

1 The coronavirus proofreading exoribonuclease mediates extensive viral recombination

2

3 Jennifer Gribble<sup>1,3</sup>, Andrea J. Pruijssers<sup>2</sup>, Maria L. Agostini<sup>2</sup>, Jordan Anderson-Daniels<sup>2</sup>,

4 James D. Chappell<sup>2</sup>, Xiaotao Lu<sup>2</sup>, Laura J. Stevens<sup>2</sup>, Andrew L. Routh<sup>4,5\*</sup>, Mark R.

5 Denison<sup>1,2,3,#\*</sup>

6

7 <sup>1</sup> Department of Pathology, Microbiology, and Immunology, Vanderbilt University

8 Medical Center, Nashville, TN, USA

9 <sup>2</sup> Department of Pediatrics, Vanderbilt University Medical Center, Nashville, TN, USA

10 <sup>3</sup> Vanderbilt Institute for Infection, Immunology, and Inflammation (VI4), Vanderbilt

11 University Medical Center, Nashville, TN, USA

12 <sup>4</sup> Department of Biochemistry and Molecular Biology, University of Texas – Medical

13 Branch, Galveston, TX, USA

14 <sup>5</sup> Sealy Center for Structural Biology and Molecular Biophysics, University of Texas –

15 Medical Branch, Galveston, TX, USA

16

17 #Lead Contact: M.R.D: [mark.denison@vumc.org](mailto:mark.denison@vumc.org)

18 \*Correspondence: [mark.denison@vumc.org](mailto:mark.denison@vumc.org); [alrouth@utmb.edu](mailto:alrouth@utmb.edu)

19

## 20 **SUMMARY**

21 Coronaviruses (CoVs) emerge as zoonoses and cause severe disease in humans,

22 demonstrated by the SARS-CoV-2 (COVID-19) pandemic. RNA recombination is

23 required during normal CoV replication for subgenomic mRNA (sgmRNA) synthesis and

24 generates defective viral genomes (DVGs) of unknown function. However, the  
25 determinants and patterns of CoV recombination are unknown. Here, we show that  
26 divergent  $\beta$ -CoVs SARS-CoV-2, MERS-CoV, and murine hepatitis virus (MHV) perform  
27 extensive RNA recombination in culture, generating similar patterns of recombination  
28 junctions and diverse populations of DVGs and sgmRNAs. We demonstrate that the  
29 CoV proofreading nonstructural protein (nsp14) 3'-to-5' exoribonuclease (nsp14-ExoN)  
30 is required for normal CoV recombination and that its genetic inactivation causes  
31 significantly decreased frequency and altered patterns of recombination in both infected  
32 cells and released virions. Thus, nsp14-ExoN is a key determinant of both high fidelity  
33 CoV replication and recombination, and thereby represents a highly-conserved and  
34 vulnerable target for virus inhibition and attenuation.

35

36 Keywords:

37 coronavirus, exoribonuclease, recombination, proofreading, direct RNA sequencing,  
38 nanopore, defective genome, SARS-CoV-2, MERS-CoV

39

## 40 **INTRODUCTION**

41 Coronaviruses (CoVs) are a family of positive-sense, single-stranded RNA viruses with  
42 genomes ranging in size between 26 and 32 kb (Figure 1A and 3A). CoV recombination  
43 has been reported to be associated with increased spread, severe disease, and vaccine  
44 failure in livestock CoV epidemics (Chen et al., 2017; Feng et al., 2018) and proposed  
45 to be important in the emergence of human CoVs including the beta-CoVs ( $\beta$ -CoVs)  
46 severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus (SARS-CoV) (Anthony et al., 2017;

47 Drosten et al., 2003; Hon et al., 2008; Ksiazek et al., 2003; Li et al., 2005) and Middle  
48 East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV) (Yusof et al., 2017; Zaki et al.,  
49 2012). The ongoing severe global pandemic of SARS-CoV-2, the etiological agent of  
50 coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) (Wu et al., 2020; Zhou et al., 2020) underlines  
51 the importance of defining the determinants of CoV evolution and emergence into  
52 human populations (Paraskevis et al., 2020; Randhawa et al., 2020; Wahba et al., 2020;  
53 Wong et al., 2020; Zhou et al., 2020). Studies comparing CoV strains that are closely  
54 related to SARS-CoV-2 have proposed that SARS-CoV-2 acquired the ability to infect  
55 human cells through recombination within the spike protein sequence (Huang et al.,  
56 2020; Li et al., 2020; Patiño-Galindo et al., 2020). Further, a study of genetic variation in  
57 patient SARS-CoV-2 samples has suggested that recombination may be occurring  
58 during infections in humans (Yi, 2020). Together, these data support the hypothesis that  
59 generation of novel CoVs, cross-species movement, and adaptation may be driven by  
60 recombination events in nature (Lau et al., 2015), and that CoV recombination can  
61 result in increased virulence, pathogenicity, and potential pandemic spread.

62  
63 Experimental recombination has been most studied in the model  $\beta$ -CoV murine hepatitis  
64 virus (MHV). During mixed infections of related MHV strains, ~25% of progeny virions  
65 are generated by recombination (Keck et al., 1988; Kottier et al., 1995; Lai et al., 1985;  
66 Makino et al., 1986). During normal replication, the putative CoV replication-  
67 transcription complex (RTC) performs discontinuous transcription at virus-specific  
68 transcription regulatory sequences (TRSs) (Figure 1A, 3A) to generate a set of  
69 subgenomic mRNAs (sgmRNAs) with common 5' leader sequences and 3' ends, which

70 are subsequently translated into structural and accessory proteins (Dufour et al., 2011;  
71 Kirchdoerfer and Ward, 2019; Subissi et al., 2014; Weiss et al., 1994). CoV replication  
72 also generates defective viral genomes (DVGs) that contain multiple deletions of  
73 genomic sequence. DVGs range in size from <1kb to >20kb, but retain intact 5' and 3'  
74 genomic untranslated regions (5' and 3' UTRs) and are amplified by RTC machinery  
75 supplied by co-infecting full-length helper CoVs (Brian and Spaan, 1997; Makino et al.,  
76 1985; Schaad and Baric, 1994; Wu and Brian, 2010). Therefore, CoVs perform  
77 recombination as a normal part of their replication, producing complex populations of  
78 recombined RNA molecules. Prior to the advent of next generation sequencing, direct  
79 analysis of recombined CoV RNAs was not possible and the determinants of  
80 recombination could not be identified.

81  
82 In other RNA virus families including picornaviruses and alphaviruses, regulation of  
83 recombination has been mapped to replication fidelity determinants in the viral RNA-  
84 dependent RNA polymerase (RdRp) (Kempf et al., 2016; Li et al., 2019; Poirier et al.,  
85 2015; Woodman et al., 2018). In contrast to these viruses, CoV replication fidelity is  
86 primarily determined by the 3'-5' exonuclease encoded in nonstructural protein 14  
87 (nsp14-ExoN) that proofreads RNA during replication through excision of mismatched  
88 incorporated nucleotides (Ferron et al., 2018a; Ma et al., 2015). Viral exonucleases are  
89 essential for recombination in DNA viruses, including vaccinia virus (Gammon and  
90 Evans, 2009) and herpes simplex virus 1 (Grady et al., 2017; Schumacher et al., 2012).  
91 In contrast, the role of the CoV nsp14-ExoN in RNA recombination has not been  
92 defined. Catalytic inactivation of nsp14-ExoN resulted in qualitatively reduced

93 abundance of MHV sgmRNA2 (Eckerle et al., 2007) and altered human CoV 229E  
94 (HCoV-229E) sgmRNA detection during viral recovery (Minskaia et al., 2006). These  
95 studies suggest that nsp14-ExoN RNA proofreading activity of CoVs may play a key  
96 role in RNA recombination in addition to known functions in replication fidelity, viral  
97 fitness and virulence, resistance to nucleoside analogs, and immune antagonism (Case  
98 et al., 2017; Ferron et al., 2018a; Graepel et al., 2019).

99

100 In this study, we sought to define the frequency and patterns of recombination of  
101 divergent  $\beta$ -CoVs SARS-CoV-2, MERS-CoV, and MHV. We show that all three viruses  
102 perform extensive recombination during replication *in vitro*, with broadly similar patterns  
103 of recombination, generating diverse populations of recombined molecules. We further  
104 demonstrate that genetically engineered inactivation of MHV nsp14-ExoN activity  
105 results in a significant decrease in recombination frequency, altered recombination  
106 junction patterns across the genome, and altered junction site selection. These defects  
107 and alterations result in a marked change in MHV-ExoN(-) recombined RNA  
108 populations, including defective viral genomes (DVGs). Previous studies our lab and  
109 others confirm the requirement of ExoN activity in high-fidelity replication, exclusion of  
110 aberrant nucleotides, viral fitness, and virulence (Eckerle et al., 2007, 2007; Ferron et  
111 al., 2018a; Graham et al., 2012). Combined with the multiple critical integrated functions  
112 of nsp14-ExoN, the demonstration in this study that nsp14-ExoN activity is required for  
113 WT-like recombination further defines it as an exceptionally conserved, vulnerable, and  
114 highly specific target for inhibition by antiviral treatments and viral attenuation. These  
115 results also support future studies aimed at illuminating the role of SARS-CoV-2 nsp14-

116 ExoN activity in RNA recombination, the regulation of sgmRNA expression, and its  
117 contribution to novel CoV zoonotic emergence.

118

## 119 **RESULTS**

120 **SARS-CoV-2 and MERS-CoV undergo extensive RNA recombination to generate**  
121 **populations of recombination junctions.** We first sought to quantify recombination  
122 frequency and identify recombination patterns in zoonotic CoVs by sequencing both  
123 MERS-CoV and SARS-CoV-2 RNA.

