

1 **The proficiency of the original host species determines community-level plasmid dynamics**

2 **Anastasia Kottara<sup>1‡</sup>, James P.J. Hall<sup>2</sup>, Michael A. Brockhurst<sup>1§\*</sup>**

3 <sup>1</sup>Department of Animal and Plant Sciences, University of Sheffield, Sheffield, S10 2TN, UK

4 <sup>2</sup>Department of Evolution, Ecology and Behaviour, Institute of Integrative Biology, University of  
5 Liverpool, Liverpool, L69 7ZB, UK

6 <sup>‡</sup>Current address: Instituto Gulbenkian de Ciência, Rua Quinta Grande 6, Oeiras 2780-156, Portugal

7 <sup>§</sup>Current address: Division of Evolution and Genomic Sciences, Faculty of Biology, Medicine and  
8 Health, University of Manchester, Manchester, M13 9PT, UK.

9

10 Corresponding author: Michael Brockhurst, Division of Evolution and Genomic Sciences, Faculty of  
11 Biology, Medicine and Health, University of Manchester, Manchester, M13 9PT, UK. Email-  
12 [michael.brockhurst@manchester.ac.uk](mailto:michael.brockhurst@manchester.ac.uk)

13

14 Keywords: horizontal gene transfer, mobile genetic elements, conjugative plasmids, bacterial  
15 communities, plasmid transfer.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26 **ABSTRACT**

27 Plasmids are common in natural bacterial communities, facilitating bacterial evolution via horizontal  
28 gene transfer. Bacterial species vary in their proficiency to host plasmids: Whereas plasmids are stably  
29 maintained in some species regardless of selection for plasmid-encoded genes, in other species, even  
30 beneficial plasmids are rapidly lost. It is, however, unclear how this variation in host proficiency affects  
31 plasmid persistence in communities. Here, we test this using multispecies bacterial soil communities  
32 comprising species varying in their proficiency to host a large conjugative mercury resistance plasmid.  
33 Plasmids reached higher community-level abundance where beneficial and when introduced to the  
34 community in a more proficient host species. Proficient plasmid host species were also better able to  
35 disseminate the plasmid to a wider diversity of host species. These findings suggest that the dynamics  
36 of plasmids in natural bacterial communities depend not only upon the plasmid's attributes and the  
37 selective environment, but also upon the proficiency of their host species.

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

## 52 INTRODUCTION

53 Mobile genetic elements (MGEs) like plasmids, temperate bacteriophages, and transposons, are  
54 important agents of horizontal gene transfer (HGT) driving the diversification of bacterial genomes  
55 (Frost *et al.* 2005; Hall, Brockhurst and Harrison 2017a; Brockhurst *et al.* 2019). Conjugative plasmids  
56 contain genes encoding core plasmid functions – including their own propagation, replication, stability  
57 and transfer – along with accessory genes that encode traits like antibiotic and metal resistance  
58 (Norman, Hansen and Sørensen 2009). While the plasmid’s accessory genes can directly benefit the  
59 host cell by providing them with new ecological functions, the plasmid’s core functions can impose a  
60 heavy burden on the host cell, the accessory genes can directly benefit the host cell by providing them  
61 with new ecological functions (Baltrus 2013; San Millan and Maclean 2017). Mathematical models of  
62 plasmid population dynamics suggest that the plasmid cost, conjugation rate, segregation rate, and the  
63 strength of positive selection are key parameters determining plasmid survival in bacterial populations  
64 (Stewart and Levin 1977; Levin, Stewart and Rice 1979; Simonsen *et al.* 1990; Bergstrom, Lipsitch and  
65 Levin 2000).

66 Plasmids are expected to spread under positive selection for their encoded accessory genes (San  
67 Millan *et al.* 2014; Harrison *et al.* 2015), however, because accessory genes can be captured by the  
68 bacterial chromosome rendering the plasmid redundant, positive selection does not guarantee the long-  
69 term survival of plasmids (Bergstrom, Lipsitch and Levin 2000). Meanwhile, in the absence of positive  
70 selection, plasmids are expected to go extinct due to purifying selection because the benefits of  
71 accessory genes do not outweigh the costs of plasmid carriage (Bergstrom, Lipsitch and Levin 2000).  
72 Since rates of conjugation appear to often be too low for plasmids to persist as infectious elements  
73 (although see: Lopatkin *et al.* (2017) and Stevenson *et al.* (2017)), it has been argued that the widespread  
74 distribution of plasmids is paradoxical (the plasmid paradox: Harrison and Brockhurst (2012)). Yet,  
75 plasmids have been found to stably persist in natural bacterial communities in the absence of measurable  
76 positive selection, where the factors allowing plasmid stability are puzzling (Heuer and Smalla 2012).

