatitis patients
470 - relationship with the skin microbiota modification. *Clin. Cosmet. Investig. Dermatol.* 10:25–33.
- 471 Shimwela, M. M., Ploetz, R. C., Beed, F. D., Jones, J. B., Blackburn, J. K., Mkulila, S. I., et al. 2016. Banana
472 xanthomonas wilt continues to spread in Tanzania despite an intensive symptomatic plant removal
473 campaign: an impending socio-economic and ecological disaster. *Food Secur.* 8:939–951.
- 474 da Silva, A. C. R., Ferro, J. A., Reinach, F. C., Farah, C. S., Furlan, L. R., Quaggio, R. B., et al. 2002.
475 Comparison of the genomes of two *Xanthomonas* pathogens with differing host specificities. *Nature.*
476 417:459–63.
- 477 Stamatakis, A., Ludwig, T., and Meier, H. 2005. RAxML-III: a fast program for maximum likelihood-
478 based inference of large phylogenetic trees. *Bioinformatics.* 21:456–63.
- 479 Starr, M. P. 1981. The genus *Xanthomonas*. In *The Prokaryotes*, eds. Mortimer P. Starr, Heinz Stolp,
480 Hans G. Trüper, Albert Balows, and Hans G. Schlegel. Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer Berlin Heidelberg, p.
481 742–763.
- 482 Stead, D. E. 1989. Grouping of *Xanthomonas campestris* pathovars of cereals and grasses by fatty acid
483 profiling. *EPPO Bull.* 19:57–68.
- 484 Studholme, D. J., Kemen, E., MacLean, D., Schornack, S., Aritua, V., Thwaites, R., et al. 2010. Genome-
485 wide sequencing data reveals virulence factors implicated in banana *Xanthomonas* wilt. *FEMS*
486 *Microbiol. Lett.* 310:182–192.
- 487 Timilsina, S., Kara, S., Jacques, M. A., Potnis, N., Minsavage, G. V., Vallad, G. E., et al. 2019.
488 Reclassification of *Xanthomonas gardneri* (ex Šutič 1957) Jones et al. 2006 as a later heterotypic
489 synonym of *Xanthomonas cynarae* Trébaol et al. 2000 and description of *X. cynarae* pv. *cynarae* and
490 *X. cynarae* pv. *gardneri*. *Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol.* 69:343–349.

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

- 491 Tinzaara, W., Karamura, E. B., Kubiriba, J., Ochola, D., Ocimati, W., Blomme, G., et al. 2016. The banana
492 *Xanthomonas* wilt epidemic in east and central Africa: current research and development efforts. *Acta*
493 *Hortic.* :267–274.
- 494 Trébaol, G., Gardan, L., Manceau, C., Tanguy, J. L., Tirilly, Y., and Boury, S. 2000. Genomic and
495 phenotypic characterization of *Xanthomonas cynarae* sp. nov., a new species that causes bacterial
496 bract spot of artichoke (*Cynara scolymus* L.). *Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol.* 50 Pt 4:1471–8.
- 497 Tushemereirwe, W., Kangire, A., Ssekiwoko, F., Offord, L. C., Crozier, J., Boa, E., et al. 2004. First report
498 of *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *musacearum* on banana in Uganda. *Plant Pathol.* 53:802–802.
- 499 Vauterin, L., Hoste, B., Kersters, K., and Swings, J. 1995. Reclassification of *Xanthomonas*. *Int. J. Syst.*
500 *Bacteriol.* 45:472–489.
- 501 Vauterin, L., Rademaker, J., and Swings, J. 2000. Synopsis on the taxonomy of the genus *Xanthomonas*.
502 *Phytopathology.* 90:677–82.
- 503 Vauterin, L., Swings, J., Kersters, K., Gillis, M., Mew, T. W., Schroth, M. N., et al. 1990. Towards an
504 Improved Taxonomy of *Xanthomonas*. *Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol.* 40:312–316.
- 505 Vauterin, L., Yang, P., Alvarez, A., Takikawa, Y., Roth, D. A., Vidaver, A. K., et al. 1996. Identification of
506 non-pathogenic *Xanthomonas* strains associated with plants. *Syst. Appl. Microbiol.* 19:96–105.
- 507 Vauterin, L., Yang, P., Hoste, B., Pot, B., Swings, J., and Kersters, K. 1992. Taxonomy of xanthomonads
508 from cereals and grasses based on SDS-PAGE of proteins, fatty acid analysis and DNA hybridization. *J.*
509 *Gen. Microbiol.* 138:1467–1477.
- 510 Vicente, J. G., Rothwell, S., Holub, E. B., and Studholme, D. J. 2017. Pathogenic, phenotypic and
511 molecular characterisation of *Xanthomonas nasturtii* sp. nov. and *Xanthomonas floridensis* sp. nov.,
512 new species of *Xanthomonas* associated with watercress production in Florida. *Int. J. Syst. Evol.*

