1 Bats are key hosts in the radiation of mammal-associated Bartonella

bacteria

3

2

- 4 Clifton D. McKee^{a,b,c,1}, Ying Bai^d, Colleen T. Webb^{a,b}, Michael Y. Kosoy^e
- 5
- 6 ^aGraduate Degree Program in Ecology, Colorado State University, 1021 Campus Delivery, Fort Collins,
- 7 CO 80523, USA
- 8 ^bDepartment of Biology, Colorado State University, 1878 Campus Delivery, Fort Collins, CO 80523,

9 USA

- 10 °Department of Epidemiology, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, 615 North Wolfe
- 11 Street, Baltimore, MD 21205, USA
- 12 dBacterial Diseases Branch, Division of Vector-Borne Diseases, Centers for Disease Control and
- 13 Prevention, 3156 Rampart Road, Fort Collins, CO 80521, USA
- 14 °KB One Health, LLC, 3244 Reedgrass Court, Fort Collins, CO 80521, USA
- 15
- 16 ¹To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: clifton.mckee@gmail.com.
- 17
- 18 Keywords: Chiroptera, Bartonella, host associations, parasite dispersal, vector-borne infection,
- 19 molecular phylogeny, molecular clock

21 Abstract

22 Bats are notorious reservoirs of several zoonotic diseases and may be uniquely tolerant of 23 infection among mammals. Broad sampling has revealed the importance of bats in the diversification and spread of viruses and eukaryotes to other animal hosts. Vector-borne bacteria of the genus 24 Bartonella are prevalent and diverse in mammals globally and recent surveys have revealed numerous 25 26 Bartonella lineages in bats. We assembled a sequence database of Bartonella strains, consisting of nine 27 genetic loci from 209 previously characterized lineages and 121 new cultured strains from bats, and used these data to perform the most comprehensive phylogenetic analysis of Bartonella to date. This 28 29 analysis included estimation of divergence dates using a molecular clock and ancestral reconstruction of host associations and geography. We estimate that Bartonella began infecting mammals 62 million 30 years ago near the Cretaceous-Paleogene boundary. Additionally, the radiation of particular Bartonella 31 clades correlate strongly to the timing of diversification and biogeography of mammalian hosts. Bats 32 were inferred to be the ancestral hosts of all mammal-associated Bartonella and appear to be 33 responsible for the early geographic expansion of the genus. We conclude that bats have had a deep 34 influence on the evolutionary radiation of *Bartonella* bacteria and their spread to other mammalian 35 orders. These results support a 'bat seeding' hypothesis that could explain similar evolutionary patterns 36 in other mammalian parasite taxa. Application of such phylogenetic tools as we have used to other taxa 37 38 may reveal the general importance of bats in the ancient diversification of mammalian parasites.

39 Significance statement

40 Discovering the evolutionary history of infectious agents in animals is important for 41 understanding the process of host adaptation and the origins of human diseases. To clarify the evolution 42 of the *Bartonella* genus, which contains important human pathogens, we performed phylogenetic 43 analysis on a broad diversity of *Bartonella* strains, including novel strains from bats. Our results 44 indicate that Bartonella clades diversified along with their mammal hosts over millions of years. Bats appear to be especially important in the early radiation and geographic dispersal of *Bartonella* lineages. 45 These patterns are consistent with research indicating a chiropteran origin of important human viruses 46 and eukaryotic parasites, suggesting that bats may play a unique role as historical sources of infections 47 to other hosts. 48

49

50 Introduction

A central part of the work done by disease ecologists is to understand the host range of infectious agents. However, host ranges must be understood in a coevolutionary context, specifically how agents have adapted to and diversified in hosts over time. Only by considering both ecological and evolutionary context can we understand how agents come to infect and adapt to new hosts. While cophylogeny is a common tool for studying the codiversification of hosts and parasites, few studies have examined the relative timing of the diversification of parasite lineages in parallel with that of hosts (1, 2).

The genus *Bartonella* is an excellent study system for disease ecology and evolution because it is common and diverse in many mammalian hosts (3). These alphaproteobacteria are facultative intracellular pathogens that can cause persistent, hemotropic infections in their hosts. Transmission between hosts occurs through a variety of hematophagous arthropod vectors, wherein bartonellae colonize the midgut and are then shed in arthropod feces (4). Clades of *Bartonella* species tend to be

host-specific (5), so it could be hypothesized that the genus diversified along with its mammalian hosts
millions of years ago. However, there have been few comprehensive phylogenies of this genus and
limited research on the influence of particular host groups on *Bartonella* evolution.

66 Bats are a group of special interest because they have traits that are amenable to parasite 67 transmission, including their global distribution, ability to fly, seasonal migration, dense aggregations 68 and high sociality in some species, long life spans, and the use of torpor and hibernation (6). There is also evidence that chiropteran immune systems are highly tolerant of infections, especially of viruses 69 70 (7). Thus, their role as reservoirs for *Bartonella* bacteria may be uniquely influential among mammals. 71 Bats are also an ancient clade of mammals (8), providing ample time for diversification of bacterial parasites and transitions from bats to other mammals. Research has concluded that bats are potentially 72 ancestral hosts that influenced the diversification and spread of coronaviruses (9), lyssaviruses (10), 73 74 paramyxoviruses (11), trypanosomes (12), and haemosporidia (13) among other mammalian orders. Drawing from Hamilton et al. (14), who developed the 'bat-seeding' hypothesis to explain the 75 geographic and host distribution of Trypanosoma lineages related to the agent of Chagas disease, T. 76 cruzi, we hypothesize that bats may have also been influential in the ancient diversification and spread 77 78 of Bartonella.

Successful amplification of *Bartonella* DNA from recent fossils points to a prolonged history of *Bartonella* infection in some hosts, such as humans and domestic cats (15). However, it is unlikely that DNA could be successfully amplified from more ancient fossils to test hypotheses about the origin of bartonellae in mammals. Instead, a molecular clock approach can be used to estimate the rate at which substitutions accumulate in *Bartonella* DNA and then extrapolate divergence dates of clades. Considering new research has shown that mammal-associated bartonellae evolved from arthropod symbionts (16), we rely on a molecular clock for the 16S ribosomal RNA (rRNA) gene based on sequence divergence data from bacterial symbionts of arthropod hosts separated for millions of years

(17). We perform a multi-locus analysis using the most comprehensive database of *Bartonella* strains to
date, including a greater number of loci than a recent time tree analysis (18) and broader taxon
sampling than previous genomic analyses (19). Many new *Bartonella* strains have recently been
discovered in bats (20), so we have included 121 novel strains of bats in this study to amend current
delineation of *Bartonella* clades (19) and to determine the influence of bats on the diversification and
spread of *Bartonella* bacteria to other mammalian orders.