77 Most studies of plasmid dynamics focus on a single-host species, whereas, in natural bacterial  
78 communities, many potential host species co-exist, potentially broadening the range of conditions under

79 which plasmids can survive. This limitation of current understanding is particularly interesting  
80 considering that several studies have shown that plasmids are not equally stable across host species (De  
81 Gelder *et al.* 2007; Kottara *et al.* 2018; Sakuda *et al.* 2018). For example, while the mercury resistance  
82 plasmid pQBR103 was highly stable for >400 generations with or without mercury selection in *P.*  
83 *fluorescens* and *P. savastanoi*, it was unstable to varying degrees in *P. stutzeri* (generally lost within  
84 ~100-400 generations), *P. aeruginosa* and *P. putida* (<6 generations) even with strong mercury  
85 selection (Kottara *et al.* 2018).

86 Hall *et al.* (2016) showed, by tracking the dynamics of the mercury resistance plasmid pQBR57  
87 in a two-species soil community of *P. fluorescens* and *P. putida*, that between-species transfer of the  
88 plasmid from a proficient host, *P. fluorescens*, to an unstable host, *P. putida*, allowed the plasmid to  
89 persist in *P. putida* both with and without mercury selection. This finding suggests that the dynamics  
90 of a plasmid in a bacterial community is likely to depend on the proficiency of the plasmid host species  
91 to stably maintain the plasmid. This leads to the prediction that, at the community-level, plasmid  
92 abundance will be higher in communities where it is carried by a proficient original plasmid host, since  
93 this species will both be able to maintain the plasmid in its own population, and then disseminate the  
94 plasmid to other species in the community.

95 To test this prediction, we tracked the dynamics of pQBR103 in a three-species community of  
96 *P. fluorescens*, *P. stutzeri* and *P. putida* with and without mercury selection. We varied which of the  
97 species carried the plasmid at the start of the experiment. We hypothesised that the community-level  
98 plasmid abundance would vary according to the proficiency of the original plasmid host species to act  
99 as hosts to pQBR103, which varies hierarchically – *P. fluorescens* > *P. stutzeri* > *P. putida* (Kottara *et*  
100 *al.* 2018). Replicate communities were propagated in effectively sterile potting soil microcosms, which  
101 provide spatial structure and a low resource environment that more closely resemble the natural physical  
102 and chemical conditions in soil and promote the stable co-existence of multiple bacterial species  
103 (Gómez and Buckling 2011; Heuer and Smalla 2012; Hall *et al.* 2015; Hall *et al.* 2016).

104

105 **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

## 106 **Bacterial strains and plasmid**

107 Three *Pseudomonas* species – *P. fluorescens* SBW25 (Rainey, Bailey and Thompson 1994), *P. stutzeri*  
108 JM300 (DSM 10701) (Busquets *et al.* 2012) and *P. putida* KT2440 (Bagdasarian *et al.* 1981) – were  
109 utilised in this study. *Pseudomonas* species were labelled by directed insertion of either streptomycin  
110 ( $\text{Sm}^{\text{R}}$ ) or gentamicin resistance ( $\text{Gm}^{\text{R}}$ ) marker using the mini-Tn7 transposon system (Lambertsen,  
111 Sternberg and Molin 2004). The plasmid used in this study, pQBR103 is a large conjugative plasmid  
112 (425 kb) that confers mercury resistance via a *mer* operon encoded on a Tn5042 transposon (Lilley *et*  
113 *al.* 1996; Tett *et al.* 2007). pQBR103 plasmid is part of a group of 136 plasmids that were isolated from  
114 the bacterial community inhabiting the sugar beet rhizosphere and phyllosphere during a long-term field  
115 experiment (Lilley *et al.* 1996). pQBR103 was acquired by conjugation into labelled strain of *P.*  
116 *fluorescens* that was introduced onto the naturally occurring bacterial community colonising the sugar  
117 beet rhizosphere with the primary plasmid-host remaining unknown (Lilley *et al.* 1996). To obtain the  
118 initial plasmid-bearing clones of each host species to start the selection experiment, pQBR103 plasmid  
119 was conjugated into *P. stutzeri*  $\text{Gm}^{\text{R}}$ , *P. putida*  $\text{Sm}^{\text{R}}$  and *P. fluorescens*  $\text{Sm}^{\text{R}}\text{lacZ}$  from the plasmid-  
120 bearing *P. fluorescens* SBW25  $\text{Sm}^{\text{R}}$  or  $\text{Gm}^{\text{R}}$  stocks. Plasmid conjugation was performed by mixing 1:1  
121 each of the plasmid-free with the plasmid-bearing strains, incubating for 48 h and spreading on King's  
122 B growth (KB) agar plates containing  $5 \mu\text{g mL}^{-1}$  gentamicin or  $50 \mu\text{g mL}^{-1}$  streptomycin ( $50 \mu\text{g mL}^{-1}$   
123 X-Gal) and  $20 \mu\text{M}$  of mercury(II) chloride to select for transconjugant colonies (Simonsen *et al.* 1990).  
124 The conjugation assays were conducted in 6 mL KB medium in 30 mL universal vials ('microcosms')  
125 at  $28^{\circ}\text{C}$  in shaking conditions (180 rpm).