124

125 Vero CCL-81 cells were infected with MERS-CoV derived from an infectious clone at  
126 passage 1 with an MOI of 0.3 pfu/mL for 72 hours until >70% cytopathic effect was  
127 observed. Vero E6 cells were infected with SARS-CoV-2 derived from a patient isolate  
128 passaged in culture (passage 5) at an MOI of 0.45 pfu/mL for 60 hours until >70%  
129 cytopathic effect was observed. Total RNA from infected cells was isolated and poly(A)-  
130 selected to capture all genomic and subgenomic RNA, as well as defective viral  
131 genomes (DVGs). Equal amounts of total cell RNA from both viruses was sequenced by  
132 short-read Illumina RNA-sequencing (RNA-seq) and long-read direct RNA Nanopore  
133 sequencing. The depth and low error rate of RNA-seq facilitated the quantification and  
134 detection of both high- and low-abundance unique junctions, but did not allow for  
135 detection of junctions in the context of a full-length RNA molecule. Long-read direct  
136 RNA sequencing on the Oxford Nanopore Technologies MinION platform was used to  
137 sequence complete RNA molecules. By combining both short- and long-read RNA  
138 sequencing, we accomplished high-confidence quantification and detection of

139 recombination junctions as well as description of the genetic architectures of molecules  
140 formed by the junctions.

141

142 For RNA-seq, we generated libraries in triplicate from 2  $\mu$ g samples of both MERS-CoV  
143 and SARS-CoV-2 infected cells. Reads were aligned to the respective viral genomes  
144 using a recombination-aware mapper, *ViReMa* (*Virus Recombination Mapper*) (Routh  
145 and Johnson, 2014). *ViReMa* detects non-homologous recombination events resulting  
146 in subgenomic mRNAs (sgmRNAs) and defective viral genomes (DVGs) by identifying  
147 recombination junctions that generate a deletion greater than 5 base-pairs flanked on  
148 both sides by a 25 base-pair alignment. *ViReMa* aligned both recombined and non-  
149 recombined reads in the library and reported the total number of nucleotides aligned to  
150 the genome and all detected recombination junctions (Figure S1A-B).

151

152 MERS-CoV RNA contained an average of 19,367 detected junctions per dataset and  
153 SARS-CoV-2 libraries had an average of 56,082 detected junctions per dataset. To  
154 normalize for variations in library size between samples, recombination junction  
155 frequency ( $J_{\text{freq}}$ ) was calculated for MERS-CoV and SARS-CoV-2 (Figure 1B).  $J_{\text{freq}}$   
156 refers to the number of nucleotides in all detected junctions normalized to total mapped  
157 nucleotides in a library. MERS-CoV had a mean  $J_{\text{freq}}$  of 37.80 junctions detected per  
158 10,000 mapped nucleotides. SARS-CoV-2 had a mean  $J_{\text{freq}}$  of 475.7 junctions per  
159 10,000 mapped nucleotides (Figure 1B). To define the patterns of these detected  
160 recombination junctions, we mapped forward (5'  $\rightarrow$  3') recombination junctions  
161 according to their genomic position (Figure 1C-D, Figure S1C-D). Both MERS-CoV and

162 SARS-CoV-2 displayed clusters of junctions between the 5' and 3' ends of the genome,  
163 intermediate genomic positions and the 3' end of the genome, and within the 3' end of  
164 the genome (Figure 1B-C). SARS-CoV-2 also had many low-frequency junctions  
165 distributed across the genome, a major cluster of junctions representing local deletions  
166 and between the 5' UTR and the rest of the genome, and horizontal clusters of low-  
167 frequency junctions between common start sites at position ~2000 and ~8000 and the  
168 rest of the genome (Figure 1D). Overall, these data demonstrate that extensive RNA  
169 recombination in both MERS-CoV and SARS-CoV-2 generates diverse populations of  
170 junctions with similar high-abundance clusters.

171

172 To determine whether high-frequency recombination occurs randomly across MERS-  
173 CoV and SARS-CoV-2 genomes, we calculated mean positional recombination  
174 frequency (Figure 1E-F) by comparing the number of nucleotides in detected junctions  
175 (both start and stop sites) at that position normalized to nucleotide depth at that  
176 position. The first and last 5000 nucleotides of both MERS-CoV and SARS-CoV-2  
177 genomes showed clusters of recombination (Figure 1E-F). SARS-CoV-2 had many  
178 peaks of recombination frequency of greater than 0.50 (50%) across the genome  
179 (Figure 1F), suggesting that SARS-CoV-2 generates a diverse set of RNA molecules  
180 with distinct genetic architectures through recombination.

181

182 **Direct RNA Nanopore sequencing of MERS-CoV and SARS-CoV-2 defines the**  
183 **architecture of full-length genome, subgenomic RNAs, and defective viral**  
184 **genomes.**

185 We performed direct RNA Nanopore sequencing on the same RNA used for short-read  
186 RNA-seq. For both viruses, three independent sequencing experiments were performed  
187 on triplicate samples of 2  $\mu$ g RNA for each virus. In order to remove prematurely  
188 truncated sequences, we bioinformatically filtered for Nanopore reads containing both  
189 genomic termini. Capture and sequencing of sgmRNAs and DVGs resulted in high  
190 sequencing coverage at both ends of the genome, while the relatively poorer capture of  
191 full-length genomes was limited due to their extreme length and resulting in depleted  
192 coverage in the middle of the genome (Figure 2A-B). We sequenced 132,493 MERS-  
193 CoV RNA molecules and 1,725,862 SARS-CoV-2 RNA molecules that had 85.6% and  
194 82.2% identity to the parental genome, respectively (Table S1). We obtained 3 full-  
195 length direct RNA sequences of the SARS-CoV-2 genome containing over 29,850  
196 consecutive nucleotides that aligned to the SARS-CoV-2 genome (Table S2). In MERS-  
197 CoV RNA, we detected 451 unique junction-containing full-length molecules (Figure 2A,  
198 Table S3). SARS-CoV-2 RNA contained distinct 172,191 junction-containing molecules  
199 (Figure 2B, Table S2).

200

201 To define the architectures of detected molecules, we filtered for junctions with at least  
202 3 supporting Nanopore reads. In MERS-CoV, we defined 5 distinct species, including 3  
203 sgmRNAs (6, 7, and 8) and 2 DVGs (Figure 2C). In SARS-CoV-2, there were 1166  
204 isoforms with a single junction and 227 containing 2 junctions. Because the TRS  
205 sequences and sgmRNA species have not previously been experimentally confirmed in  
206 SARS-CoV-2, a Nanopore read was categorized as a predicted sgmRNA transcript if it  
207 had a junction between the predicted 5' TRS-L and the predicted structural and

208 accessory open reading frames to include both canonical and non-canonical sgmRNAs.  
209 The 15 most abundant isoforms in SARS-CoV-2 included 7 predicted sgmRNA  
210 transcripts and 8 DVGs (Figure 2D). We also identified potential alternative transcripts  
211 corresponding to a single gene (ORF8) (Figure 2D). In summary, direct RNA Nanopore  
212 sequencing defined a diverse set of recombined RNAs generated by both MERS-CoV  
213 and SARS-CoV-2. The results confirmed and extended the short-read RNA-seq  
214 datasets. Our results are likely an underestimate of total numbers and diversity based  
215 on the conservative bioinformatic limitation of analysis to isoforms with at least 3  
216 supporting reads. Thus, both MERS-CoV and SARS-CoV-2 engage in extensive RNA  
217 recombination during replication in cell culture, producing diverse junctions across the  
218 viral genomes and many recombined RNA isoforms, with the indication that SARS-CoV-  
219 2 recombination exceeds that of MERS-CoV in Vero cells. These findings underline the  
220 importance of defining the determinants of CoV recombination.

221

222 **The  $\beta$ -coronavirus murine hepatitis virus (MHV) lacking nsp14-ExoN activity has**  
223 **significantly decreased and altered distribution of RNA recombination events.** In  
224 picornaviruses and alphaviruses, recombination is regulated by determinants of  
225 replication fidelity (Kempf et al., 2016; Li et al., 2019; Poirier et al., 2015; Woodman et  
226 al., 2018). CoVs encode a 3'-5' exoribonuclease (ExoN) in non-structural protein 14  
227 (nsp14) that regulates replication fidelity by RNA proofreading (Eckerle et al., 2007;  
228 Ferron et al., 2018b; Minskaia et al., 2006). No proofreading-deficient nsp14-ExoN  
229 catalytic mutant has been rescued in MERS-CoV or SARS-CoV-2. We have rescued  
230 and extensively studied ExoN catalytic inactivation mutants (ExoN(-)) in  $\beta$ -CoVs murine

231 hepatitis virus (MHV) and SARS-CoV. We used MHV and compared an engineered  
232 ExoN catalytic inactivation mutant (MHV-ExoN(-)) to wild-type virus (MHV-WT). Murine  
233 delayed brain tumor cells (DBT-9) were infected in triplicate with either MHV-WT or  
234 MHV-ExoN(-) at an MOI of 0.01 pfu/mL and total infected cell monolayer RNA was  
235 extracted when the monolayer was 95% involved in cytopathic effect and >75% intact.  
236 To isolate virions, DBT-9 cell were infected in triplicate with either MHV-WT or MHV-  
237 ExoN(-) at an MOI of 0.01 pfu/mL and virions were isolated by ultracentrifugation from  
238 supernatant collected when the monolayer was 95% involved in cytopathic effect and  
239 >90% intact. RNA-seq datasets were aligned to the MHV genome using *ViReMa*,  
240 reporting the genomic coverage in infected cells (Figure S2A-B) and virions (Figure  
241 S3A-B). To determine whether loss of nsp14-ExoN activity alters recombination, we  
242 quantified recombination junction frequency ( $J_{\text{req}}$ ) in MHV-WT and MHV-ExoN(-). We  
243 found that MHV-ExoN(-) had significantly decreased  $J_{\text{req}}$  relative to MHV-WT in both  
244 infected cells (Figure 3B) and virions (Figure 3D).