93 Using this molecular clock approach, we extrapolate when the genus *Bartonella* diversified and 94 compare the timing of *Bartonella* clade diversification along with their hosts. We hypothesize that 95 mammal-infecting bartonellae evolved with their hosts starting in the late Cretaceous or early Paleogene when many eutherian and metatherian taxa diversified (21). We expect to see clustering of 96 lineages associated by host orders and correlation between diversification dates of hosts and Bartonella 97 clades. Using ancestral state reconstruction and network analysis, we discern which orders of mammals 98 were highly influential in the diversification and spread of Bartonella to other host orders and 99 geographic regions. We predict that the speciose orders of bats (Chiroptera) and rodents (Rodentia) are 100 101 important in the historical expansion of the Bartonella genus, however bats may have a more profound 102 influence in this process because of their ability to fly and quickly disperse over wide areas. This study 103 provides a more complete understanding of Bartonella evolution and biogeography and the role of bats 104 as important hosts of pathogens through a suite of phylogenetic methods that can be adapted to 105 understand these processes in other host-specific parasites and symbionts. Such investigations could 106 lead to a deeper evolutionary understanding of symbiosis and parasitism and the identification of key 107 host groups in the diversification and spread of these organisms.

108

109 Materials and methods

110 Molecular data collection

111 To balance the need for increased taxon sampling and adequate sequence data to produce a 112 well-supported phylogeny, we assembled a database of *Bartonella* sequences from published genomes 113 on GenBank, previous studies using multi-locus sequence analysis (MLSA), and archived cultures from 114 bats. We targeted nine genetic markers (SI Appendix, Table S1) commonly used for *Bartonella* 115 detection and phylogenetic analysis (22). Data from MLSA studies and genomes published as of 2018 116 were collected from GenBank via accession numbers or strain numbers from 74 studies (SI Dataset 1), 117 including recent publications that have isolated bartonellae or related bacterial symbionts in arthropods 118 and past studies characterizing bat-associated *Bartonella* strains from Asia, Africa, and North America. 119 We excluded any strains that were noted in the studies as showing evidence of homologous 120 recombination between *Bartonella* species to prevent issues with incomplete lineage sorting in phylogenetic analysis. Additional molecular data collection of Bartonella strains from bats included a 121 122 subset of cultures archived in our laboratory from previous studies in Africa, North and South America, 123 Europe, and Asia that have been partially characterized at some of the targeted loci, as well as new cultures from bats sampled from Nigeria in 2010 and Guatemala in 2010, 2014, and 2015. The data 124 combined from bat-associated Bartonella strains cover 50 species from 10/20 extant chiropteran 125 126 families (8). Details on sequencing of bat-associated Bartonella strains, alignment, data cleaning, and 127 validation can be found in SI Appendix. The final database contained sequence data from 332 taxa: 209 128 Bartonella reference strains from genomes and MLSA studies, 121 bat-associated strains from our laboratory archive, the ant symbiont Candidatus Tokpelaia hoelldoblerii, and the outgroup Brucella 129 130 *abortus* (SI Datasets 1 and 2).

131

132 Phylogenetic analysis

Bayesian phylogenetic analysis was performed using BEAST v1.8.4 (23) via the

134 CyberInfrastructure for Phylogenetic RESearch (CIPRES) Science Gateway portal v3.3 (24). The nine 135 loci were analyzed separately using GTR+I+G sequence evolution models, estimated base frequencies, 136 four gamma rate categories, an uncorrelated relaxed clock with an exponential distribution of clock 137 rates along branches for each locus, and a birth-death speciation model with incomplete sampling (25). 138 Brucella abortus was set as the outgroup in all analyses. To determine a clock prior for the 16S rRNA 139 locus, we analyzed published 16S rRNA sequence divergence and host divergence times for bacterial 140 symbionts of arthropods (17). A linear regression model was fit to the data in R (26) and a lognormal 141 prior was estimated by moment matching to the normal distribution for the fitted mean and standard 142 error of the slope (SI Appendix, Fig. S5). The prior distribution for the exponential clock rate for 16S 143 rRNA was set to this lognormal distribution while prior distributions for the exponential clocks of the 144 remaining eight loci were set to an approximate reference prior for continuous-time Markov chain 145 (CTMC) rates (27). Thus, the 16S rRNA clock acts a strong prior and the rates for the other eight loci 146 are estimated relative to the 16S rRNA rate. This approach allows for external validation of *Bartonella* diversification events based on host diversification dates without explicitly using host diversification 147 dates as calibration points for the parasite tree. Extensive testing using alternative substitution (with or 148 149 without codon partitioning), clock, and tree models and subsets of genetic data determined that model choice or the exclusion of the ITS locus had little influence on tree topology and estimated divergence 150 dates (SI Appendix, Table S5). Additional details regarding model priors and run settings can be found 151 152 in SI Appendix.

154 Ancestral state reconstruction

In addition to divergence time estimation, we performed ancestral state reconstruction in BEAST. We assigned discrete traits to each tip based on the taxonomic order of the host and the ecozone (28) that includes the majority of the host's geographic range. The association of some *Bartonella* lineages with arthropods and not mammals are justified in SI Appendix. Ancestral state reconstruction was performed using a symmetrical rate model to reduce the number of state transitions that needed to be inferred.

161

162 Tip-association tests

We performed tip-association tests using the Bayesian Tip-association Significance testing (BaTS) program v1 to assess the clustering of traits along tips of the phylogenetic tree (29). We performed four sets of simulations using the same assignments of host orders and geographic ecozones used in the ancestral state reconstruction above. The two sets of traits were simulated on 1000 posterior sampled trees from the final BEAST run and on the single maximum likelihood (ML) tree. Clustering of traits was measured by the association index (AI) and parsimony score (PS), producing a distribution for the 1000 Bayesian trees and a single value for the ML tree. Null distributions for these measures were generated using 100 randomizations of traits onto tips of the trees. The significance of clustering was evaluated based on the overlap between observed values or distributions of AI and PS and their null distributions. For both measures, small values indicate a stronger phylogeny-trait association (29).