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

- 513 Microbiol. 67:3645–3654.
- 514 Wasukira, A., Coulter, M., Al-Sowayeh, N., Thwaites, R., Paszkiewicz, K., Kubiriba, J., et al. 2014.
- 515 Genome sequencing of *Xanthomonas vasicola* pathovar *vasculorum* reveals variation in plasmids and
- 516 genes encoding lipopolysaccharide synthesis, type-IV pilus and type-III secretion effectors. *Pathog.*
- 517 (Basel, Switzerland). 3:211–37.
- 518 Wasukira, A., Tayebwa, J., Thwaites, R., Paszkiewicz, K., Aritua, V., Kubiriba, J., et al. 2012. Genome-
- 519 wide sequencing reveals two major sub-lineages in the genetically monomorphic pathogen
- 520 *Xanthomonas campestris* pathovar *musacearum*. *Genes* (Basel). 3:361–377.
- 521 Wernham, C. C. 1948. The species value of pathogenicity in the genus *Xanthomonas*. *Am. Phytopathol.*
- 522 *Soc.* 38:283–291.
- 523 Yang, P., Vauterin, L., Vancanneyt, M., Swings, J., and Kersters, K. 1993. Application of Fatty Acid
- 524 Methyl Esters for the Taxonomic Analysis of the Genus *Xanthomonas*. *Syst. Appl. Microbiol.* 16:47–71.
- 525 Yirgou, D., and Bradbury, J. F. 1974. A note on wilt of banana caused by the enset wilt organism
- 526 *Xanthomonas musacearum*. *East African Agric. For. J.* 40:111–114.
- 527 Yirgou, D., and Bradbury, J. F. 1968. Bacterial wilt of enset (*Ensete ventricosum*) incited by
- 528 *Xanthomonas musacearum* sp. *Phytopathology.* 58:111–112.
- 529 Young, J. M., Bull, C. T., De Boer, S. H., Firrao, G., Saddler, G. E., Stead, D. E., et al. 2004. Names of Plant
- 530 Pathogenic Bacteria , 1864 – 2004. *Rev. Plant Pathol.* 75:721–763.
- 531 Young, J. M., Dye, D. W., Bradbury, J. F., Panagopoulos, C. G., and Robbs, C. F. 1978. A proposed
- 532 nomenclature and classification for plant pathogenic bacteria. *New Zeal. J. Agric. Res.* 21:153–177.
- 533
- 534

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

535

536 **Table 1. Classification of strains previously assigned to *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum*.**