126

## 127 **Selection experiment**

128 To account for the high segregation rate of the plasmid in *P. putida* KT2440 (Kottara *et al.* 2018) and  
129 to ensure high starting frequencies of plasmid carriage across all the tested bacterial strains, single  
130 colonies of each plasmid-bearing species were reconditioned overnight and then transferred in fresh  
131 media containing mercury. Specifically, individual colonies ( $n=12$ ) of each plasmid-bearing  
132 *Pseudomonas* species were picked into separate 6 mL KB microcosms and incubated overnight at  $28^{\circ}\text{C}$

133 with shaking 180 rpm after which time 1% of each population was transferred to grow for 24 h in fresh  
134 KB microcosms containing 50  $\mu\text{M}$  of mercury(II) chloride at same temperature and shaking conditions;  
135 this concentration of mercury was used to select for the pQBR103 plasmid based on previous findings  
136 (Kottara *et al.* 2018). Similarly, 24 colonies of each plasmid-free *Pseudomonas* species were each  
137 grown overnight in KB 6 mL microcosms and transferred to grow for 24 h in fresh KB microcosms at  
138 same temperature and shaking conditions.

139

#### 140 *Bacterial communities*

141 We used soil microcosms to evolve three different bacterial communities differing by which species  
142 carried the plasmid at the beginning of the experiment (original plasmid host). To prepare the soil  
143 microcosms, we added 10 g of John Innes No. 2 compost soil in 30 mL universal vials which we  
144 autoclaved twice. By autoclaving the compost soil two times, we established an effectively sterile  
145 micro-environment with the physical and chemical properties of soil which did not contain other  
146 culturable bacteria than our inoculum (Gómez and Buckling 2010; Hall *et al.* 2015; Hall *et al.* 2016).  
147 Three different bacterial communities were then constructed: *P. fluorescens* (carrying pQBR103) with  
148 *P. stutzeri* and *P. putida*; *P. fluorescens* with *P. stutzeri* (pQBR103) and *P. putida*; *P. fluorescens* with  
149 *P. stutzeri* and *P. putida* (pQBR103). Six replicates of each community were grown either without  
150 mercury or with mercury ( $16 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$  Hg(II)); this concentration of mercury was used to select for the  
151 pQBR103 plasmid while could allow the survival of the plasmid-free species based on previous findings  
152 (Hall *et al.* 2015). Each community had a starting ratio of 1:1:1 of each *Pseudomonas* species such that  
153 the starting frequency of pQBR103 in the community was approximately 33%. To remove spent media  
154 and residual mercury from overnight cultures each inoculum was briefly vortexed, then centrifuged for  
155 1 min at 10,000 rpm and resuspended in 1 mL M9 salt solution (Cold Spring Harbor Protocols). 100  $\mu\text{L}$   
156 was then inoculated into soil microcosms and incubated at 28°C at 80% humidity (Hall *et al.* 2016).

157

#### 158 *Serial transfers and bacterial counts*

159 Every 4 days, 10 mL of M9 buffer and 20 glass beads were added to each soil microcosm and mixed  
160 by vortexing for 1 min, and 100  $\mu\text{L}$  of soil wash was transferred to a fresh soil microcosm as previously

161 described by Hall *et al.* (2016). Bacterial counts for each species were estimated by plating onto  
162 selective media: 50  $\mu\text{g mL}^{-1}$  streptomycin + 50  $\mu\text{g mL}^{-1}$  X-Gal KB agar plates and 5  $\mu\text{g mL}^{-1}$  gentamicin  
163 KB agar plates, each of which was then replica plated onto mercury KB agar plates (100  $\mu\text{M}$  mercury(II)  
164 chloride). The bacterial communities were evolved for 10 transfers (~40 days).

165

#### 166 *Plasmid and mercury-transposon screening*

167 Twenty-four mercury-resistant colonies of each *Pseudomonas* species were sampled every 2 transfers  
168 from the mercury containing plates and tested for the presence of the plasmid and mercury transposon  
169 by PCR screening. The PCR used the same sets of primers as previously described [*mer* operon on the  
170 Tn5042 transposon – forward primer: TGCAAGACACCCCCTATTGGAC, reverse primer:  
171 TTCGGCGACCAGCTTGATGAAC and origin of replication of the plasmid (*oriV*) – forward primer:  
172 TGCCTAATCGTGTGTAATGTC, reverse primer: ACTCTGGCCTGCAAGTTTC] (Harrison *et al.*  
173 2015; Kottara *et al.* 2018).