245  
246 We next tested whether loss of nsp14-ExoN activity altered the population of junction  
247 sites. Recombination junctions detected by *ViReMa* were plotted according to their start  
248 (5') and stop (3') sites in infected cell RNA (Figure 3C, Figure S2C-D) and virion RNA  
249 (Figure 3E, Figure S3C-D). MHV-WT displayed clusters of junctions (i) between the 5'  
250 and 3' ends of the genome, (ii) between intermediate genomic positions and the 3' end  
251 of the genome, (iii) between the 5' UTR and the rest of the genome, (iv) in local  
252 deletions across the genome, and (v) within the 3' end of the genome (Figure 3C and  
253 3E). Similarly, MHV-ExoN(-) accumulated junction clusters between the 5' and 3' ends

254 of the genome and within the 3' end of the genome (Figure 3C and 3E). However, MHV-  
255 ExoN(-) had fewer junctions between the 5' UTR and the rest of the genome and fewer  
256 junctions forming local deletions (Figure 3C and 3E). Together, these findings show that  
257 loss of MHV nsp14-ExoN activity resulted in decreased recombination frequency and  
258 altered junction patterns across the genome.

259

260 **Loss of nsp14-ExoN activity alters recombination in distinct genomic regions.** To  
261 determine whether the engineered defect in nsp14-ExoN alters recombination across  
262 the genome, we calculated and compared mean positional recombination frequencies of  
263 MHV-WT (blue) and MHV-ExoN(-) (orange) in both infected cell monolayers (Figure 4A)  
264 and virions (Figure 4B). MHV-WT has high recombination frequency at the 5' and 3'  
265 ends of the genome as well as at distinct sites across the genome. MHV-ExoN(-) has a  
266 similar distribution in both infected cells and virus particles (Figure 4A-B). There were  
267 765 positions in infected cell RNA and 499 positions in virion RNA (Table S4) with  
268 significantly altered recombination frequency in MHV-ExoN(-) compared to MHV-WT.  
269 These differences are best illustrated when the distinct genomic regions are separately  
270 visualized (Figure S4).

271

272 In the 5' UTR, nucleotides within the TRS-leader (TRS-L, yellow) participate in  
273 recombination junctions in both MHV-WT and MHV-ExoN(-) as expected, although  
274 MHV-ExoN(-) has significantly decreased recombination frequency at all sites within the  
275 TRS-L (Figure S4A, Table S4). Both MHV-WT and MHV-ExoN(-) display recombination  
276 across the nonstructural proteins, although MHV-ExoN(-) demonstrates overall

277 decreased recombination in these regions compared with MHV-WT (Figure S4B-C,  
278 Table S4). In virions, MHV-ExoN(-) has significantly increased recombination in nsp3,  
279 nsp4, and two positions in nsp12 (Figure S4B-C, Table S4). In addition, MHV-ExoN(-)  
280 has significantly increased recombination at one position within the 3' untranslated  
281 region (3'-UTR) (Figure S4E, Table S4).

282

283 **MHV-ExoN(-) has decreased subgenomic mRNA populations and increased**

284 **abundance of defective viral genomes.** We next determined whether loss of nsp14-

285 ExoN activity influences sgmRNA patterns and abundance, as proposed in earlier

286 studies (Eckerle et al., 2007; Minskaia et al., 2006). We quantified recombination

287 junction frequencies ( $J_{\text{freq}}$ ) of each of the known junctions formed between the common

288 TRS-L and 6 sgmRNA-specific body TRSs. sgmRNA  $J_{\text{freq}}$  refers to the number of

289 nucleotides corresponding to the sgmRNA leader-body junction normalized to mapped

290 library size. sgmRNAs 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7 were significantly decreased in MHV-ExoN(-)

291 infected cell RNA (Figure 4C). sgmRNA 4 and 6 were present at significantly decreased

292 frequencies in MHV-ExoN(-) virions compared to MHV-WT (Figure 4D). Thus, MHV-

293 ExoN(-) has altered frequency of multiple sgmRNAs both in infected cells and in virus

294 particles.

295

296 We further defined alterations to different populations of recombined RNA molecules in

297 MHV-ExoN(-) compared to MHV-WT by quantifying the percentages of sgmRNA and

298 DVG junctions in the total population of detected junctions. Any junction that did not

299 form a canonical leader-body TRS junction was considered a DVG junction, likely

300 including a subset of previously undefined non-canonical or alternative sgRNA  
301 junctions. The percentage of sgRNA junctions were significantly decreased and the  
302 percentage of DVG junctions significantly increased in both infected cell RNA (Figure  
303 4E) and virion RNA (Figure 4F). These findings demonstrate that loss of nsp14-ExoN  
304 activity alters the locations at which the replicase machinery recombines across the  
305 genome, resulting in both decreased and altered sgRNAs and relatively increased  
306 percentage of DVGs in MHV-ExoN(-) compared to MHV-WT. Thus, catalytic inactivation  
307 of nsp14-ExoN results in a defect in recombination site selection.

308

309 **Differential abundance of recombination junctions in MHV-ExoN(-) reveals altered**  
310 **recombination junction site selection.** We next defined the distribution of  
311 recombination junctions with altered abundance in MHV-ExoN(-) compared to MHV-WT.  
312 We quantified the abundance junctions identified over three independent experiments  
313 and identified junction populations with altered abundances in MHV-ExoN(-) compared  
314 to MHV-WT using *DESeq2* (Love et al., 2014). MHV-ExoN(-) RNA contained distinct  
315 junction populations with both significantly increased and decreased abundance relative  
316 to MHV-WT in infected cells (Figure S5A, Table S5) and in virus particles (Figure S5B,  
317 Table S5). We mapped significantly altered junctions by their genomic position (Figure  
318 4G-H). Recombination junctions enriched in MHV-ExoN(-) were mainly found between  
319 the 5' and 3' ends of the genome (Figure 4G-H). This observation suggests that MHV-  
320 ExoN(-) is accumulating altered populations of DVGs that are formed by these  
321 deletions.

322

323 Junctions with decreased abundance in MHV-ExoN(-) compared to MHV-WT in both  
324 infected cells (Figure 4G) and virions (Figures 4H) mainly clustered between the 5' UTR  
325 and the rest of the genome. Further, infected cell RNA demonstrates a cluster of  
326 junctions with decreased abundance in MHV-ExoN(-) in the 3' end of the genome that  
327 represent local deletions in this region (Figure 4G). This finding was complemented by  
328 the cluster of decreased abundance of local deletions of 10 – 50 bp in length across the  
329 genome in MHV-ExoN(-) virion RNA (Figure 4H). Together, these findings demonstrate  
330 that the populations of recombination junctions that were differentially abundant in MHV-  
331 ExoN(-) were not randomly distributed across the genome. This suggests that loss of  
332 nsp14-ExoN activity results in altered recombination site selection in distinct regions of  
333 the genome.

334

335 **Direct RNA Nanopore sequencing identifies defects in MHV-ExoN(-) full-length**  
336 **recombined RNA populations.** To test the alterations of full-length recombined RNAs  
337 due to loss of nsp14-ExoN proofreading activity, we sequenced MHV-WT and MHV-  
338 ExoN(-) virion RNA by direct RNA Nanopore sequencing. Reads were mapped to the  
339 MHV genome using minimap2 and mapped reads containing both genomic termini were  
340 identified. MHV-WT virion RNA contained 101,714 complete molecules and MHV-  
341 ExoN(-) virion RNA yielded 19,334 (Table S1). Reads mapping to the full-length  
342 parental genome were not observed, likely due to the length (31.4 kb) of the MHV  
343 genome, and datasets yielded only sgmRNAs and DVGs. MHV-ExoN(-) consistently  
344 demonstrated  $\sim 1$  log<sub>10</sub> reduction in nucleotide depth at positions across the genome  
345 relative to MHV-WT (Figure 5A). This finding directly corroborated the decreased

346 recombination junction frequency of MHV-ExoN(-) compared to MHV-WT demonstrated  
347 in short-read Illumina RNA-seq datasets (Figure 3B).  
348  
349 Consistent with fewer full-length molecules sequenced, MHV-ExoN(-) had a global  
350 decrease in the number of junctions across the genome (Figure 5B). Because  
351 molecules with multiple junctions in a single molecule were detected but not supported  
352 by more than one read, they were excluded from downstream analyses. We next  
353 mapped junctions detected in full-length RNA molecules according to their genomic  
354 position (Figure 5C). While MHV-WT contains 852 unique junctions present in full-length  
355 molecules, MHV-ExoN(-) had only 43 (Table S3). MHV-WT recombination junctions  
356 exclusively connect positions in the first ~8,000 nucleotides of the genome to the 3' UTR  
357 (Figure 5C). MHV-ExoN(-) had fewer junction sites, none of which represented distinct  
358 clusters (Figure 5D). We next grouped junctions within 10-base pair windows to define  
359 distinct families of molecules supported by at least three reads. Nine such architectures  
360 were identified in MHV-WT (Figure 5E). These populations contain both DVGs and  
361 sgmRNAs. The four most abundant isoforms were also detected in MHV-ExoN(-) virion  
362 RNA, which corresponded to a DVG and sgmRNAs 4,6 and 7 (Figure 5E). We did not  
363 detect MHV-ExoN(-)-unique variants with at least 3 supporting reads, potentially due to  
364 their low frequency in the population and the limited depth of Nanopore sequencing.  
365 Additionally, all junctions generating RNA molecules found in MHV-WT and MHV-  
366 ExoN(-) were present in short-read RNA-seq datasets. These data demonstrate that  
367 loss of nsp14-ExoN activity drives the accumulation altered recombined RNA  
368 populations and DVG species diversity.