174 Host clade definitions and divergence dates

We defined host-associated *Bartonella* clades *a posteriori* based on high posterior support (>0.9) and clustering by host orders from the ancestral state reconstruction (Fig. 1A). Previous analyses of *Bartonella* host associations have shown that host-switching is common (30), so a calibration

178 approach that assumes strict cospeciation across the tree would not accurately reflect the evolutionary 179 history of these bacteria. However, *Bartonella* lineages are broadly host-specific within orders (18) and 180 host-switching is more frequent between closely related hosts (31). We defined 15 host-associated 181 Bartonella clades (Tables S5-S6) at relevant taxonomic scales below the order level to test the 182 hypothesis that *Bartonella* lineages diversified with their hosts while accounting for frequent host-183 switching that could occur within a host clade. We collated divergence dates for the most recent 184 common ancestor uniting the host taxa of interest within each clade from available studies in the 185 TimeTree database (http://timetree.org/), summarized by the estimated mean, 95% confidence 186 intervals, and range of dates across studies (32). We then correlated these mean host divergence dates 187 with our estimated median divergence date of the associated *Bartonella* clade (Table S7). A significant 188 linear fit between these dates would support the hypothesis that *Bartonella* diversified within their 189 hosts after colonization. To validate measurement of the divergence time for mammal-associated 190 Bartonella clades with the ultrametric tree produced in BEAST, we also generated a calibrated timed 191 phylogeny with the ML tree. Using the RelTime relative rate framework (33) within MEGA v10.0.5 192 (34) we generated a timed phylogeny using host clade divergence dates from TimeTree (Table S7). We 193 used confidence intervals (or ranges in the case of clade J) for the 15 host clade divergence dates as 194 minimum and maximum divergence dates in RelTime. The program then calculated divergence dates 195 on the tree using a maximum likelihood approach (33), producing mean estimates and 95% confidence 196 intervals for clade dates that we could compare with the eubartonellae date estimated in BEAST. This 197 analysis can confirm that the date estimation is robust to different approaches by comparing a 198 calibration-based method on an existing tree to a method that relies on relaxed clock priors during tree 199 estimation.

201 Stochastic character mapping and network analysis

202 To determine the inferred ancestral host order and ecozone of mammal-infecting eubartonellae, 203 we initially inspected the results of the ancestral state reconstruction on the maximum clade credibility (MCC) tree. Specifically, we inspected the posterior support for the node and the posterior probability 204 205 of the host order and ecozone at the node across all posterior trees. However, due to the large number 206 of *Bartonella* lineages associated with Chiroptera in the database (n = 160) relative to those in other 207 diverse orders (Rodentia, 87; Artiodactyla, 32; Carnivora, 21), we tested the influence of this sampling 208 bias on uncertainty about ancestral states using stochastic character mapping of host orders and 209 ecozones onto trees (35). We wrote a custom R function to resample tips from the phylogenetic tree and 210 perform stochastic character mapping on the pruned tree using the packages ape and phytools (36, 211 37) assuming an equal-rates model. The function ran 100 mapping simulations on each pruned tree and 212 calculated the probability that Chiroptera and Palearctic were the inferred host order and ecozone at the 213 node uniting eubartonellae. These states were chosen based on initial reconstructions from BEAST indicating them as ancestral traits. We performed this simulation using three resampling schemes: 214 equalizing the number of tips associated with bats and rodents (n = 87), equalizing tips associated with 215 216 bats, rodents, and artiodactyls (n = 32), and equalizing tips associated with bats, rodents, artiodactyls, 217 and carnivores (n = 21). Resampling schemes were run with 100 resampling iterations on the MCC tree 218 and 10 resampling steps on 10 randomly sampled posterior trees. We summarized the resulting 219 probability distributions by the mean and interquartile range (SI Appendix, Table S11). We further 220 assessed the nature of transitions between hosts and ecozones by performing additional stochastic 221 character mapping simulations on posterior trees followed by network analysis of state transitions. Host 222 orders and ecozones were simulated with phytools over 1000 posterior sampled trees with an equal-223 rates model. The number of state transitions were then summarized over all 1000 simulations by the 224 median and 95% credible intervals, ignoring state transitions with a median of zero (SI Appendix, Table

S12). Separate host order and ecozone networks were then built from these median transitions, and
node-level properties including degree, out-degree, and betweenness centrality were calculated using
the R package igraph (38).

228

229 Results

230 Phylogeny and age estimation of Bartonella genus

231 Using molecular data from nine genetic loci sequenced from 331 Bartonella strains (SI 232 Appendix, Table S1), we produced a well-supported Bayesian phylogeny (Fig. 1; SI Appendix, Fig. S8) 233 that confirmed monophyletic clades of *Bartonella* species identified in past studies (19). These 234 included a clade containing rodent-associated B. elizabethae, B. grahamii, B. tribocorum, and B. 235 rattimassiliensis (clade H); a clade containing cat-associated B. henselae and B. koehlerae (clade F), B. quintana, and B. washoensis (clade E); and all three B. vinsonii subspecies (clade K). However, our 236 237 approach has substantially altered the order of the deep branches within the phylogeny, including the 238 delineation of five distinct Bartonella clades restricted to bats. Additional details regarding revisions to 239 the *Bartonella* tree topology and clock rate estimates for sequenced loci can be found in SI Appendix. 240 Beyond a revised phylogeny, our approach demonstrated that bartonellae are ancient and supports the hypothesis that the genus diversified with mammals. We confirm that the genus first 241 242 evolved as a symbiont of arthropods, represented by the species *B. apis*, *B. tamiae* and the ant symbiont *Candidatus* Tokpelaia hoelldoblerii, before transitioning to a parasitic lifestyle in mammals. These 243 mammal-infecting eubartonellae (excluding *B. apis* and *B. tamiae*) began diversifying 62 million years 244 245 ago (mya; 95% HPD: 40-90), near the Cretaceous-Paleogene boundary 66 mya (Fig. 1; SI Appendix, 246 Fig. S6). Many crown metatherian and eutherian clades began diversifying around this time (21), including the diverse placental orders Chiroptera, Artiodactyla, Carnivora, Rodentia, and Primates, 247 248 suggesting that *Bartonella* diversification is tightly linked with the radiation of its mammalian hosts

during the Paleogene. Estimates of divergence dates using alternative substitution, tree, and clock
models placed the origin of mammal-infecting eubartonellae between 57-70 mya (SI Appendix, Table
S4).