174

#### 175 **Statistics**

176 Statistical analyses were performed using RStudio version 3.2.3 (R Core Team 2013). Shapiro-Wilk  
177 test, normal Q-Q plots, histograms and box-plots were used to examine the normality of the data. We  
178 found that in most cases the data were not normally distributed, and in such cases used a non-parametric  
179 test. Cumulative plasmid abundance in each community over time was estimated as the area under the  
180 curve using the function *auc* of the package ‘flux’ (Jurasinski, Koebisch and Hagemann 2012).  
181 Community-level plasmid abundances in the plasmid host treatments were compared by using the  
182 Kruskal-Wallis test. To assess the plasmid-dynamics within each species, we compared plasmid  
183 frequencies in the plasmid-recipient species population as the area under the curve. The integral  
184 estimates of the plasmid frequency in the recipient species were compared between the mercury  
185 conditions using the Kruskal-Wallis test. To assess the timing of chromosomal acquisition of the  
186 mercury transposon Tn5042 in *P. putida* differed between the plasmid host treatments, for each  
187 population we recorded the transfer number when we first observed plasmid-free transposon-containing

188 genotypes of *P. putida*. We compared these values between the plasmid host treatments using the  
189 Kruskal-Wallis test. The species diversity of plasmid-carriers was calculated as the 1 - D Simpson's  
190 Index,  $1 - [\sum (\frac{n}{N})^2]$  where, n = the end-point population density of each plasmid-bearer species in  
191 community, and, N = the end-point population density of all plasmid-bearer species. We compared  
192 diversities between the plasmid host treatments and mercury conditions by using the Kruskal-Wallis  
193 test.

194

## 195 RESULTS

### 196 Original plasmid host species identity affects community-level plasmid abundance

197 The bacterial host species vary in their ability to stably maintain pQBR103 hierarchically as follows:  
198 *P. fluorescens* > *P. stutzeri* > *P. putida* (Kottara *et al.* 2018). We hypothesised therefore that the identity  
199 of the original plasmid host in a community is likely to affect the dynamics of the plasmid-encoded  
200 mercury resistance at the community-level. To test this, we quantified the total plasmid abundance in  
201 each community (Figure 1). Mercury selection increased total plasmid abundance (effect of mercury;  
202  $\chi^2(1, N=24)=17.28, p=3.226e-05$ ) and total plasmid abundance varied with original plasmid host  
203 identity, such that both with (effect of plasmid treatment;  $\chi^2(2, N=18)=11.556, p=0.003$ ) and without  
204 (effect of plasmid treatment;  $\chi^2(2, N=18)=11.474, p=0.003$ ) mercury selection, the total plasmid  
205 abundance was higher when the original plasmid host was *P. fluorescens*. Together these data suggest  
206 that community-level plasmid dynamics are affected by both the positive selection for plasmid-encoded  
207 traits and the identity of the original plasmid host species, being enhanced when plasmids are beneficial  
208 and carried by a proficient plasmid host.

209

### 210 Species-level plasmid dynamics within communities

211 To understand how the variation in community-level plasmid abundance was driven by original plasmid  
212 host identity, we next examined the species-level plasmid dynamics in each community. As predicted,  
213 when a proficient plasmid-host – *P. fluorescens* – was the original plasmid host it maintained the  
214 plasmid at high frequency within its population both with and without mercury (Figure 2). We detected



215 plasmid dissemination from *P. fluorescens* to the other species at higher frequencies under mercury  
216 selection (effect of mercury;  $\chi^2(1, N=24)=4.653$ ,  $p=0.030$ ). This occurred to *P. putida* in all replicates  
217 and to *P. stutzeri* in 2/6 replicates with mercury selection and also to *P. stutzeri* at low levels in some  
218 of the communities without mercury selection. When *P. stutzeri* was the original plasmid host, it also  
219 maintained the plasmid within its own population both with and without mercury, and disseminated  
220 plasmids to the other species at a higher rate with mercury (effect of mercury;  $\chi^2(1, N=24)=11.644$ ,  
221  $p=0.0006$ ) (Figure 3). Variation in total plasmid abundance between replicate communities in this  
222 treatment appear to have been caused by whether or not *P. fluorescens* acquired the plasmid before it  
223 was driven extinct by toxic mercury: where transmission to *P. fluorescens* occurred, total plasmid  
224 abundances were higher (Figure 3). Where *P. putida* was the original plasmid host, it did not maintain  
225 the plasmid within its own population: without mercury, the plasmid was simply lost, whereas, with  
226 mercury, plasmid-bearers were replaced by mutants that had inserted the Tn5042 encoding the *mer*  
227 operon into their chromosome (Figure 4). Chromosomal insertions of the Tn5042 in *P. putida* were  
228 observed in the other plasmid host treatments, but arose much later in these communities where *P.*  
229 *putida* had to acquire the plasmid horizontally from either *P. fluorescens* or *P. stutzeri* (effect of  
230 treatment;  $\chi^2(2, N=18)=10.947$ ,  $p=0.004$ ). Although *P. putida* eventually lost the plasmid from its  
231 own population, prior to this loss it successfully disseminated the plasmid to *P. fluorescens* in 6/6  
232 replicates and to *P. stutzeri* in 3/6 replicates with mercury selection (Figure 4).