369

## 370 **DISCUSSION**

371 In this study, we define the diversity of the CoV recombination landscape in MHV,  
372 MERS-CoV, and SARS-CoV-2. We also demonstrate that the loss of nsp14-ExoN  
373 activity in MHV results in decreased recombination and alters site selection of  
374 recombination junctions. Our results support a model in which nsp14-ExoN activity  
375 functions during replication to drive normal recombination, leading to the generation of  
376 populations of discrete molecules, including sgRNAs and DVGs.

377

378 **MERS-CoV and SARS-CoV-2 have extensive recombination networks producing**  
379 **diverse populations of RNA species.** We show that both MERS-CoV and SARS-CoV-  
380 2, the etiological agent of the ongoing global pandemic of COVID-19, performs  
381 extensive recombination and generates diverse populations of RNA molecules. SARS-  
382 CoV-2 demonstrated relatively increased recombination frequency compared to MERS-  
383 CoV and displayed unique clusters of recombination junctions across the SARS-CoV-2  
384 genome. We analyzed SARS-CoV-2 propagated from a clinical isolate that had been  
385 passaged in cell culture, while MERS-CoV was generated from an isogenic clone of low  
386 passage. It is possible that the differences could be the result of the diversity and  
387 composition of the original sample or propagation in different cell types. Alternatively,  
388 these differences may be due to alterations in transcription and RNA synthesis kinetics  
389 in SARS-CoV-2 compared to MERS-CoV, which have not been previously defined. It  
390 will be important for future studies to determine the role of the diversity of the viral  
391 population, cell environment, and virus-specific RNA synthesis kinetics in viral

392 recombination. Nevertheless, both viruses perform extensive, high-frequency  
393 recombination and generate diverse species of recombined RNAs.

394

395 Direct RNA Nanopore sequencing on the Oxford Nanopore Technologies MinION  
396 platform has sequenced sgmRNAs and DVGs in the alpha-coronavirus human  
397 coronavirus 229E (HCoV-229E) (Viehweger et al., 2019) and has been utilized to  
398 identify putative sgmRNAs in SARS-CoV-2 (Kim et al., 2020; Taiaroa et al., 2020).

399 Direct RNA Nanopore sequencing further revealed the profound diversity of RNA  
400 species produced by SARS-CoV-2 during infection and yielded the first reported full-  
401 length, continuous direct RNA reads of SARS-CoV-2. The full-length genome  
402 sequences are currently the longest and most complete direct RNA Nanopore  
403 sequences reported for any CoV. Detection of multiple RNA molecules with similar but  
404 distinct genetic architectures corresponding to a single open reading frame suggests  
405 that SARS-CoV-2 produces alternative transcripts. Tandem genetic and proteomic  
406 studies of sgmRNA species in SARS-CoV-2 will be valuable to experimentally define  
407 populations of translated SARS-CoV-2 sgmRNAs their role in viral replication.

408

409 **Murine hepatitis virus (MHV) incorporates diverse recombinant RNA in its virions.**

410 Comparison of recombination in MHV-infected cells and virus particles (virions)  
411 revealed that the observed recombination patterns and species generated in infected  
412 cells are largely retained in virions. Specifically, we observed three previously  
413 unexpected recombination junction clusters: (1) junctions connecting the canonical 5'  
414 TRS-L to non-canonical positions across the genome; (2) junctions representing small

415 local deletions distributed evenly across the genome; and (3) local recombination within  
416 the 3' end of the genome, including structural proteins and the 3' UTR. This result was  
417 surprising based on earlier studies reporting the requirement of specific packaging  
418 signals for incorporation of select RNA species into the virions (Kuo and Masters, 2013).  
419 Our direct RNA Nanopore sequencing studies show that MHV virions contain a diverse  
420 population of recombined RNA molecules which exclude the canonical MHV packaging  
421 signal at position 20,273 – 20,367 (Kuo and Masters, 2013). Thus, MHV may have  
422 much lower barriers for packaging a diverse population of RNA species than previously  
423 known, which may aid in the transmission and accumulation of DVGs even under low-  
424 MOI conditions.

425

426 **MHV lacking nsp14-ExoN activity has globally decreased and altered**  
427 **recombination.** MHV-ExoN(-) demonstrated a global decrease in recombination  
428 junction frequency in both infected cells and virions while also exhibiting skewed  
429 populations of sgmRNAs, an increased proportion of DVGs, and altered populations of  
430 recombinant isoforms. Our findings demonstrate a novel role for nsp14-ExoN in CoV  
431 RNA recombination and further suggest that loss of nsp14-ExoN activity results in  
432 altered recombination site selection. Decreased recombination frequency at canonical  
433 TRSs in MHV-ExoN(-) suggest that there is decreased accumulation of sgmRNAs. This  
434 finding is supported by previous studies (Eckerle et al., 2007; Minskaia et al., 2006) that  
435 report a defect in MHV-ExoN(-) sgmRNA synthesis. Perturbation of the abundance of  
436 each sgmRNA will likely have a profound influence on the fitness and virulence of CoVs  
437 as sgmRNAs encode critical viral proteins including nucleocapsid (N), spike (S), and

438 many accessory ORFs that impact replication efficiency and counteract host innate  
439 immune responses (Cruz et al., 2011; Muth et al., 2018).

440

441 MHV-ExoN(-) virion RNA demonstrates a significant increase in recombination in five  
442 distinct genomic regions: 1) nsp3, 2) nsp4, 3) nsp12, 4) the spike (S) protein, and 5) the  
443 3' UTR. Previous studies show that CoV DVGs frequently contain sequences from the  
444 first replicase proteins after the 5' UTR (Kim et al.; Makino; Makino et al., 1984, 1988;  
445 Penzes et al., 1996). Increased recombination in nsp3 and nsp4 may be the result of  
446 altered DVG formation and increased accumulation in virus particles. Some of the  
447 detected DVGs may be non-canonical sgmRNAs, containing junctions near the TRSs  
448 and potentially encode novel translation reading frames (Di et al., 2017; Viehweger et  
449 al., 2019).

450

451 **Loss of MHV nsp14-ExoN activity results in altered recombination site selection.**

452 Differential abundance analysis, mapping of junction detected in multiple experiments,  
453 and direct RNA Nanopore sequencing suggest that defective nsp14-ExoN activity drives  
454 altered recombination site selection resulting in different populations of accumulated  
455 molecules. In this model, abrogation of nsp14-ExoN activity would cause altered  
456 replicase activity, resulting in selection of aberrant sites, potentially based on sequence  
457 or structural elements. In both picornaviruses and alphaviruses, low fidelity mutant  
458 viruses have altered polymerase speed and processivity (Campagnola et al., 2015) and  
459 these properties contribute to recombination and the generation of defective interfering  
460 particles (Kim et al., 2019; Langsjoen et al., 2020; Poirier et al., 2015). The MHV-ExoN(-

461 ) replicase may have altered protein-protein interactions that change the stability of the  
462 complex and drive altered site selection. Alternatively, loss of nsp14-ExoN activity may  
463 result in defective replicase-RNA interactions and therefore cause altered RNA  
464 recombination site selection. In both models, nsp14-ExoN activity is an important  
465 determinant of replicase activity during RNA synthesis and recombination. However,  
466 there are likely other determinants of recombination in the CoV replicase that will be  
467 important to define through future genetic and structure-function studies.

468

469 In this study, we identify key positions across the genome that are involved in  
470 recombination junctions in the model  $\beta$ -CoV, MHV and we establish nsp14-ExoN  
471 proofreading activity as a key determinant of recombination in  $\beta$ -CoVs. Our previous  
472 studies of MHV nsp14-ExoN findings genetics and functions have been directly  
473 reproduced in SARS-CoV (Agostini et al., 2018; Eckerle et al., 2010; Smith et al., 2013).  
474 Thus, we would predict that SARS-CoV-2, will demonstrate the requirement of nsp14-  
475 ExoN activity for recombination. Further, treatment of SARS-CoV-2 infection with small  
476 molecules that target the replicase proteins including nsp14-ExoN may result in an  
477 altered recombination landscape and perturb viral fitness. It will be important for future  
478 studies to assess the role of RNA proofreading, replication fidelity, and small molecule  
479 antivirals in recombination of SARS-CoV-2. Understanding the relationship between  
480 protein determinants in RNA recombination will provide new targets for countermeasure  
481 development to combat emergence of novel CoVs from animal reservoirs with  
482 pandemic potential.

483

484 **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

485 We thank members of the Denison laboratory for insightful discussions regarding this  
486 study. This work was supported by National Institutes of Health grants R01AI108197  
487 (M.R.D.), T32GM065086 (J.G.), F31AI133952 (M.L.A). We are grateful for support from  
488 the Dolly Parton COVID-19 Research Fund, the Vanderbilt University Office of  
489 Research, and the Elizabeth B. Lamb Center for Pediatric Research at Vanderbilt  
490 University.

491

492 **AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS**

493 Conceptualization (M.R.D, J.D.C., J.G.); supervision (M.R.D., A.L.R.), project  
494 administration (M.R.D., A.L.R.), funding acquisition (M.R.D., J.D.C., A.J.P.), MHV  
495 infections and deep sequencing of MHV, MERS-CoV, and SARS-CoV (J.G.), MERS-  
496 CoV infections (L.J.S.), SARS-CoV-2 infections (L.J.S), SARS-CoV-2 RNA isolation  
497 (X.L.), Nanopore sequencing (J.G.), bioinformatic analysis and visualization (J.G.),  
498 software development (J.G., A.L.R.), data curation (J.G.), writing (J.G.), review and  
499 editing (all authors).