Strain ^z	Vauterin (Vauterin et al. 1992, 1995)	Dookun (Dookun, Stead, and Autrey 2000)	Péros (Péros et al. 1994)	Current species assignation
NCPPB 186	Type A	Group A	n/a	<i>X. axonopodis</i>
NCPPB 891	Type A	Group A	G1	<i>X. axonopodis</i>
NCPPB 892	n/a	Group A	n/a	<i>X. axonopodis</i>
NCPPB 893	n/a	Group A	n/a	<i>X. axonopodis</i>
NCPPB 181	Type A	Group B	n/a	<i>X. axonopodis</i>
NCPPB 796 ^{PT}	Type A	Group B	n/a	<i>X. axonopodis</i>
NCPPB 899	n/a	Group D	n/a	<i>X. axonopodis</i>
NCPPB 900	n/a	Group D	n/a	<i>X. axonopodis</i>
NCPPB 795	Type B	Group C	n/a	<i>X. vasicola</i>
NCPPB 889	Type B	Group C	n/a	<i>X. vasicola</i>
NCPPB 206	n/a	Group C	n/a	<i>X. vasicola</i>
NCPPB 702	n/a	Group C	n/a	<i>X. vasicola</i>
NCPPB 795	n/a	Group C	n/a	<i>X. vasicola</i>
NCPPB 889	n/a	Group C	n/a	<i>X. vasicola</i>
NCPPB 890	n/a	Group C	n/a	<i>X. vasicola</i>
NCPPB 895	n/a	Group C	n/a	<i>X. vasicola</i>
NCPPB 1326	n/a	Group C	n/a	<i>X. vasicola</i>
NCPPB 1381	n/a	Group C	n/a	<i>X. vasicola</i>

537 ^zIn this table, the superscript ^{PT} indicates the pathotype strain of *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum*

538

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

539 **Table 2. Host ranges of the taxa discussed in this letter.**

Current taxon	Proposed taxon	Pathotype or Type strains	Additional strains in NCPPB known to be part of the newly proposed taxon	Natural hosts	Hosts by inoculation
<i>X. campestris</i> pv. <i>arecae</i> (Rao and Mohan 1970) Dye 1978	<i>X. vasicola</i> pv. <i>arecae</i> pv. nov.	NCPPB 2649 = ICMP 5719 = LMG 533	None	<i>Areca catechu</i> (Bradbury 1986; Kumar 1993, 1983)	<i>Cocos nucifera</i> , <i>Saccharum</i> sp. (Bradbury 1986)
<i>X. campestris</i> pv. <i>musacearum</i> (Yirgou and Bradbury 1968) Dye 1978	<i>X. vasicola</i> pv. <i>musacearum</i> pv. nov	NCPPB 2005 = ATCC 49084 = CFBP 7123 = ICMP 2870 = LMG 785	NCPPB 2251; NCPPB 4378; NCPPB 4379; NCPPB 4380; NCPPB 4381; NCPPB 4383; NCPPB 4384; NCPPB 4386; NCPPB 4387; NCPPB 4388; NCPPB 4389; NCPPB 4390; NCPPB 4391; NCPPB 4392; NCPPB 4393; NCPPB 4394; NCPPB 4395; NCPPB 4433; NCPPB 4434	<i>Ensete ventricosum</i> , <i>Musa</i> sp. (Bradbury 1986), <i>Tripsacum</i> sp. (Unpublished observation, E. Wicker),	<i>Saccharum</i> sp., (Karamura et al. 2015), <i>Zea mays</i> (Karamura et al. 2015; Aritua et al. 2007)
[<i>Xanthomonas vasicola</i> pv. <i>zeae</i> Coutinho and Wallis 1990] [<i>Xanthomonas vasicola</i> pv. <i>zeae</i> Qhobela et al 1990]	<i>X. vasicola</i> pv. <i>vasculorum</i> pv. nov.	NCPPB 4614 = SAM119	None	<i>Zea mays</i> (Coutinho and Wallis 1991)	<i>Sorghum</i> sp. (Lang et al. 2017)
<i>X. vasicola</i> pv. <i>holcicola</i> (Elliott 1930) (Elliott 1930) Vauterin et al. 1995 (synonym of <i>X. campestris</i> pv. <i>holcicola</i>)	<i>X. vasicola</i> pv. <i>holcicola</i> (Elliott 1930) Vauterin et al. 1995	NCPPB 2417 = CFBP 2543 = ICMP 3103 = LMG 736	NCPPB 989; NCPPB 1060; NCPPB 1241; NCPPB 2417; NCPPB 2930; NCPPB 3162	<i>Panicum miliaceum</i> , <i>Sorghum</i> spp., <i>Zea mays</i> (Bradbury 1986)	<i>Echinochloa frumentacea</i> , <i>Pennisetum typhoides</i> , <i>Setaria italica</i> (Bradbury 1986)
<i>X. campestris</i> pv. <i>vasculorum</i> type B = [<i>X. vasicola</i> pv. <i>vasculorum</i> (Vauterin et al., 1995)]	<i>X. vasicola</i> pv. <i>vasculorum</i> pv. nov.	NCPPB 4614 = SAM119	NCPPB 206; NCPPB 702; NCPPB 795; NCPPB 889; NCPPB 890; NCPPB 895; NCPPB 1326; NCPPB 1381; NCPPB 4614	<i>Saccharum</i> spp., <i>Zea mays</i> , <i>Eucalyptus grandis</i> (Coutinho et al. 2015; Bradbury 1986; Vauterin et al. 1995)	<i>Saccharum</i> spp., <i>Zea mays</i> (Karamura et al. 2015)
<i>Xanthomonas</i> sp.	<i>X. vasicola</i> Vauterin et al. 1995	Not applicable	NCPPB 1394; NCPPB 1395; NCPPB 1396; NCPPB 902	<i>Tripsacum laxum</i> (Mulder 1961), <i>Vetiveria zizanioides</i> (Kumar 1993, 1983)	Not known