233

#### 234 **Diversity of plasmid-carriers in communities**

235 Finally, we tested how the original plasmid host identity affected the diversity of plasmid-carriers at the  
236 end of the experiment. The diversity of plasmid-carriers was affected by both the original plasmid host  
237 species identity (effect of plasmid treatment;  $\chi^2(2, N=36)=12.819$ ,  $p=0.001$ ) and mercury selection  
238 (effect of mercury;  $\chi^2(1, N=36)=6.082$ ,  $p=0.013$ ) (Figure 5). Without mercury selection the diversity  
239 of plasmid-carriers was highest when *P. stutzeri* was the original plasmid host. Whereas, with mercury  
240 selection, the diversity of plasmid-carriers was higher in communities where *P. fluorescens* or *P.*  
241 *stutzeri* were the original plasmid hosts compared to communities where *P. putida* was the original

242 plasmid host. Consistent with our data on community-level plasmid abundance, these data show that  
243 the diversity of plasmid-carriers is likely to be higher when plasmids are beneficial and are introduced  
244 to the community by proficient plasmid hosts.

245

## 246 **DISCUSSION**

247 In natural microbial communities, broad host range plasmids are frequently transmitted to diverse host  
248 species thus highlighting the importance of plasmids in HGT and their role in the spread of resistance  
249 genes in the environment (Klümper *et al.* 2015). In this study, we aimed to understand the extent to  
250 which plasmid dynamics in a bacterial community are affected by the original plasmid host species  
251 identity within that community. Our findings suggest that plasmid abundance at the community-level  
252 was driven by the identity of the original plasmid host species. We observed that pQBR103 reached  
253 higher community-level abundance when hosted by a proficient plasmid-host, *P. fluorescens*. Dionisio  
254 *et al.* (2002) have previously shown the importance of species identity in shaping the plasmid dynamics  
255 in a community. This was further described by Hall *et al.* (2016) where a proficient plasmid-host could  
256 act as a source of the plasmid for a non-proficient host species in a two-species soil community. These  
257 plasmid dynamics were explained in terms of conjugative plasmids persisting in the community as  
258 infectious agents via interspecies transfer (Bahl, Hansen and Sørensen 2007). Here, we extend these  
259 results to a more complex three-species community, a different plasmid, and a wider range of plasmid  
260 host species and proficiencies.

261         The community-level plasmid abundance also varied according to mercury selection. In  
262 common with previous studies (Cairns *et al.* 2018), plasmids were observed at higher frequencies in  
263 recipient species in the presence versus absence of positive selection. Detecting HGT events is more  
264 likely under positive selection, because, while individual conjugation events may be rare, positively  
265 selected horizontally acquired genes will rise to high frequency due to clonal expansion. This has led  
266 to a generally accepted, but probably incorrect view, that HGT is accelerated under positive selection  
267 (Aminov 2011; Fletcher 2015). By contrast, recent experimental data shows that horizontal  
268 transmission plays a more important role in plasmid stability in the absence of positive selection

269 (Stevenson *et al.* 2017), leading to higher rates of gene mobilisation and transfer in these environments  
270 (Hall *et al.* 2017b). Mercury selection also drove the invasion of *P. putida* mutants that had lost the  
271 plasmid but captured the Tn5042 carrying the mercury resistance operon to the chromosome, an  
272 outcome rarely observed in the other host species. This confirms our previous data that the rate and/or  
273 propensity for transposition of traits from the plasmid to the chromosome is variable among  
274 *Pseudomonas* species (Kottara *et al.* 2018). We show here that the dynamics of this process are affected  
275 by the community context, specifically whether or not *P. putida* was the original plasmid host.  
276 Chromosomal capture of mercury resistance transposon in *P. putida* occurred earlier when it began the  
277 experiment with the plasmid, reflecting that transposition is random mutational event and thus more  
278 likely to occur in larger – plasmid-bearing – populations. Interestingly, however, our data also show  
279 that even low proficiency plasmid hosts, which rapidly capture useful traits and jettison the plasmid,  
280 can act as a source of plasmids for other species in community by transferring the plasmid to more  
281 proficient host species before it is lost.