500

501 **DECLARATION OF INTERESTS**

502 The authors declare no competing interests.

503

504 **FIGURE LEGENDS**

505

506 **Figure 1. Genome-wide recombination generates populations of diverse RNA**  
507 **molecules in MERS-CoV and SARS-CoV-2.** (A) Genome organization of MERS-CoV  
508 (violet) and SARS-CoV-2 (gray). Nonstructural (nsps 1 – 16) and structural (S, E, M, N)  
509 and accessory open reading frames (ORFs) are labelled. The common 5' leader  
510 transcription leader sequence (TRS-L) is denoted with an unfilled red star. Body TRSs  
511 are labelled with filled red stars. MERS-CoV total cell lysates (black) and SARS-CoV-2  
512 infected cell monolayers (violet) were sequenced by RNA-seq. (B) Junction frequency  
513 ( $J_{\text{freq}}$ ) was calculated by comparing the number of nucleotides in *ViReMa*-detected  
514 junctions to all mapped nucleotides. Error bars represent standard errors of the mean  
515 for three independent sequencing libraries (N = 3). Recombination junctions are  
516 mapped according to their genomic position (5' junction site, Start Position; 3' junction  
517 site, Stop Position) and colored according to their frequency in the population of all  
518 junctions in MERS-CoV (C) and SARS-CoV-2 (D). The highest frequency junctions are  
519 magenta and completely opaque. The lowest frequency junctions are red and the most  
520 transparent. Dashed boxes represent clusters of junctions: (i) 5' → 3'; (ii) mid-genome  
521 → 3' UTR; (iii) 3' → 3'; (iv) local deletions; (v) 5' UTR → rest of genome. Recombination  
522 frequency is quantified across the MERS-CoV (E) and SARS-CoV-2 (F) genomes.  
523 Recombination frequency is represented as a mean of three independent sequencing  
524 libraries (N = 3). See also Figure S1.

525

526 **Figure 2. Direct RNA Nanopore sequencing of MERS-CoV and SARS-CoV-2**  
527 **reveals accumulation of distinct recombined RNA populations.** Direct RNA  
528 Nanopore sequencing of poly-adenylated MERS-CoV total cell lysates and SARS-CoV-

529 2 infected cell monolayer RNA. Three sequencing experiments were performed for each  
530 virus. Nanopore reads passing quality control were combined and mapped to the viral  
531 genome using *minimap2*. Full-length reads containing the genomic termini were  
532 identified by bioinformatic filtering. Genome coverage maps and Sashimi plots  
533 visualizing junctions (arcs) in full-length (A) MERS-CoV (black) and (B) SARS-CoV-2  
534 (violet) RNA reads. (C) Distinct RNA molecules identified in MERS-CoV (black) with at  
535 least 3 supporting reads are visualized. The number of sequenced reads containing the  
536 junction is listed (Count). Genetic sequences of each RNA molecule are represented by  
537 filled boxes and deleted regions are noted (Deleted Region(s)) and represented by  
538 dashed lines. Molecules containing junctions between the MERS-CoV TRS sequences  
539 are listed as sgmRNAs. (D) The 15 most abundant SARS-CoV-2 (violet) recombined  
540 RNA molecules and 3 full-genome reads are visualized. Molecules containing junctions  
541 linking the 5' UTR and the predicted open reading frames of structural and accessory  
542 proteins are listed as predicted sgmRNAs. See also Table S1, Table S2, and Table S3.

543

544 **Figure 3. Loss of nsp14-ExoN activity decreases recombination frequency and**

545 **alters recombination junction patterns across the genome.** (A) Genome

546 organization of MHV. Nonstructural (nsps 1 – 16) and structural (S, E, M, N) and

547 accessory open reading frames (ORFs) are labelled. The common 5' leader

548 transcription leader sequence (TRS-L) is denoted with an unfilled red star. Body TRSs

549 are labelled with filled red stars. Infected monolayer and virion RNA from independent

550 experiments were poly(A) selected, sequenced by RNA-seq, and aligned to the MHV

551 genome using *ViReMa*. Junction frequency ( $J_{\text{freq}}$ ) in infected monolayer RNA (B) and

552 virion RNA (D) was calculated by dividing the number of sequenced nucleotides in all  
553 junctions by the total number of nucleotides sequenced in the library. Error bars  
554 represent standard error of the means (SEM) (N = 3). Statistical significance was  
555 determined by the unpaired student's t-test. \*, p < 0.05. Unique forward (5' → 3')  
556 recombination junctions detected in infected monolayers (C) and virions (E) were  
557 mapped in MHV-WT and MHV-ExoN(-) according to their genomic position. Junctions  
558 are colored according to their frequency in the population (high frequency = magenta;  
559 low frequency = red). Clusters are marked by dashed boxes: (i) 5' → 3'; (ii) mid-genome  
560 → 3'; (iii) 3' → 3'; (iv) local deletions; (v) 5' UTR → rest of genome. See also Figure S2,  
561 Figure S3.

562

563 **Figure 4. Loss of nsp14-ExoN alters recombination at multiple genomic loci and**  
564 **skews recombined RNA populations.** Mean recombination frequency at each position  
565 across the MHV genome was compared in MHV-WT (blue) and MHV-ExoN(-) (orange)  
566 infected monolayer (A) and virion RNA (B). Positions with significantly altered  
567 recombination frequencies were identified by a 2-way ANOVA with multiple  
568 comparisons (N=3). The junction frequencies ( $J_{\text{freq}}$ ) of each sgmRNA were compared in  
569 MHV-WT (blue) and MHV-ExoN(-) (orange) infected monolayers (C) and virions (D).  
570 Error bars represent standard errors of the mean (SEM) (N = 3) and statistical  
571 significance was determined by a 2-way ANOVA with multiple comparisons, \* p < 0.05,  
572 \*\*\*\* p < 0.0001. (D) The percentages of sgmRNA and DVG junctions were compared in  
573 MHV-WT (blue) and MHV-ExoN(-) (orange) infected monolayers (E) and virions (F).  
574 Error bars represent SEM (N = 3). Statistical significance was determined by a 2-way

575 ANOVA with multiple comparisons, \*\*  $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$ . The abundance of  
576 junctions in MHV-ExoN(-) was compared to MHV-WT in infected monolayers (G) and  
577 virions (H) by *DESeq2*. Junctions with statistically significant altered abundance ( $p <$   
578  $0.05$ ,  $N = 3$ ) in MHV-ExoN(-) are mapped across the genome and colored according to  
579 their fold-change (red squares = decreased abundance, green circles = increased  
580 abundance). See also Figures S4 and S5B, Tables S4-S5.

581

582 **Figure 5. Direct RNA Nanopore sequencing of MHV full-length recombined RNA**

583 **molecules.** Direct RNA Nanopore sequencing of MHV virion RNA. Full-length reads  
584 were identified by bioinformatic filtering for reads containing the genomic termini. (A)

585 Genome coverage maps of full-length MHV-WT (blue) and MHV-ExoN(-) (orange)

586 Nanopore reads aligned to the MHV-A59 genome using *minimap2*. (B) Sashimi plot

587 visualizing junctions (arcs) in MHV-WT (blue) and MHV-ExoN(-) (orange). (C) Junctions

588 in reads containing only 2 discontinuous regions (1 junction) are mapped according to

589 genome position. The junction 5' site is mapped as the Start Position on the y-axis and

590 the 3' site is mapped as the Stop Position on the x-axis. Junctions are colored according

591 to their frequency in the population ( $\log_{10}(\text{Frequency})$ ). MHV-WT (low = blue, high =

592 cyan) and MHV-ExoN(-) (low = orange, high = yellow). (D) RNA molecule genetic

593 architectures with at least 3 supporting reads identified in both MHV-WT and MHV-

594 ExoN(-) (yellow) and unique to MHV-WT (blue). There were no reads unique to MHV-

595 ExoN(-) supported by at least 3 reads. Genetic sequences of the RNA molecule are

596 represented by filled boxes. Deleted regions are reported (Deleted Region) and

597 represented by dashed lined. Canonical sgmRNA species are noted. The number of  
598 reads supporting each species are noted (Count). See also Table S1 and Table S2.

599

## 600 **RESOURCE AVAILABILITY**

601 **Lead Contact.** Further information and requests for resources and reagents should be  
602 directed to and will be fulfilled by the Lead Contact, Mark R. Denison  
603 (mark.denison@vumc.org).

604 **Materials Availability.** This study did not generate new unique reagents.

605 **Data and Code Availability.** The datasets generated during this study are available at  
606 the Sequence Read Archive (SRA) under BioProject accession numbers  
607 PRJNA623001, PRNJA623016, PRJNA623285, PRJNA623325, PRJNA623312,  
608 PRNJA623282, PRJNA623323, PRJNA623314, PRJNA623580, PRJNA623578. The in-  
609 house scripts utilized in this study are publicly available at  
610 <https://github.com/DenisonLabVU/rna-seq-pipeline>.