540

541

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

542 **Figure 1. Average nucleotide identity (ANI) with type strains of *Xanthomonas* species.**

543 Genome sequence assemblies were obtained from GenBank and aligned against each other
544 and ANI was calculated using the *dnadiff* function in MUMmer version 4 (Marçais et al. 2018).
545 Accession numbers of the genome assemblies: GCA_000774005.1, GCA_000772705.1,
546 GCA_000277875.1, GCA_000770355.1, GCA_000277995.1, GCA_000159795.2,
547 GCA_000278035.1, GCA_003111865.1, GCA_002191965.1, GCA_002191955.1,
548 GCA_003111905.1, GCA_003111825.1, GCA_000007145.1, GCA_001660815.1,
549 GCA_002939755.1, GCA_001401595.1, GCA_002939725.1, GCA_000724905.2,
550 GCA_000192045.3, GCA_000488955.1, GCA_001401605.1, GCA_002018575.1,
551 GCA_000482445.1 and GCA_002846205.1 (Studholme et al. 2010; Wasukira et al. 2014,
552 2012; Lang et al. 2017; Sanko et al. 2018; da Silva et al. 2002; Vicente et al. 2017; Harrison
553 and Studholme 2014; Potnis et al. 2011; Jacques et al. 2013).

554 **Figure 2. Maximum-likelihood phylogenetic tree based on genomic sequencing reads.** The

555 maximum likelihood tree was generated using RealPhy (Bertels et al. 2014) and RaxML
556 (Stamatakis, Ludwig, and Meier 2005). Bootstrap values are expressed as percentages of 500
557 trials. Type and pathotype strains are indicated by 'P' and 'PT' respectively. Whole-genome
558 shotgun sequence reads were obtained from the Sequence Read Archive (Leinonen,
559 Sugawara, and Shumway 2011) via BioProjects PRJNA73853, PRJNA163305, PRJNA163307,
560 PRJNA31213, PRJNA374510, PRJNA374557, PRJNA439013, PRJNA439327, PRJNA439328,
561 PRJNA439329 and PRJNA449864 (Lang et al. 2017; Wasukira et al. 2014, 2012; Sanko et al.
562 2018).

563 **Supplementary Figure S1. Pathogenicity tests of *Xanthomonas vasicola* strains on *Musa***
564 ***acuminata* (AAA Group) 'Grand Nain'.** Grand Nain banana plants in tissue culture 20 days

Studholme et al. Letter to the editor of *Phytopathology*

565 post syringe inoculation at OD₆₀₀ 0.2 with **A.** *X. campestris* pv. *musacearum* NCPPB 4433, **B.**
566 10 mM MgCl₂, **C.** *X. campestris* pv. *vasculorum* SAM119 (=NCPPB 4614), **D.** *X. campestris* pv.
567 *vasculorum* NCPPB 702.