282 In contrast to the study of Hall *et al.* (2016), which used a highly conjugative plasmid, pQBR57,  
283 the plasmid used here, pQBR103, has >1000-fold lower conjugation rate ( $\gamma$ ) ( $\text{Log}_{10}(\gamma)$  pQBR103 = ~ -  
284 13.8,  $\text{Log}_{10}(\gamma)$  pQBR57 = ~ -10.8; Hall *et al.* 2015). While previous studies of pQBR103 have focused  
285 on the importance compensatory evolution in its longer-term stability (Harrison *et al.* 2015), here we  
286 show an effect of between species conjugation increasing the community-level abundance of the  
287 plasmid. The role for interspecific conjugation in pQBR103 stability was most notable in communities  
288 where it was initially carried by a non-proficient original plasmid host, *P. putida*. Here, while the  
289 plasmid started in ~33% of the population and went extinct in the *P. putida* population, it survived in  
290 the community by horizontal transmission, most commonly into *P. fluorescens*. Through interspecific  
291 conjugation, pQBR103 increased the diversity of plasmid-carriers in communities, especially under  
292 mercury selection. However, this effect depended upon the original plasmid host species identity.  
293 Conjugation also depends on the population density, and in this case the higher population density of  
294 *P. fluorescens* could have enabled the plasmid transfer from *P. fluorescens*. Surprisingly, although with  
295 mercury selection more proficient plasmid host species (*i.e.* *P. fluorescens* and *P. stutzeri*) allowed  
296 higher diversities of plasmid-carriers, without mercury it was in communities where the moderately

297 proficient plasmid host, *P. stutzeri*, was original plasmid host where the highest plasmid-carrier  
298 diversity was observed. This effect is likely to have been caused by the more equitable distribution of  
299 plasmid carriage in these communities, and specifically by higher rates of plasmid carriage in *P. stutzeri*  
300 itself compared to communities where this species had to obtain the plasmid via conjugation.

301         Soil microbial communities are highly diverse, which is thought to play a key role in their  
302 function (Torsvik and Øvreås 2002) and species diversity has been suggested to play a role in the  
303 dissemination of conjugative plasmids (Dionisio *et al.* 2002). Soil habitats are often characterised as  
304 hot spots for HGT (van Elsas and Bailey 2002; Sørensen *et al.* 2005) due to the spatially structured  
305 nature of such environments (Bahl, Hansen and Sørensen 2007; Fox *et al.* 2008; Røder *et al.* 2013).  
306 Here, we show that the identity of original plasmid host species determines the community-level  
307 abundance of conjugative plasmids in soil bacterial communities. Proficient plasmid hosts better  
308 maintain plasmids within their own population and transmit these plasmids to other species in the  
309 community. This implies that proficient plasmid host species could promote the robustness of  
310 communities by spreading potentially adaptive genes to more diverse species, allowing their survival  
311 upon environmental deterioration in the future.

312

### 313 **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

314 The authors thank T. Daniell and D. Rozen for their comments on a previous version of this work.

315

### 316 **FUNDING**

317 This work was supported by funding from the European Research Council under the European Union's  
318 Seventh Framework Programme awarded to MB [grant number FP7/2007-2013/ERC grant StG-2012-  
319 311490-COEVOCON] and a grant to MB from the Natural Environment Research Council  
320 NE/R008825/1.

321

### 322 **AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS**

323 AK, JH and MB designed the study; AK performed the experiments and analysed the data; AK and MB  
324 drafted the manuscript.

325

326 **Conflict of interest.** The authors declare that there are no conflicts of interest.

327

## 328 REFERENCES

329 Aminov RI. Horizontal gene exchange in environmental microbiota. *Front Microbiol* 2011;**2**:158.

330 Bagdasarian M, Lurz R, Rückert B *et al.* Specific-purpose plasmid cloning vectors II. Broad host range,  
331 high copy number, RSF 1010-derived vectors, and a host-vector system for gene cloning in  
332 *Pseudomonas*. *Gene* 1981;**16**:237-247.

333 Bahl MI, Hansen LH, Sørensen SJ. Impact of conjugal transfer on the stability of IncP-1 plasmid pKJK5  
334 in bacterial populations. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* 2007;**266**:250-256.

335 Baltrus DA. Exploring the costs of horizontal gene transfer. *Trends Ecol Evol* 2013;**28**:489-495.

336 Bergstrom CT, Lipsitch M, Levin BR. Natural selection, infectious transfer and the existence conditions  
337 for bacterial plasmids. *Genetics* 2000;**155**:1505-1519.

338 Brockhurst MA, Harrison E, Hall JP *et al.* The ecology and evolution of pangenomes. *Curr*  
339 *Biol* 2019;**29**:R1094-R1103. DOI: 10.1016/j.cub.2019.08.012

340 Busquets A, Peña A, Gomila M *et al.* Genome sequence of *Pseudomonas stutzeri* strain JM300 (DSM  
341 10701), a soil isolate and model organism for natural transformation. *J Bacteriol* 2012;**194**:5477-  
342 5478.