## 611 **EXPERIMENTAL MODEL AND SUBJECT DETAILS**

612 **Cell lines.** DBT-9 (delayed brain tumor, murine astrocytoma clone 9) cells were  
613 maintained at 37°C as described previously (Chen and Baric, 1996). DBT-9 cells were  
614 originally obtained from Ralph Baric at University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill and were  
615 maintained within 50 passages of this progenitor stock. Cells were maintained in  
616 Dulbecco's modified Eagle medium (DMEM) (Gibco) supplemented with 10% fetal clone  
617 serum (FCS) (Invitrogen), 100 U/mL penicillin and streptomycin (Gibco), and 0.25  
618 µg/mL amphotericin B (Corning). *Cercopithecus aethiops* Vero CCL-81 cells maintained  
619 in Dulbecco's modified Eagle medium (DMEM) (Gibco) supplemented to final

620 concentrations of 10% fetal calf serum (Gibco), 100 IU/ml penicillin (Mediatech), 100  
621 mg/ml streptomycin (Mediatech), and 0.25 mg/ml amphotericin B (Mediatech) were  
622 used for MERS-CoV-2 infection. Vero CCL-81 cells were obtained from ATCC. Vero E6  
623 cells maintained in Dulbecco's modified Eagle medium (DMEM) (Gibco) supplemented  
624 to final concentrations of 10% fetal calf serum (Gibco), 100 IU/ml penicillin (Mediatech),  
625 100 mg/ml streptomycin (Mediatech), and 0.25 mg/ml amphotericin B (Mediatech) were  
626 used for SARS-CoV-2 infections. Vero E6 cells were obtained from ATCC.

## 627 **METHOD DETAILS**

628 **Viruses.** All MHV work was performed using the recombinant WT strain MHV-A59  
629 (GenBank accession number AY910861.1 (Yount et al., 2002)) at passage 4 and an  
630 engineered ExoN(-) strain of MHV-A59 at passage 2. Experiments involving MERS-CoV  
631 were conducted using the human EMC/2012 strain recovered from an infectious clone  
632 (GenBank accession number JX869059.2) (Scobey et al., 2013). Experiments involving  
633 SARS-CoV-2 were conducted with a passage 5 virus inoculum generated from a  
634 Seattle, WA, USA COVID-19 patient (GenBank accession number MT020881.1). All  
635 virus manipulations were performed under stringent BSL-3 laboratory conditions  
636 according to strict protocols designed for safe and controlled handling of MERS-CoV  
637 and SARS-CoV-2.

638 **MHV isolation and virion purification.** Subconfluent 150-cm<sup>2</sup> flasks were infected with  
639 either MHV-A59 or MHV-ExoN(-) at an MOI of 0.01 PFU/cell. Supernatant was  
640 harvested at either 16 hours post infection (MHV-A59) or 24 hours post infection (MHV-  
641 ExoN(-)) when the monolayer was >95% fused and remained intact. Infection  
642 supernatant was clarified by centrifugation at 1500 x g for 5 minutes at 4°C. Viral

643 particles were purified on a 30% sucrose cushion by ultracentrifugation at 25,000 RPM  
644 at 4°C for 16 hours. The viral pellet was resuspended in MSE buffer (10mM MOPS, pH  
645 6.8; 150mM NaCl; 1 mM EDTA). Viral RNA was extracted using the TRIzol-LS reagent  
646 according to manufacturer's protocols. RNA was quantified using the Qubit RNA HS  
647 assay. Virion data in this paper is the result of three independent experiments  
648 sequenced independently.

649 **MHV isolation from infected monolayers.** Three subconfluent 150-cm<sup>2</sup> flasks of DBT-  
650 9 cells were infected with either MHV-WT or MHV-ExoN(-) at an MOI of 0.01 PFU/cell.  
651 Monolayer was harvested at either 16 hpi (MHV-WT) or 24 hpi (MHV-ExoN(-)) when the  
652 monolayer was >95% fused and >75% intact. RNA was extracted with TRIzol according  
653 to manufacturer's protocols. Infected monolayer data in this paper is the result of three  
654 independent experiments sequenced independently.

655 **MERS-CoV infection.** Three nearly confluent 25-cm<sup>2</sup> flasks of Vero CCL-81 cells were  
656 infected with MERS-CoV at an MOI of 0.3 pfu/cell. Total infected cell lysates were  
657 collected at 72 hpi with the monolayer ≤ 50% intact. RNA was extracted in TRIzol  
658 according to manufacturer's protocols.

659 **SARS-CoV-2 infection.** Five subconfluent 25-cm<sup>2</sup> flasks of Vero E6 cells were infected  
660 at an MOI = 0.45 pfu/cell and cellular monolayers were harvested 60 hpi when the  
661 monolayer was >90% fused. RNA was extracted in TRIzol according to manufacturer's  
662 protocols.

663 **Short-read Illumina RNA-sequencing of viral RNA.** Next generation sequencing  
664 (NGS) libraries were generated using 2 µg of RNA. RNA was submitted to Genewiz for  
665 library preparation and sequencing. Briefly, after quality control, polyadenylated RNA

666 was selected during library preparation. Isolated RNA was heat fragmented and libraries  
667 were prepared for 2 x 250 nucleotide paired-end sequencing performed (Illumina).  
668 Genewiz performed basecalling and read demultiplexing.

669 **Direct RNA Nanopore sequencing.** RNA from ultracentrifuge-purified virions was  
670 prepared for direct RNA Nanopore sequencing on the Oxford Nanopore Technologies  
671 MinION platform according to the manufacturer's protocols. Libraries were sequenced  
672 on fresh MinION R9.4 flow-cells for 24 hours, or until the pore occupancy was under  
673 20%. Virion RNA from three independent experiments was sequenced on three  
674 separate flow cells for both MHV-WT and MHV-ExoN(-). MERS-CoV RNA from three  
675 independent cultures was sequenced on three separate flow cells. SARS-CoV-2 RNA  
676 isolated from three independent infections was sequenced on three separate flow cells.

## 677 **QUANTIFICATION AND STATISTICAL ANALYSIS**

678 **Illumina RNA-seq processing and alignment.** Raw reads were processed by first  
679 removing the Illumina TruSeq adapter using *Trimmomatic* (Bolger et al., 2014)  
680 default settings (command line parameters `java -jar trimmomatic.jar PE`  
681 `sample_R1.fastq.gz sample_R2.fastq.gz output_paired_R1.fastq`  
682 `output_unpaired_R1.fastq output_paired_R2.fastq`  
683 `output_unpaired_R2_unpaired.fastq ILLUMINACLIP:TruSeq3-`  
684 `PE.fa:2:30:10 LEADING:3 TRAILING:3 SLIDINGWINDOW:4:15`  
685 `MINLEN:36`). Reads shorter than 36 bp were removed and low-quality bases (Q score  
686 < 30) were trimmed from read ends. The raw FASTQ files were aligned to the MHV-A59  
687 genome (AY910861.1), the MERS-CoV genome (JX869059.2), and the SARS-CoV-2  
688 genome (MT020881.1) using the Python2 script *ViReMa* (Viral Recombination Mapper)

689 (Routh and Johnson, 2014) using the command line parameters `python2 ViReMa.py`  
690 `reference_index input.fastq output.sam --OutputDir sample_virema/`  
691 `--OutputTag sample_virema -BED --MicroIndelLength 5`. The sequence  
692 alignment map (SAM) file was processed using the `samtools` (Li et al., 2009) suite to  
693 calculate nucleotide depth at each position in a sorted binary alignment map (BAM) file  
694 (using command line parameters `samtools depth -a -m 0`  
695 `sample_virema.sorted.bam > sample_virema.coverage`).

696 **Recombination junction analysis.** Recombination junction frequency ( $J_{\text{freq}}$ ) was  
697 calculated by comparing the number of nucleotides in detected recombination junctions  
698 to the total number of mapped nucleotides in a library. Nucleotides in detected  
699 recombination junctions were quantified as a sum of nucleotide depth reported at each  
700 junction in the BED file generated by *ViReMa*. Total nucleotides mapped to the MHV-  
701 A59 genome were quantified as a sum of nucleotide depth at each position across the  
702 genome in the tab-delineated text file generated by the *samtools*.  $J_{\text{freq}}$  was reported as  
703 junctions per  $10^4$  nucleotides sequenced. Mean  $J_{\text{freq}}$  values were compared between  
704 MHV-WT and MHV-ExoN(-) and statistical significance determined by an unpaired  
705 student's t-test. Junctions were mapped across the genome according to their start (5')  
706 and stop (3') positions. These junctions were first filtered in the forward (5' → 3')  
707 direction using the *dpylr* package (RStudio). The frequency of each junction was  
708 calculated by comparing the depth of the unique junction to the total number of  
709 nucleotides in all detected junctions in a library. Junctions were plotted according to the  
710 genomic position and colored according to  $\log_{10}$  of the frequency using *ggplot2* in  
711 RStudio.

712 Recombination frequency was calculated at each genomic position by dividing the  
713 number of nucleotides in any junction mapping to the position divided by the total  
714 number of nucleotides sequenced at the position. Mean recombination frequencies  
715 were compared between MHV-WT and MHV-ExoN(-) for three independent sequencing  
716 experiments by a two-way ANOVA statistical analysis with multiple comparisons.

717 **Identification of sgmRNA and DVG junctions.** Forward recombination junctions were  
718 classified as either canonical sgmRNA junctions or DVG junctions based on the position  
719 of their junction sites and filtered in Microsoft Excel. Briefly, junction start sites were  
720 filtered to those positioned between nucleotide 62 – 72 in the genome. The stop sites  
721 were then filtered for those positioned within each respective sgmRNA TRS. sgmRNA  
722 frequency was calculated by dividing the sum of the depth of all junctions corresponding  
723 to an individual sgmRNA by the total number of mapped nucleotides at each position.

724 The filtered sgmRNA junctions were compiled and DVG junctions were filtered in  
725 RStudio by performing an exclusionary `anti_join()` using `dplyr`. DVG junctions  
726 were filtered in the forward direction. The percentage of sgmRNA and DVG junctions  
727 was calculated by comparing the depth of all filtered sgmRNA or DVG junctions to the  
728 sum of all detected forward junctions. Mean percent sgmRNA and DVG was compared  
729 between three independent sequencing experiments in virion RNA. Statistical  
730 significance was determined by a 2-way ANOVA test with multiple comparisons.