252

253 Diversification of bartonellae with hosts

254 Following the hypothesis that the Bartonella genus radiated with their mammal hosts, we 255 performed tip-association tests to analyze the clustering of host taxonomic traits and geographic origin along the tips of the tree. Simulations using 1000 posterior sampled trees showed significant clustering 256 257 of host orders and geographic ecozones across the phylogeny according to association indices (AI) and 258 parsimony scores (PS). Observed distributions for both measures did not overlap their respective null 259 distributions based on random associations of traits to tips (SI Appendix, Table S10). Host orders had 260 smaller values for AI and PS than geographic origin, indicating a stronger phylogeny-trait association 261 with host taxonomy than geographic origin. This phylogeny-trait association with host taxonomy is 262 illustrated in Fig. 1A through strong support for monophyletic groups associated with host orders. 263 We clarified this association with host taxonomy by describing 15 Bartonella clades (SI Appendix, Tables S5 and S6) predominantly associated with marsupials (B), ruminants (C), carnivores 264 265 (F), rodents (E, H, I, J, K, M, O), and bats (Fig. 1A). We then compared divergence dates of each

Bartonella clade with divergence dates of the associated hosts within each clade (SI Appendix, Table S7) collated from TimeTree (32). We found a strong correlation between *Bartonella* and host clade divergence times ($R^2 = 0.72$, F = 36.4, P < 0.0001). However, most (13/15) *Bartonella* clades were younger than their associated host clades; on average, the age of *Bartonella* clades was 76% that of their associated host clades (Fig. 2).

The Bayesian tree used in these analyses was similar to a maximum likelihood (ML) tree produced from concatenated sequences of all nine loci, with only minor differences in topology for

some internal branches and external branches with low bootstrap support (SI Appendix, Fig. S7). Tipassociation tests using the ML tree showed similar results to the Bayesian tree (SI Appendix, Table
S10). Using confidence intervals for host clade divergence dates provided from TimeTree as calibration
dates on the ML tree within the RelTime relative rate framework (39), we estimated the origin of
mammal-infecting eubartonellae at 66.3 mya (95% CI: 63.5-69.1). This separate analysis validates the
Bayesian relaxed clock estimate (SI Appendix, Table S5) and further supports the inference that *Bartonella* began diversifying with mammals near the Cretaceous-Paleogene boundary.

280

281 Influence of host groups and geography on Bartonella evolution

282 Bats appear to be highly influential in the diversification and spread of *Bartonella* 283 geographically and to other host orders. Bat-associated clades (A, D, G, L, N) are broadly distributed 284 across the tree and form external branches to clades associated with other mammalian orders (Fig. 1A). 285 This contrasts with clades associated with marsupials, ruminants, carnivores, and rodents, which are less dispersed on the tree and stem from more internal branches. Based on ancestral state analysis using 286 287 host orders as states, bats were inferred to be the ancestral host of all mammal-infecting eubartonellae with a posterior probability of 0.99. Due to the large number of bat-associated strains in the database (n 288 289 = 160), this inference of the ancestral host may have been biased towards bats. Yet in all resampling 290 scenarios, the median posterior probability that bats are the ancestral hosts of mammal-infecting 291 eubartonellae exceeded 0.9 (SI Appendix, Table S11). In further support of this inference, the 292 diversification of mammal-infecting *Bartonella* started almost exactly when bats began their 293 evolutionary radiation around 62 mya (95% CI: 59-64, range: 51.9-74.9) according to compiled studies 294 from TimeTree (32).

In addition to ancestral host associations, we also inferred the ancestral biogeography of *Bartonella* clades and where host transitions may have occurred. We performed ancestral state

297 reconstruction of ecozones based on the current geographical distribution of the host of each
298 *Bartonella* strain. The geographical origin of eubartonellae was inferred to be in the Palearctic (Fig.
299 1B) with a posterior probability of 0.99. This fits with the classification of bats within the clade
300 Laurasiatheria and previous reconstructions of chiropteran biogeography which found that extant bats
301 may have originated in Eurasia (40). However, the inference of the geographic origin of eubartonellae
302 is less certain when host sampling bias was accounted for in the stochastic character mapping analysis.
303 The median posterior probability for a Palearctic origin of eubartonellae ranged from 0.63 to 0.77
304 across all resampling scenarios (SI Appendix, Table S11). Regardless of the exact geographical origin,
305 it is probable that bats have been influential in the ancient geographic spread of *Bartonella* infections
306 (Fig. 1).

We explored the influence of particular hosts on the spread of *Bartonella* among mammalian orders and across ecozones using stochastic character mapping and network analysis. After mapping the number of host and ecozone transitions across 1000 posterior sampled trees, we built a network consisting of host and ecozones as nodes and the median number of transitions between nodes as edges (Fig. 3; SI Appendix, Table S12). In general, the ecozone network was more highly connected than the host network (Fig. 3). The higher number of connections in the ecozone network corresponds with the results of the tip-association tests (SI Appendix, Table S10), which showed that clustering of traits was stronger for host taxonomy than geographic origin. That is, the high frequency of transitions between secozones leads to lower levels of geographical clustering on the tree.

Examining the network properties of the nodes, we find that certain host orders are influential in the spread of *Bartonella* among host orders (SI Appendix, Table S13). In particular, we considered degree (the number of edges connected to a node), out-degree (the number of edges originating from a node), and betweenness (the number of shortest paths that connect any two nodes in the network that pass through the node in question) because these measures describe how each node serves as a source

of *Bartonella* to other nodes. Bats and rodents were a source to other mammalian orders (Fig. 3A), with the highest degree and out-degree of all host orders and high betweenness (SI Appendix, Table S13).
Transitions between ecozones show that the historical movement of *Bartonella* by hosts led to the present global distribution of these bacteria (Fig. 1B) through bidirectional exchange (Fig. 3B).
Palearctic and Indo-Malayan ecozones showed the highest degree, out-degree, and betweenness. Thus, these two regions may have played an important role as geographic hubs for *Bartonella* diversification and movement of hosts to other ecozones (Fig. 1B; SI Appendix, Fig. S8B).