343 Cairns J, Ruokolainen L, Hultman J *et al.* Ecology determines how low antibiotic concentration impacts  
344 community composition and horizontal transfer of resistance genes. *Commun Biol* 2018;**1**:1-8.

345 De Gelder L, Ponciano JM, Joyce P *et al.* Stability of a promiscuous plasmid in different hosts: no  
346 guarantee for a long-term relationship. *Microbiology* 2007;**153**:452-463.

347 Dionisio F, Matic I, Radman M *et al.* Plasmids spread very fast in heterogeneous bacterial communities.  
348 *Genetics* 2002;**162**:1525-1532.

- 349 Fletcher S. Understanding the contribution of environmental factors in the spread of antimicrobial  
350 resistance. *Environ Health Prev Med* 2015;**20**:243.
- 351 Fox RE, Zhong X, Krone SM *et al.* Spatial structure and nutrients promote invasion of IncP-1 plasmids  
352 in bacterial populations. *ISME J.* 2008;**2**:1024-1039.
- 353 Frost LS, Leplae R, Summers AO *et al.* Mobile genetic elements: the agents of open source evolution.  
354 *Nature Rev Microbiol.* 2005;**3**:722-732.
- 355 Gómez P, Buckling A. Bacteria-phage antagonistic coevolution in soil. *Science* 2011;**332**:106-109.
- 356 Hall JP, Harrison E, Lilley AK *et al.* Environmentally co-occurring mercury resistance plasmids are  
357 genetically and phenotypically diverse and confer variable context-dependent fitness effects.  
358 *Environ Microbiol* 2015;**17**:5008-5022.
- 359 Hall JP, Wood AJ, Harrison E *et al.* Source–sink plasmid transfer dynamics maintain gene mobility in  
360 soil bacterial communities. *P Natl Acad Sci USA* 2016;**113**:8260-8265.
- 361 Hall JP, Brockhurst MA, Harrison E. Sampling the mobile gene pool: innovation via horizontal gene  
362 transfer in bacteria. *Philos Trans R Soc B* 2017a;**372**:20160424. DOI: 10.1098/rstb.2016.0424
- 363 Hall JP, Williams D, Paterson S *et al.* Positive selection inhibits gene mobilization and transfer in soil  
364 bacterial communities. *Nat Ecol Evol* 2017b;**1**:1348-1353.
- 365 Harrison E, Brockhurst MA. Plasmid-mediated horizontal gene transfer is a coevolutionary process.  
366 *Trends Microbiol* 2012;**20**:262-267.
- 367 Harrison E, Guymer D, Spiers AJ *et al.* Parallel compensatory evolution stabilizes plasmids across the  
368 parasitism-mutualism continuum. *Curr Biol* 2015;**25**:2034-2039.
- 369 Heuer H, Smalla K. Plasmids foster diversification and adaptation of bacterial populations in soil.  
370 *FEMS Microbiol Rev* 2012;**36**:1083-1104.
- 371 Jurasinski G, Koebsch F, Hagemann U. Flux rate calculation from dynamic closed chamber  
372 measurements. *R package* 2012;version 0.2-1.

- 373 Klümper U, Riber L, Dechesne A *et al.* Broad host range plasmids can invade an unexpectedly diverse  
374 fraction of a soil bacterial community. *ISME J* 2015;**9**:934-945.
- 375 Kottara A, Hall JP, Harrison E *et al.* Variable plasmid fitness effects and mobile genetic element  
376 dynamics across *Pseudomonas* species. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* 2018;**94**:fix172. DOI:  
377 10.1093/femsec/fix172
- 378 Lambertsen L, Sternberg C, Molin S. Mini-Tn7 transposons for site-specific tagging of bacteria with  
379 fluorescent proteins. *Environ Microbiol* 2004;**6**:726-732.
- 380 Levin BR, Stewart FM, Rice VA. The kinetics of conjugative plasmid transmission: fit of a simple mass  
381 action model. *Plasmid* 1979;**2**:247-260.
- 382 Lilley AK, Bailey MJ, Day MJ *et al.* Diversity of mercury resistance plasmids obtained by exogenous  
383 isolation from the bacteria of sugar beet in three successive years. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol*  
384 1996;**20**:211-227.
- 385 Lopatkin AJ, Meredith HR, Srimani JK *et al.* Persistence and reversal of plasmid-mediated antibiotic  
386 resistance. *Nat Commun* 2017;**8**:1-10.
- 387 Norman A, Hansen LH, Sørensen SJ. Conjugative plasmids: vessels of the communal gene pool. *Phil*  
388 *Trans R Soc B* 2009;**364**:2275-2289.
- 389 R Core Team. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical  
390 Computing, Vienna, Austria. 2013;Online: <http://www.R-project.org>.
- 391 Rainey PB, Bailey MJ, Thompson IP. Phenotypic and genotypic diversity of fluorescent pseudomonads  
392 isolated from field-grown sugar beet. *Microbiology* 1994;**140**:2315-2331.
- 393 Røder HL, Hansen LH, Sørensen SJ *et al.* The impact of the conjugative IncP-1 plasmid pKJK5 on  
394 multispecies biofilm formation is dependent on the plasmid host. *FEMS Microbiol Lett*  
395 2013;**344**:186-192.
- 396 Sakuda A, Suzuki-Minakuchi C, Okada K *et al.* Conjugative selectivity of plasmids is affected by  
397 coexisting recipient candidates. *mSphere* 2018;**3**:e00490-18. DOI: 10.1128/mSphere.00490-18