731 **Differential abundance of junctions.** To compare the abundance of junctions in MHV-  
732 A59 and MHV-ExoN(-), the ViReMa output list of junctions was analyzed by in-house  
733 scripts (<https://github.com/DenisonLabVU>) and the R package *DESeq2* (Love et al.,  
734 2014). Junctions significantly up- or down-regulated in MHV-ExoN(-) were visualized

735 using *bioinfokit* (Bedre, 2020) and further mapped according to their genomic  
736 positions. Statistical significance was determined by the p-value of each junction  
737 calculated by the DESeq2 package in RStudio and junctions with a significant alteration  
738 of abundance in MHV-ExoN(-) compared to MHV-WT were visualized as either red or  
739 green in the graph generated by *bioinfokit*.

740 **Direct RNA Nanopore alignment and analysis.** Live basecalling was performed by  
741 *Guppy* in *MinKNOW*. Run statistics were generated from each sequencing experiment by  
742 *NanoPlot* (De Coster et al., 2018). Pass reads from all three experiments were  
743 concatenated for each virus and aligned to the genome using *minimap2* (Li, 2018) and  
744 *FLAIR* (Full Length Alternative Isoforms of RNA) (Tang et al., 2018) to generate  
745 alignment files and BED files listing deletions detected in each sequenced RNA  
746 molecule. Both BAM and BED files were filtered for full length molecules using  
747 *samtools* and Microsoft Excel, respectively. Full-length MHV molecules were defined  
748 as encoding coverage at positions 71 and 31034, representing the canonical TRS-L and  
749 beginning of the 3' UTR required for replication. Because no TRS sequences have been  
750 experimentally confirmed in either MERS-CoV or SARS-CoV-2, we filtered both  
751 datasets for those that included any sequence of the 5' UTR and 3' UTR of the  
752 respective viruses. BED files generated by the flair align module were parsed based on  
753 the number of junctions were identified. Nanopore reads containing only 1 junction were  
754 identified using Microsoft Excel and unique junctions were quantified in RStudio using  
755 base-R functions. Sequencing coverage maps were generated from *samtools* depth  
756 analysis of filtered BAM files. All junctions present in sequenced libraries were mapped  
757 in Sashimi plots generated by the Integrated Genome Viewer (IGV) (Robinson et al.,

2011). Junctions present in full-length MHV RNA molecules with a single deletion were mapped according to their genomic positions as previously described. The genetic architectures of full-length RNA molecules sequenced by direct RNA Nanopore sequencing were visualized by filtering RNA molecules for at least 3 supporting reads. Low frequency variants were removed from this analysis.

**Table S3. Direct RNA Nanopore read isoforms, related to Figures 2 and 5.** Direct RNA Nanopore reads aligning to viral genome by minimap2. Individual reads are listed by read name. Genomic positions of read alignment are listed (“Read Start”, “Read Stop”). Read segments aligning to the genome are noted (“# Segments”) and start positions and aligned segment lengths listed (“Segment Start”, “Segment Length”).

**Table S4. Genomic positions with significantly altered positional recombination frequency in MHV-ExoN(-) infected monolayer and virion RNA compared to MHV-WT, related to Figure 4.** Positions with significantly altered recombination frequency in MHV-ExoN(-) infected monolayer RNA compared to MHV-WT and in MHV-ExoN(-) virion RNA compared to MHV-WT as determined by a 2-way ANOVA with multiple comparisons are listed. Genomic regions are noted. (N = 3 for each infected cell and virion RNA samples)

**Table S5. Differential abundance of recombination junctions in MHV-ExoN(-) infected monolayer compared to MHV-WT, related to Figure 4.** Junctions with altered abundance in MHV-ExoN(-) infected monolayer RNA compared to MHV-WT and in MHV-ExoN(-) virion RNA compared to MHV-WT are listed. P-values calculated by DESeq2. (N = 3 for each infected monolayer and virion RNA samples)

781

782 **REFERENCES**

783

784 Agostini, M.L., Andres, E.L., Sims, A.C., Graham, R.L., Sheahan, T.P., Lu, X., Smith,  
785 E.C., Case, J.B., Feng, J.Y., Jordan, R., et al. (2018). Coronavirus Susceptibility to the  
786 Antiviral Remdesivir (GS-5734) Is Mediated by the Viral Polymerase and the  
787 Proofreading Exoribonuclease. *MBio* 9.

788 Anthony, S.J., Gilardi, K., Menachery, V.D., Goldstein, T., Ssebide, B., Mbabazi, R.,  
789 Navarrete-Macias, I., Liang, E., Wells, H., Hicks, A., et al. (2017). Further Evidence for  
790 Bats as the Evolutionary Source of Middle East Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus.  
791 *MBio* 8, e00373-17, /mbio/8/2/e00373-17.atom.

792 Bedre, R. (2020). [reneshbedre/bioinfokit](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/358123456).

793 Bolger, A.M., Lohse, M., and Usadel, B. (2014). Trimmomatic: a flexible trimmer for  
794 Illumina sequence data. *Bioinformatics* 30, 2114–2120.

795 Brian, D.A., and Spaan, W.J.M. (1997). Recombination and coronavirus defective  
796 interfering RNAs. *Seminars in Virology* 8, 101–111.

797 Campagnola, G., McDonald, S., Beaucourt, S., Vignuzzi, M., and Peersen, O.B. (2015).  
798 Structure-function relationships underlying the replication fidelity of viral RNA-dependent  
799 RNA polymerases. *Journal of Virology* 89, 275–286.

800 Case, J.B., Li, Y., Elliott, R., Lu, X., Graepel, K.W., Sexton, N.R., Smith, E.C., Weiss,  
801 S.R., and Denison, M.R. (2017). Murine Hepatitis Virus nsp14 Exoribonuclease Activity  
802 Is Required for Resistance to Innate Immunity. *J Virol* 92, e01531-17.

803 Chen, W., and Baric, R.S. (1996). Molecular anatomy of mouse hepatitis virus  
804 persistence: coevolution of increased host cell resistance and virus virulence. *Journal of*  
805 *Virology* 70, 3947–3960.

806 Chen, N., Li, S., Zhou, R., Zhu, M., He, S., Ye, M., Huang, Y., Li, S., Zhu, C., Xia, P., et  
807 al. (2017). Two novel porcine epidemic diarrhea virus (PEDV) recombinants from a  
808 natural recombinant and distinct subtypes of PEDV variants. *Virus Research* 242, 90–  
809 95.

810 Cruz, J.L.G., Sola, I., Becares, M., Alberca, B., Plana, J., Enjuanes, L., and Zuñiga, S.  
811 (2011). Coronavirus Gene 7 Counteracts Host Defenses and Modulates Virus  
812 Virulence. *PLOS Pathogens* 7, e1002090.

813 De Coster, W., D’Hert, S., Schultz, D.T., Cruts, M., and Van Broeckhoven, C. (2018).  
814 NanoPack: visualizing and processing long-read sequencing data. *Bioinformatics* 34,  
815 2666–2669.

- 816 Di, H., Madden, J.C., Morantz, E.K., Tang, H.-Y., Graham, R.L., Baric, R.S., and  
817 Brinton, M.A. (2017). Expanded subgenomic mRNA transcriptome and coding capacity  
818 of a nidovirus. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* *114*, E8895–E8904.
- 819 Drosten, C., Günther, S., Preiser, W., van der Werf, S., Brodt, H.-R., Becker, S.,  
820 Rabenau, H., Panning, M., Kolesnikova, L., Fouchier, R.A.M., et al. (2003). Identification  
821 of a novel coronavirus in patients with severe acute respiratory syndrome. *N. Engl. J.*  
822 *Med.* *348*, 1967–1976.
- 823 Dufour, D., Mateos-Gomez, P.A., Enjuanes, L., Gallego, J., and Sola, I. (2011).  
824 Structure and functional relevance of a transcription-regulating sequence involved in  
825 coronavirus discontinuous RNA synthesis. *Journal of Virology* *85*, 4963–4973.
- 826 Eckerle, L.D., Lu, X., Sperry, S.M., Choi, L., and Denison, M.R. (2007). High fidelity of  
827 murine hepatitis virus replication is decreased in nsp14 exonuclease mutants.  
828 *Journal of Virology* *81*, 12135–12144.
- 829 Eckerle, L.D., Becker, M.M., Halpin, R.A., Li, K., Venter, E., Lu, X., Scherbakova, S.,  
830 Graham, R.L., Baric, R.S., Stockwell, T.B., et al. (2010). Infidelity of SARS-CoV Nsp14-  
831 exonuclease mutant virus replication is revealed by complete genome sequencing.  
832 *PLoS Pathogens* *6*, e1000896.
- 833 Feng, K.Y., Chen, T., Zhang, X., Shao, G.M., Cao, Y., Chen, D.K., Lin, W.C., Chen, F.,  
834 and Xie, Q.M. (2018). Molecular characteristic and pathogenicity analysis of a virulent  
835 recombinant avian infectious bronchitis virus isolated in China. *Poultry Science* *97*,  
836 3519–3531.
- 837 Ferron, F., Subissi, L., Silveira De Moraes, A.T., Le, N.T.T., Sevajol, M., Gluais, L.,  
838 Decroly, E., Vonrhein, C., Bricogne, G., Canard, B., et al. (2018a). Structural and  
839 molecular basis of mismatch correction and ribavirin excision from coronavirus RNA.  
840 *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* *115*, E162–E171.
- 841 Ferron, F., Subissi, L., Silveira De Moraes, A.T., Le, N.T.T., Sevajol, M., Gluais, L.,  
842 Decroly, E., Vonrhein, C., Bricogne, G., Canard, B., et al. (2018b). Structural and  
843 molecular basis of mismatch correction and ribavirin excision from coronavirus RNA.  
844 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* *115*,  
845 E162–E171.
- 846 Gammon, D.B., and Evans, D.H. (2009). The 3'-to-5' Exonuclease Activity of Vaccinia  
847 Virus DNA Polymerase Is Essential and Plays a Role in Promoting Virus Genetic  
848 Recombination. *J Virol* *83*, 4236–4250.
- 849 Grady, L.M., Szczepaniak, R., Murelli, R.P., Masaoka, T., Le Grice, S.F.J., Wright, D.L.,  
850 and Weller, S.K. (2017). The Exonuclease Activity of Herpes Simplex Virus 1 UL12 Is  
851 Required for Production of Viral DNA That Can Be Packaged To Produce Infectious  
852 Virus. *J. Virol.* *91*.