328

329 Discussion

330 Bartonella is a broadly distributed bacterial genus associated with mammals and arthropod 331 vectors globally. Patterns of host-specificity and phylogenetic diversity in this genus reflect general 332 trends in other zoonotic pathogens. Thus, *Bartonella* serves as a model system for understanding the evolution and ecology of zoonotic agents. Specifically, this system could inform theory about how 333 agents adapt to and diversify in hosts over time and the ecological conditions that lead to accidental 334 335 infections and host-switching. Using a multi-faceted analytical approach, this study answered several 336 key questions about the evolution of *Bartonella* bacteria. First, we found that the *Bartonella* genus began diversifying with mammals around the Cretaceous-Paleogene boundary. Our novel approach 337 338 used a strong relaxed clock prior on the 16S rRNA locus based on substitution rates observed in bacterial symbionts of arthropods (17) while accounting for rate variation at eight other genetic loci to 339 340 yield a highly supported phylogenetic tree with estimated divergence dates. Second, we showed that 341 Bartonella clades diversified along with their mammalian hosts. Ancestral state reconstruction on the 342 phylogenetic tree showed that *Bartonella* lineages tend to cluster by host taxonomic orders and this 343 clustering was found to be significantly higher than random expectations using tip-association tests. 344 Additionally, we found a significant correlation between the divergence times of 15 Bartonella clades

and their associated host clades. A separate time tree estimation approach calibrated using these host divergence dates confirmed the dating of eubartonellae diversification. The use of ancestral state reconstruction or stochastic character mapping of host traits paired with network analysis is a nascent approach in the study of infectious agents that can provide additional insights from phylogenies (41– 43). These analyses demonstrated that bats have been key to both the origin and spread of *Bartonella* among other mammals and geographic regions, while rodents were responsible for additional spread. This work elucidates key aspects of the ecology and evolution of *Bartonella*, yet there are several avenues of research to be explored in future studies.

354 One necessity is to thoroughly catalog *Bartonella* diversity. While description of *Bartonella* species was slow through the 20th century, the advent of genetic sequencing has brought about an 355 356 explosion of *Bartonella* diversity with over 40 named and likely many other unnamed species. Our 357 phylogenetic analysis used the most comprehensive sequence database to date, including broad taxon sampling of Bartonella strains characterized from 10 mammalian orders. These data, along with a 358 relaxed clock approach, have reshaped the Bartonella phylogeny, defining five new clades of bat-359 360 associated *Bartonella* strains and reorganizing the relationships of deeply branching clades. Attempts to culture and characterize novel Bartonella strains from undersampled mammalian orders or other 361 potential vertebrate hosts (e.g., birds (44)) are needed to further improve taxon sampling. This 362 363 continued work will undoubtedly reshape the Bartonella tree further and may lead to new hypotheses 364 about ancient associations with hosts.

Our results also provide context to the biological changes that are associated with the shift of *Bartonella* bacteria from an arthropod symbiont to a mammal parasite. Our phylogeny reaffirms work demonstrating this shift (16, 18) and provides an estimated time for when it occurred, suggesting that an existing bacterial population colonized a new niche in mammals shortly after their emergence as potential hosts. Some of the molecular machinery that could have facilitated this colonization was

370 already present in arthropod-associated *Bartonella* lineages and other Rhizobiales bacteria (16). The majority of virulence factors important for host interaction or establishment of intracellular infection 371 372 are shared across Bartonellaceae, suggesting some latent potential for infecting vertebrates even in arthropod-associated lineages. However, the evolutionary radiation of eubartonellae is associated with a 373 number of other important molecular innovations, including the loss of flagella and acquisition of trw 374 375 and virB type IV secretion systems (T4SS) (16, 19, 45, 46). Secretion systems have only been detected 376 and characterized in a few *Bartonella* species across the phylogeny, so our revision of *Bartonella* tree topology highlights a need for future work regarding the machinery (e.g., flagella, T4SS) shared 377 378 between bat-associated lineages and their relatives.

379 Given that current mammal-associated bartonellae are vectored by blood-feeding arthropods 380 and ancestral bartonellae were likely arthropod symbionts, it is probable that early adaptation to blood-381 feeding arthropods facilitated the colonization of the mammalian bloodstream. Hematophagous arthropods frequently harbor endosymbionts to cope with their nutritionally deficient diet (47), so 382 ancient (and possibly some extant) bartonellae may have had beneficial relationships with arthropod 383 384 hosts. The switch from symbiont to mammal parasite could then have occurred early in the evolution of mammals. There is evidence that ancestors of extant mammalian ectoparasites implicated as Bartonella 385 vectors (48–50) were already present by the end of the Cretaceous, including sand flies (51), fleas (1), 386 sucking lice (52), bed bugs (2), and hippoboscoid flies (53). Based on available evidence, the 387 colonization of mammals by Bartonella bacteria may have occurred via hematophagous vector, 388 389 possibly parasitizing early bats. An ancestral relationship with bats is supported by recent detection of 390 B. tamiae in bat flies and bat spleens (54, 55), suggesting that this species can opportunistically colonize bats from arthropods even today. The initial transmission may have occurred through 391 392 contamination of skin with arthropod feces containing bacteria, direct consumption of an infected 393 arthropod, or some other unknown route (4). Once inside the host, the existing ability of bartonellae to

invade host cells may have led to proliferation of bacteria in the blood. Additional studies that isolate *Bartonella* lineages in arthropods and confirm potential transmission routes between mammal hosts and
arthropod vectors will clarify the evolution of host-vector-*Bartonella* relationships.

397 As apparent in Figs. 1 and 3, the evolutionary history of *Bartonella* has involved several host-398 switching events. Thus, calibrating divergence dates by relying on codivergence between host taxa 399 would poorly reflect this history. Instead we initially avoided a calibration approach in favor of using a 400 relaxed clock prior, then validated estimated divergence dates based on 15 radiation events within particular bat, rodent, ruminant, and marsupial host taxa. The *Bartonella* divergence dates correlate 401 402 strongly with the host divergence dates, although with a widespread delay in the colonization of 403 Bartonella within a clade (Fig. 2). While it is possible that this delay in Bartonella colonization is 404 associated with the divergence date estimation approach and bacteria diverged immediately along with 405 their hosts, we suspect the delay reflects some biological reality. According to Manter's rules (56, 57), parasites evolve more slowly than their hosts due to the relatively uniform environments they 406 407 experience within a host. This slow evolution may help to explain rampant *Bartonella* host-switching 408 between related hosts in the tree, since from a parasite's perspective the intracellular environments of phylogenetically similar hosts are unlikely to have significantly changed. Despite these inherent delays, 409 the clustering of Bartonella strains with host orders and particular clades within those orders along with 410 the correlation of divergence times strongly suggest a shared evolutionary history between Bartonella 411 412 strains and their hosts, although a more complicated one than simple cospeciation.