568

98.03	98.33	98.61	98.41	98.46	98.62	98.67	98.67	98.63	98.60	87.06	89.59	90.03	90.19	90.11	90.09	90.55	90.56	90.69	90.63	91.34	91.24	X. sp. NCPPB 1394		
98.03	100.00	98.43	98.60	98.55	98.80	98.73	98.82	98.84	98.81	98.90	98.84	87.35	89.97	90.40	90.50	90.43	90.42	90.91	90.89	90.96	90.95	91.77	91.64	X. vasicola pv. holcicola NCPPB 2417 T
98.33	98.43	100.00	98.93	98.81	98.84	98.05	99.04	99.03	99.03	99.06	99.07	87.27	89.98	90.43	90.58	90.49	90.49	90.99	90.96	91.02	91.01	91.79	91.66	X. campestris pv. musacearum NCPPB 2005 PT
98.61	98.80	98.93	100.00	99.13	99.19	99.39	99.40	99.40	99.39	99.38	99.38	87.22	89.87	90.27	90.40	90.34	90.33	90.74	90.74	90.89	90.85	91.65	91.55	X. campestris pv. arecae NCPPB 2649 PT
98.41	98.35	98.81	99.13	100.00	99.50	99.31	99.43	99.41	99.41	99.47	99.42	87.22	89.87	90.31	90.44	90.36	90.39	90.76	90.73	90.89	90.84	91.69	91.56	X. campestris pv. vasculorum NCPPB 1326
98.46	98.60	98.84	99.19	99.50	100.00	99.38	99.48	99.47	99.47	99.50	99.47	87.22	89.91	90.34	90.45	90.37	90.40	90.76	90.75	90.91	90.86	91.70	91.58	X. campestris pv. vasculorum NCPPB 702
98.62	98.73	99.05	99.39	99.31	99.38	100.00	99.60	99.61	99.61	99.60	99.58	87.34	89.97	90.38	90.51	90.43	90.42	90.85	90.81	90.96	90.94	91.74	91.65	X. campestris pv. vasculorum NCPPB 206
98.65	98.82	99.04	99.40	99.43	99.48	99.60	100.00	99.99	99.97	99.97	99.84	87.36	90.02	90.39	90.53	90.47	90.45	90.85	90.83	91.00	90.94	91.85	91.72	X. campestris pv. zeae XGP
98.67	98.84	99.03	99.40	99.41	99.47	99.61	99.99	100.00	99.98	99.97	99.84	87.31	89.95	90.37	90.50	90.44	90.43	90.84	90.82	90.96	90.92	91.77	91.65	X. campestris pv. vasculorum NE744
98.67	98.81	99.03	99.38	99.41	99.47	99.61	99.97	99.98	100.00	99.98	99.89	87.32	89.95	90.37	90.49	90.43	90.42	90.84	90.82	90.96	90.92	91.77	91.66	X. campestris pv. zeae NCPPB 4614
98.63	98.80	99.06	99.38	99.47	99.50	99.60	99.87	99.87	99.88	100.00	99.89	87.46	90.04	90.42	90.56	90.49	90.47	90.85	90.83	90.99	90.96	91.86	91.74	X. campestris pv. zeae X45
98.60	98.84	99.07	99.36	99.42	99.47	99.58	99.94	99.94	99.95	99.99	100.00	87.42	90.04	90.44	90.54	90.47	90.46	90.83	90.82	90.99	90.95	91.86	91.75	X. campestris pv. zeae XZ9
87.06	87.35	87.27	87.22	87.22	87.22	87.34	87.36	87.31	87.32	87.46	87.42	100.00	87.79	87.46	87.44	87.35	87.35	87.53	87.55	87.59	87.42	87.28	87.43	X. campestris pv. campestris ATCC 33913 T
89.59	89.97	89.96	89.87	89.87	89.91	89.97	90.02	89.95	89.95	90.04	90.04	87.79	100.00	89.97	89.93	89.86	89.86	90.02	90.02	90.19	90.03	89.88	90.02	X. nasturtii WHRI 8853 T