- 398 San Millan A, Peña-Miller R, Toll-Riera M *et al.* Positive selection and compensatory adaptation  
399 interact to stabilize non-transmissible plasmids. *Nat Commun* 2014;**5**:1-11.
- 400 San Millan A, MacLean RC. Fitness costs of plasmids: a limit to plasmid transmission. *Microbiol Spectr*  
401 2017;**5**. DOI: 10.1128/microbiolspec.MTBP-0016-2017
- 402 Simonsen L, Gordon DM, Stewart FM *et al.* Estimating the rate of plasmid transfer: an end-point  
403 method. *Microbiology* 1990;**136**:2319-2325.
- 404 Sørensen SJ, Bailey M, Hansen LH *et al.* Studying plasmid horizontal transfer in situ: a critical review.  
405 *Nat Rev Microbiol* 2005;**3**:700-710.
- 406 Stevenson C, Hall JP, Harrison E *et al.* Gene mobility promotes the spread of resistance in bacterial  
407 populations. *ISME J* 2017;**11**:1930-1932.
- 408 Stewart FM, Levin BR. The population biology of bacterial plasmids: a priori conditions for the  
409 existence of conjugationally transmitted factors. *Genetics*. 1977;**87**:209-228.
- 410 Tett A, Spiers AJ, Crossman LC *et al.* Sequence-based analysis of pQBR103; a representative of a  
411 unique, transfer-proficient mega plasmid resident in the microbial community of sugar beet. *ISME*  
412 *J.* 2007;**1**:331-340.
- 413 Torsvik V, Øvreås L. Microbial diversity and function in soil: from genes to ecosystems. *Curr Opin*  
414 *Microbiol* 2002;**5**:240-245.
- 415 van Elsas JD, Bailey MJ. The ecology of transfer of mobile genetic elements. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol*  
416 2002;**42**:187-197.



## 1 **Figure Legends**

2 **Figure 1.** Total plasmid density in the community throughout the selection experiment. Panels data for  
3 communities that varied in mercury selection (without mercury, left-hand set; with mercury, right-hand  
4 set) their initial original plasmid host (from left to right in each set: *P. fluorescens*, *P. stutzeri* or *P.*  
5 *putida*). Brown shaded area shows the mean plasmid abundance in the community  $\pm$  standard error  
6 (dotted line) from six replicates. Solid lines show the mean total community bacterial density from six  
7 replicates.

8

9 **Figure 2.** Population density and mobile genetic element dynamics in communities where *P.*  
10 *fluorescens* was the original plasmid host. A-F clonal populations evolving with or without mercury.  
11 Lines show the population densities of *P. fluorescens* (blue); *P. stutzeri* (red); *P. putida* (green). Brown  
12 areas show the density of plasmid carriers; Grey areas show the density of cells that have retained the  
13 Tn5042 but lost the plasmid.

14

15 **Figure 3.** Population density and mobile genetic element dynamics in communities where *P. stutzeri*  
16 was the original plasmid host. A-F clonal populations evolving with or without mercury. Lines show  
17 the population densities of *P. fluorescens* (blue); *P. stutzeri* (red); *P. putida* (green). Brown areas show  
18 the density of plasmid carriers; Grey areas show the density of cells that have retained the Tn5042 but  
19 lost the plasmid.

20

21 **Figure 4.** Population density and mobile genetic element dynamics in communities where *P. putida*  
22 was the original plasmid host. A-F clonal populations evolving with or without mercury. Lines show  
23 the population densities of *P. fluorescens* (blue); *P. stutzeri* (red); *P. putida* (green). Brown areas show  
24 the density of plasmid carriers; Grey areas show the density of cells that have retained the Tn5042 but  
25 lost the plasmid.

26

27 **Figure 5.** Diversity of plasmid-carriers at the end of the experiment. Species diversity was calculated  
28 as the 1-D Simpson's Index by using the end-point population densities of the plasmid-carriers in each  
29 species in each original plasmid host community.