Beyond patterns of codiversification, it is clear from this study that *Bartonella* evolution has been shaped by certain hosts, particularly rodents and bats. As the two most speciose groups of mammals, they could be expected to host diverse parasites according to Eichler's rule (58), which predicts positive covariance between host and parasite diversity. While more studies will need to be done to explicitly test patterns of host and *Bartonella* diversity while accounting for sampling biases, it

418 is clear from the network analysis that rodents and bats are important sources of bartonellae to other 419 hosts (Fig. 3). As abundant taxa within ecosystems, rodents and bats could act as targets for both 420 generalist and specialist ectoparasites. While endemic *Bartonella* infections are likely maintained by 421 transmission by specialist ectoparasite vectors, generalist vectors could target the most abundant 422 species in the community (e.g., rodents or bats) and occasionally infest alternative hosts, resulting in 423 opportunities for accidental *Bartonella* infections in phylogenetically distant hosts over evolutionary 424 time (31). Reconstructing some of these ancient host-switching dynamics would require knowledge of 425 ancestral ectoparasite associations and the interactions of hosts and their ectoparasites within 426 communities.

427 Finally, bats were identified as the most probable ancestral host of eubartonellae in mammals 428 even after accounting for sampling bias in the database. The fact that bats can fly would have 429 hypothetically increased their dispersal ability during their early diversification. This is exemplified by numerous long-distance colonization events: from mainland Africa to Madagascar by seven different 430 extant bat families, including the endemic Myzopodidae; from Australia to New Zealand by the family 431 432 Mystacinidae; and from mainland North America to Hawaii by Lasiurus cinereus (59). The dispersal of bats to distant landmasses during the early diversification of extant mammals could have played a role 433 in the importance of bats as sources of Bartonella infection to other hosts. We also note that bats appear 434 435 to be highly tolerant of infections, especially of intracellular bacteria and viruses (60), showing few signs of disease and unique immune responses compared to other mammals (7, 61–63). Such patterns 436 437 in extant bats may have ancient origins linked with their ability to fly (64) and thus bats may have been 438 ideal hosts for the early colonization of mammals by arthropod-borne bartonellae.

The importance of bats in the evolutionary diversification of mammal parasites has been
discussed by other authors working in distinct systems. One of these groups are the *Trypanosoma*parasites that include *T. cruzi*, the agent of Chagas disease. Observing the broad distribution of bat-

442 associated clades in the growing diversity of trypanosomes, Hamilton and others hypothesized that bats 443 may have been highly influential in the geographic spread of the *T. cruzi* clade and host-switching to 444 other mammals (14). This 'bat-seeding' hypothesis has continued to gain support since it was proposed 445 with the discovery of diverse lineages in the *T. cruzi* clade in bats globally (12, 41). Similar patterns 446 have been noted in malarial parasites (Haemosporida), wherein the transition from sauropsids into 447 mammals likely occurred only once, with bats being a possible bridge to other mammals (13, 65). In 448 light of the results of this study and the patterns in other systems, we contend that the 'bat-seeding' 449 hypothesis may apply more widely among mammalian parasites. Our approach using comprehensive 450 phylogenetic analysis, estimation of divergence times, and ancestral reconstruction of host associations 451 could be applied to understand the evolutionary radiation and host-switching patterns of these parasites, 452 and potentially the role that bats have played in their diversification.

453

454 Acknowledgements

We thank the members of the Webb laboratory for their suggestions on early drafts of this manuscript. The findings and conclusions in this report are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the official position of CDC.

458

459 Author contributions

460 C.M. and M.K. designed research; C.M., Y.B., and M.K. performed research; C.M. analyzed data; and461 C.M. and C.W. wrote the paper.

462

463 References

464 1. Zhu Q, Hastriter MW, Whiting MF, Dittmar K (2015) Fleas (Siphonaptera) are Cretaceous, and
465 evolved with Theria. *Mol Phylogenet Evol* 90:129–139.

- 466 2. Roth S, et al. (2019) Bedbugs evolved before their bat hosts and did not co-speciate with ancient
- 467 humans. *Curr Biol* 29(11):1847–1853.
- 468 3. Kosoy MY (2010) Ecological associations between bacteria of the genus Bartonella and
- 469 mammals. *Biol Bull* 37(7):716–724.
- 470 4. Harms A, Dehio C (2012) Intruders below the radar: molecular pathogenesis of *Bartonella* spp.
- 471 *Clin Microbiol Rev* 25(1):42–78.
- 472 5. Vayssier-Taussat M, Le Rhun D, Bonnet S, Cotté V (2009) Insights in Bartonella host
- 473 specificity. *Ann N Y Acad Sci* 1166(1):127–132.
- 474 6. Calisher CH, Childs JE, Field HE, Holmes K V, Schountz T (2006) Bats: important reservoir
- 475 hosts of emerging viruses. *Clin Microbiol Rev* 19(3):531–545.
- 476 7. Banerjee A, et al. (2020) Novel insights into immune systems of bats. *Front Immunol*

477 11(January):1–15.

- 478 8. Shi JJ, Rabosky DL (2015) Speciation dynamics during the global radiation of extant bats.
 479 *Evolution (N Y)* 69(6):1528–1545.
- 480 9. Cui J, Li F, Shi ZL (2019) Origin and evolution of pathogenic coronaviruses. *Nat Rev Microbiol*481 17(3):181–192.
- 482 10. Badrane H, Tordo N (2001) Host switching in Lyssavirus history from the Chiroptera to the
 483 Carnivora orders. *J Virol* 75(17):8096–8104.
- 484 11. Drexler JF, et al. (2012) Bats host major mammalian paramyxoviruses. *Nat Commun* 3:796.
- 485 12. Espinosa-Álvarez O, et al. (2018) *Trypanosoma rangeli* is phylogenetically closer to Old World
- 486 trypanosomes than to *Trypanosoma cruzi*. *Int J Parasitol* 48(7):569–584.
- 487 13. Galen SC, et al. (2018) The polyphyly of *Plasmodium*: comprehensive phylogenetic analyses of
- 488 the malaria parasites (order Haemosporida) reveal widespread taxonomic conflict. *R Soc Open*
- 489 *Sci* 5:171780.