90.03	90.40	90.43	90.27	90.31	90.34	90.38	90.39	90.37	90.37	90.42	90.44	87.46	89.97	100.00	90.36	90.32	90.31	90.32	90.30	90.45	90.38	90.35	90.53	X. bromi CFBP 1976 T
90.19	90.50	90.58	90.40	90.44	90.45	90.51	90.53	90.50	90.49	90.56	90.54	87.44	89.93	90.36	100.00	98.12	98.08	93.41	93.40	93.45	93.44	90.52	90.47	X. axonopodis pv. axonopodis LMG 982 T
90.11	90.43	90.49	90.34	90.36	90.37	90.43	90.47	90.44	90.43	90.49	90.47	87.35	89.96	90.32	98.12	100.00	98.84	93.25	93.24	93.33	93.25	90.40	90.40	X. axonopodis pv. vasculorum NCPPB 900
90.09	90.42	90.49	90.33	90.39	90.40	90.42	90.45	90.43	90.42	90.47	90.46	87.35	89.96	90.31	98.08	99.84	100.00	93.25	93.23	93.33	93.25	90.40	90.40	X. axonopodis pv. vasculorum CFBP 5823 PT
90.55	90.91	90.99	90.74	90.76	90.76	90.85	90.85	90.84	90.84	90.85	90.83	87.53	90.02	90.32	93.41	93.25	93.25	100.00	98.76	94.19	94.30	90.86	90.72	X. perforans 91-118 T
90.56	90.89	90.96	90.74	90.73	90.75	90.81	90.83	90.82	90.82	90.83	90.82	87.55	90.02	90.30	93.40	93.24	93.23	98.76	100.00	94.21	94.30	90.87	90.72	X. alfalfae subsp. alfalfae CFBP 3836 T
90.69	90.96	91.02	90.89	90.89	90.91	90.96	91.00	90.96	90.96	90.99	90.99	87.59	90.19	90.45	93.45	93.33	93.33	94.19	94.21	100.00	96.39	90.89	90.81	X. fuscans pv. fuscans LMG 826 T
90.63	90.95	91.01	90.85	90.84	90.86	90.94	90.94	90.92	90.92	90.96	90.95	87.42	90.03	90.38	93.44	93.25	93.25	94.30	94.30	96.39	100.00	90.82	90.75	X. citri pv. citri LMG9322 T
91.34	91.77	91.79	91.65	91.69	91.70	91.74	91.85	91.77	91.77	91.86	91.86	87.28	89.88	90.35	90.52	90.40	90.40	90.86	90.87	90.89	90.82	100.00	91.71	X. oryzae ATCC 35933 T
91.24	91.64	91.66	91.55	91.56	91.58	91.65	91.72	91.65	91.66	91.74	91.75	87.43	90.02	90.53	90.47	90.40	90.40	90.72	90.72	90.81	90.75	91.71	100.00	X. prunicola CFBP 8353 T
X_sp_NCPPB_1394	X. vasicola pv. holcicola NCPPB 2417 T	X. campestris pv. musacearum NCPPB 2005 PT	X. campestris pv. arecae NCPPB 2649 PT	X. campestris pv. vasculorum NCPPB 1326	X. campestris pv. vasculorum NCPPB 702	X. campestris pv. vasculorum NCPPB 206	X. campestris pv. zeae XGP	X. campestris pv. vasculorum NE744	X. campestris pv. zeae NCPPB 4614	X. campestris pv. vasculorum NE744	X. campestris pv. zeae X45	X. campestris pv. zeae XZ9	X. campestris pv. campestris ATCC 33913 T	X. nasturtii WHRI 8853 T	X. bromi CFBP 1976 T	X. axonopodis pv. axonopodis LMG 982 T	X. axonopodis pv. vasculorum NCPPB 900	X. axonopodis pv. vasculorum CFBP 5823 PT	X. alfalfae subsp. alfalfae CFBP 3836 T	X. fuscans pv. fuscans LMG 826 T	X. citri pv. citri LMG9322 T	X. oryzae ATCC 35933 T	X. prunicola CFBP 8353 T	