- 490 14. Hamilton PB, Teixeira MM, Stevens JR (2012) The evolution of Trypanosoma cruzi: the 'bat
- 491 seeding' hypothesis. *Trends Parasitol* 28(4):136–141.
- 492 15. Fournier P-E, Drancourt M, Aboudharam G, Raoult D (2015) Paleomicrobiology of *Bartonella*
- 493 infections. *Microbes Infect* 17(11–12):879–883.
- 494 16. Segers FHID, Kešnerová L, Kosoy M, Engel P (2017) Genomic changes associated with the
- 495 evolutionary transition of an insect gut symbiont into a blood-borne pathogen. *ISME J*:1–13.
- 496 17. Kuo C-H, Ochman H (2009) Inferring clocks when lacking rocks: the variable rates of molecular
- 497 evolution in bacteria. *Biol Direct* 4(1):35.
- 498 18. Frank HK, Boyd SD, Hadly EA (2018) Global fingerprint of humans on the distribution of
- 499 *Bartonella* bacteria in mammals. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* 12(11):e0006865.
- 500 19. Harms A, et al. (2017) Evolutionary dynamics of pathoadaptation revealed by three independent
- acquisitions of the VirB/D4 type IV secretion system in *Bartonella*. *Genome Biol Evol* 9(3):761–
 776.
- 503 20. McKee CD, Hayman DTS, Kosoy MY, Webb CT (2016) Phylogenetic and geographic patterns
- of bartonella host shifts among bat species. *Infect Genet Evol* 44:382–394.
- 505 21. Phillips MJ (2016) Geomolecular dating and the origin of placental mammals. *Syst Biol*506 65(3):546–557.
- 507 22. Kosoy M, McKee C, Albayrak L, Fofanov Y (2018) Genotyping of *Bartonella* bacteria and their
 508 animal hosts: current status and perspectives. *Parasitology* 145(5):543–562.
- 509 23. Drummond AJ, Rambaut A (2007) BEAST: Bayesian evolutionary analysis by sampling trees.
 510 *BMC Evol Biol* 7(1):214.
- 511 24. Miller MA, Pfeiffer W, Schwartz T (2010) Creating the CIPRES Science Gateway for inference
- 512 of large phylogenetic trees. *Proceedings of the Gateway Computing Environments Workshop*
- 513 *(GCE)*, pp 1–8.

- 514 25. Stadler T (2009) On incomplete sampling under birth-death models and connections to the
- 515 sampling-based coalescent. *J Theor Biol* 261(1):58–66.
- 516 26. R Core Team (2019) R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R Found Stat
- 517 *Comput Vienna, Austria.* Available at: http://www.r-project.org.
- 518 27. Ferreira MAR, Suchard MA (2008) Bayesian analysis of elapsed times in continuous-time
- 519 Markov chains. *Can J Stat* 36(3):355–368.
- 520 28. Olson DM, et al. (2001) Terrestrial ecoregions of the world: a new map of life on Earth.
- 521 *Bioscience* 51(11):933–938.
- 522 29. Parker J, Rambaut A, Pybus OG (2008) Correlating viral phenotypes with phylogeny:
- 523 accounting for phylogenetic uncertainty. *Infect Genet Evol* 8(3):239–246.
- 524 30. Lei BR, Olival KJ (2014) Contrasting patterns in mammal-bacteria coevolution: Bartonella and
- 525 *Leptospira* in bats and rodents. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* 8(3):e2738.
- 526 31. McKee CD, et al. (2019) Host phylogeny, geographic overlap, and roost sharing shape parasite
 527 communities in European bats. *Front Ecol Evol* 7(March):69.
- 528 32. Kumar S, Stecher G, Suleski M, Hedges SB (2017) TimeTree: a resource for timelines,
- 529 timetrees, and divergence times. *Mol Biol Evol* 34(7):1812–1819.
- 530 33. Tamura K, et al. (2012) Estimating divergence times in large molecular phylogenies. *Proc Natl*531 *Acad Sci* 109(47):19333–19338.
- 532 34. Kumar S, Stecher G, Li M, Knyaz C, Tamura K (2018) MEGA X: molecular evolutionary
- 533 genetics analysis across computing platforms. *Mol Biol Evol* 35(6):1547–1549.
- 534 35. Huelsenbeck JP, Nielsen R, Bollback JP (2003) Stochastic mapping of morphological characters.
 535 Syst Biol 52(2):131–158.
- 536 36. Paradis E, Claude J, Strimmer K (2004) APE: analyses of phylogenetics and evolution in R
- 537 language. *Bioinformatics* 20(2):289–290.

- 538 37. Revell LJ (2012) phytools: an R package for phylogenetic comparative biology (and other
- 539 things). *Methods Ecol Evol* 3(2):217–223.
- 540 38. Csárdi G, Nepusz T (2006) The igraph software package for complex network research.
- 541 InterJournal Complex Syst 1695:1695.
- 542 39. Tamura K, Tao Q, Kumar S (2018) Theoretical foundation of the RelTime method for estimating
- 543 divergence times from variable evolutionary rates. *Mol Biol Evol* 35(7):1770–1782.
- 544 40. Teeling EC, et al. (2005) A molecular phylogeny for bats illuminates biogeography and the fossil
 545 record. *Science (80-)* 307(5709):580–584.
- 546 41. Clément L, et al. (2020) Out of Africa: the origins of the protozoan blood parasites of the
- 547 *Trypanosoma cruzi* clade found in bats from Africa. *Mol Phylogenet Evol* 145(September
 548 2019):106705.
- 549 42. Kellner A, et al. (2018) Transmission pathways and spillover of an erythrocytic bacterial
 pathogen from domestic cats to wild felids. *Ecol Evol* (July):1–14.
- 551 43. Faria NR, Suchard M a, Rambaut A, Streicker DG, Lemey P (2013) Simultaneously
- reconstructing viral cross-species transmission history and identifying the underlying constraints.
- 553 *Philos Trans R Soc B* 368(1614):20120196–20120196.
- Williams HM, Dittmar K (2020) Expanding our view of *Bartonella* and its hosts: *Bartonella* in
 nest ectoparasites and their migratory avian hosts. *Parasit Vectors* 13(1):13.
- 556 45. Engel P, et al. (2011) Parallel evolution of a type IV secretion system in radiating lineages of the
- host-restricted bacterial pathogen *Bartonella*. *PLOS Genet* 7(2):e1001296.
- 558 46. Wagner A, Dehio C (2019) Role of distinct type-IV-secretion systems and secreted effector sets
- in host adaptation by pathogenic *Bartonella* species. *Cell Microbiol* 21(3):e13004.
- 560 47. Husnik F (2018) Host-symbiont-pathogen interactions in blood-feeding parasites: nutrition,
- 561 immune cross-talk and gene exchange. *Parasitology* 145(10):1294–1303.

- 562 48. Tsai Y-L, Chang C-C, Chuang S-T, Chomel BB (2011) Bartonella species and their
- 563 ectoparasites: selective host adaptation or strain selection between the vector and the mammalian
- host? Comp Immunol Microbiol Infect Dis 34(4):299–314.
- 565 49. McKee CD, et al. (2018) Survey of parasitic bacteria in bat bugs, Colorado. *J Med Entomol*566 55(1):237–241.
- 567 50. Leulmi H, et al. (2015) Competence of *Cimex lectularius* bed bugs for the transmission of

568 *Bartonella quintana*, the agent of trench fever. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* 9(5):e0003789.

569 51. Akhoundi M, et al. (2016) A historical overview of the classification, evolution, and dispersion

570 of *Leishmania* parasites and sandflies. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* 10(3):e0004349.

- 571 52. Light JE, Smith VS, Allen JM, Durden LA, Reed DL (2010) Evolutionary history of mammalian
 572 sucking lice (Phthiraptera: Anoplura). *BMC Evol Biol* 10(1):292.
- 573 53. de Moya RS (2019) Implications of a dating analysis of Hippoboscoidea (Diptera) for the origins

574 of phoresis in feather lice (Psocodea: Phthiraptera: Philopteridae). *Insect Syst Divers* 3(4):1–5.

- 575 54. Leulmi H, et al. (2016) Detection of Bartonella tamiae, Coxiella burnetii and rickettsiae in
- arthropods and tissues from wild and domestic animals in northeastern Algeria. *Parasit Vectors*
- 577 **9**(1):27.
- 578 55. Bai Y, et al. (2018) Human exposure to novel *Bartonella* species from contact with fruit bats.
- 579 *Emerg Infect Dis* 24(12):2317–2323.
- 580 56. Manter HW (1955) The zoogeography of trematodes of marine fishes. *Exp Parasitol* 4(1):62–86.
- 581 57. Manter HW (1966) Parasites of fishes as biological indicators of recent and ancient conditions.
- 582 Host-Parasite Relationships, ed McCauley JE (Oregon State University Press, Corvallis), pp 59–

583 71.

- 584 58. Eichler W (1942) Die Entfaltungsregel und andere Gesetzmäßigkeiten in den
- 585 parasitogenetischen Beziehungen der Mallophagen und anderer ständiger Parasiten zu ihren
- 586 Wirten. *Zool Anz* 137:77–83.
- 587 59. Eick GN, Jacobs DS, Matthee CA (2005) A nuclear DNA phylogenetic perspective on the
- 588 evolution of echolocation and historical biogeography of extant bats (Chiroptera). *Mol Biol Evol*

589 22(9):1869–1886.

590 60. Brook CE, Dobson AP (2015) Bats as 'special' reservoirs for emerging zoonotic pathogens.

591 *Trends Microbiol* 23(3):172–180.

- 592 61. Hayman DTS (2019) Bat tolerance to viral infections. *Nat Microbiol* 4(5):728–729.
- 593 62. Ahn M, et al. (2019) Dampened NLRP3-mediated inflammation in bats and implications for a
- 594 special viral reservoir host. *Nat Microbiol* 4(5):789–799.
- 595 63. Schountz T, Baker ML, Butler J, Munster V (2017) Immunological control of viral infections in
- bats and the emergence of viruses highly pathogenic to humans. *Front Immunol* 8(September).
- 597 doi:10.3389/fimmu.2017.01098.
- 598 64. Zhang G, et al. (2013) Comparative analysis of bat genomes provides insight into the evolution
- 599 of flight and immunity. *Science* 339(6118):456–60.
- 600 65. Lutz HL, et al. (2016) Diverse sampling of East African haemosporidians reveals chiropteran
- 601 origin of malaria parasites in primates and rodents. *Mol Phylogenet Evol* 99:7–15.

603 Figure legends

Fig. 1. Evolution of *Bartonella* lineages, host associations, and geographic origins. Timed maximum clade credibility tree of *Bartonella* lineages. Tips are collapsed into clades of related *Bartonella* species and strains (SI Appendix, Tables S5 and S6); the number of tips in each clade is shown in brackets. Posterior probabilities (PP) for nodes are indicated by the size of circles; ancient nodes had strong support (PP = 1), unless otherwise labeled. Branch lengths are in millions of years. Ancestral state reconstruction of (A) host order and (B) ecozone transitions was performed during the estimation of diversification times. Branches are colored according to their most probable (PP > 0.5) host order or ecozone states, with host or ecozone probability shown by the color of circles at each node. The Cretaceous-Paleogene extinction event is drawn as a gray line at 66 million years ago.

613

Fig. 2. Comparison of divergence dates between *Bartonella* clades and associated host mammal clades. (A) Divergence times and intervals for *Bartonella* (in orange) and host clades (in purple). Black points show the median estimates and thin bars show divergence date ranges. Thick bars for mammal clades are the 95% confidence intervals estimated from TimeTree and the same bars for *Bartonella* clades are the 95% HPD intervals. (B) Correlation of median divergence dates between host and *Bartonella* clades, with clade identifiers shown as points. The solid green line indicates the best linear fit through the points and the dashed grey line shows the 1:1 line if host and *Bartonella* divergence dates were equal.

622

Fig. 3. Transition network for (A) host orders and (B) ecozones across the *Bartonella* phylogeny. Edges connecting nodes are the median number of transitions between host and ecozone states based on stochastic character mapping on 1000 posterior sampled trees. Edge widths are proportional to the median number of transitions. Edges with a median of zero transitions are not shown. Transitions

- 627 between the outgroup (Brucella abortus) and between mammalian orders and arthropods have been
- 628 removed for clarity. All transition counts with a median above zero are shown in SI Appendix, Table

629 S9.

Fig. 1