- 853 Graepel, K.W., Agostini, M.L., Lu, X., Sexton, N.R., and Denison, M.R. (2019). Fitness  
854 Barriers Limit Reversion of a Proofreading-Deficient Coronavirus. *J Virol* 93, e00711-19,  
855 /jvi/93/20/JVI.00711-19.atom.
- 856 Graham, R.L., Becker, M.M., Eckerle, L.D., Bolles, M., Denison, M.R., and Baric, R.S.  
857 (2012). A live, impaired-fidelity coronavirus vaccine protects in an aged,  
858 immunocompromised mouse model of lethal disease. *Nat. Med.* 18, 1820–1826.
- 859 Hon, C.-C., Lam, T.-Y., Shi, Z.-L., Drummond, A.J., Yip, C.-W., Zeng, F., Lam, P.-Y.,  
860 and Leung, F.C.-C. (2008). Evidence of the Recombinant Origin of a Bat Severe Acute  
861 Respiratory Syndrome (SARS)-Like Coronavirus and Its Implications on the Direct  
862 Ancestor of SARS Coronavirus. *Journal of Virology* 82, 1819–1826.
- 863 Huang, J.-M., Jan, S.S., Wei, X., Wan, Y., and Ouyang, S. (2020). Evidence of the  
864 Recombinant Origin and Ongoing Mutations in Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome  
865 Coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2). *BioRxiv* 2020.03.16.993816.
- 866 Keck, J.G., Matsushima, G.K., Makino, S., Fleming, J.O., Vannier, D.M., Stohlman,  
867 S.A., and Lai, M.M. (1988). In vivo RNA-RNA recombination of coronavirus in mouse  
868 brain. *Journal of Virology* 62, 1810–1813.
- 869 Kempf, B.J., Peersen, O.B., and Barton, D.J. (2016). Poliovirus Polymerase Leu420  
870 Facilitates RNA Recombination and Ribavirin Resistance. *J. Virol.* 90, 8410–8421.
- 871 Kim, D., Lee, J.-Y., Yang, J.-S., Kim, J.W., Kim, V.N., and Chang, H. (2020). The  
872 architecture of SARS-CoV-2 transcriptome. *BioRxiv* 2020.03.12.988865.
- 873 Kim, H., Ellis, V.D., Woodman, A., Zhao, Y., Arnold, J.J., and Cameron, C.E. (2019).  
874 RNA-Dependent RNA Polymerase Speed and Fidelity are not the Only Determinants of  
875 the Mechanism or Efficiency of Recombination. *Genes (Basel)* 10.
- 876 Kim, Y.-N., Lai, M.M.C., and Makino, S. Generation and selection of coronavirus  
877 defective interfering RNA with large open reading frame by RNA recombination and  
878 possible editing. *Virology* 194, 244–253.
- 879 Kirchdoerfer, R.N., and Ward, A.B. (2019). Structure of the SARS-CoV nsp12  
880 polymerase bound to nsp7 and nsp8 co-factors. *Nat Commun* 10, 2342.
- 881 Kottier, S.A., Cavanagh, D., and Britton, P. (1995). Experimental Evidence of  
882 Recombination in Coronavirus Infectious Bronchitis Virus. *Virology* 213, 569–580.
- 883 Ksiazek, T.G., Erdman, D., Goldsmith, C.S., Zaki, S.R., Peret, T., Emery, S., Tong, S.,  
884 Urbani, C., Comer, J.A., Lim, W., et al. (2003). A novel coronavirus associated with  
885 severe acute respiratory syndrome. *N. Engl. J. Med.* 348, 1953–1966.
- 886 Kuo, L., and Masters, P.S. (2013). Functional Analysis of the Murine Coronavirus  
887 Genomic RNA Packaging Signal. *J Virol* 87, 5182–5192.

- 888 Lai, M.M., Baric, R.S., Makino, S., Keck, J.G., Egbert, J., Leibowitz, J.L., and Stohlman,  
889 S.A. (1985). Recombination between nonsegmented RNA genomes of murine  
890 coronaviruses. *Journal of Virology* 56, 449–456.
- 891 Langsjoen, R., Muruato, A., Kunkel, S., Jaworski, E., and Routh, A. (2020). Differential  
892 alphavirus defective RNA diversity between intracellular and encapsidated  
893 compartments is driven by subgenomic recombination events (*Molecular Biology*).
- 894 Lau, S.K.P., Feng, Y., Chen, H., Luk, H.K.H., Yang, W.-H., Li, K.S.M., Zhang, Y.-Z.,  
895 Huang, Y., Song, Z.-Z., Chow, W.-N., et al. (2015). Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome  
896 (SARS) Coronavirus ORF8 Protein Is Acquired from SARS-Related Coronavirus from  
897 Greater Horseshoe Bats through Recombination. *J. Virol.* 89, 10532–10547.
- 898 Li, H. (2018). Minimap2: pairwise alignment for nucleotide sequences. *Bioinformatics*  
899 34, 3094–3100.
- 900 Li, C., Wang, H., Shi, J., Yang, D., Zhou, G., Chang, J., Cameron, C.E., Woodman, A.,  
901 and Yu, L. (2019). Senecavirus-Specific Recombination Assays Reveal the Intimate  
902 Link between Polymerase Fidelity and RNA Recombination. *J Virol* 93, e00576-19,  
903 /jvi/93/13/JVI.00576-19.atom.
- 904 Li, H., Handsaker, B., Wysoker, A., Fennell, T., Ruan, J., Homer, N., Marth, G.,  
905 Abecasis, G., and Durbin, R. (2009). The Sequence Alignment/Map format and  
906 SAMtools. *Bioinformatics* 25, 2078–2079.
- 907 Li, W., Shi, Z., Yu, M., Ren, W., Smith, C., Epstein, J.H., Wang, H., Crameri, G., Hu, Z.,  
908 Zhang, H., et al. (2005). Bats Are Natural Reservoirs of SARS-Like Coronaviruses. *310*,  
909 5.
- 910 Li, X., Giorgi, E.E., Marichann, M.H., Foley, B., Xiao, C., Kong, X., Chen, Y., Korber, B.,  
911 and Gao, F. (2020). Emergence of SARS-CoV-2 through Recombination and Strong  
912 Purifying Selection. *BioRxiv* 2020.03.20.000885.
- 913 Love, M.I., Huber, W., and Anders, S. (2014). Moderated estimation of fold change and  
914 dispersion for RNA-seq data with DESeq2. *Genome Biol* 15, 550.
- 915 Ma, Y., Wu, L., Shaw, N., Gao, Y., Wang, J., Sun, Y., Lou, Z., Yan, L., Zhang, R., and  
916 Rao, Z. (2015). Structural basis and functional analysis of the SARS coronavirus  
917 nsp14–nsp10 complex. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 112, 9436–9441.
- 918 Makino, S. Structure of the Intracellular Defective Viral RNAs of Defective Interfering  
919 Particles of Mouse Hepatitis Virus. *J. VIROL.* 8.
- 920 Makino, S., Taguchi, Fumihiko, and Fujiwara, Kosaku (1984). Defective interfering  
921 particles of mouse hepatitis virus. *Virology* 133, 9–17.

- 922 Makino, S., Fujioka, N., and Fujiwara, K. (1985). Structure of the intracellular defective  
923 viral RNAs of defective interfering particles of mouse hepatitis virus. *Journal of Virology*  
924 *54*, 329–336.
- 925 Makino, S., Keck, J.G., Stohlman, S.A., and Lai, M.M. (1986). High-frequency RNA  
926 recombination of murine coronaviruses. *Journal of Virology* *57*, 729–737.
- 927 Makino, S., Shieh, C.-K., Soe, L.H., Baker, S.C., and Lai, M.M.C. (1988). Primary  
928 structure and translation of a defective interfering RNA of murine coronavirus. *Virology*  
929 *166*, 550–560.
- 930 Minskaia, E., Hertzog, T., Gorbalenya, A.E., Campanacci, V., Cambillau, C., Canard, B.,  
931 and Ziebuhr, J. (2006). Discovery of an RNA virus 3'→5' exoribonuclease that is  
932 critically involved in coronavirus RNA synthesis. *Proceedings of the National Academy*  
933 *of Sciences of the United States of America* *103*, 5108–5113.
- 934 Muth, D., Corman, V.M., Roth, H., Binger, T., Dijkman, R., Gottula, L.T., Gloza-Rausch,  
935 F., Balboni, A., Battilani, M., Rihtarič, D., et al. (2018). Attenuation of replication by a 29  
936 nucleotide deletion in SARS-coronavirus acquired during the early stages of human-to-  
937 human transmission. *Sci Rep* *8*, 1–11.
- 938 Paraskevis, D., Kostaki, E.G., Magiorkinis, G., Panayiotakopoulos, G., and Tsiodras, S.  
939 (2020). Full-genome evolutionary analysis of the novel corona virus (2019-nCoV) rejects  
940 the hypothesis of emergence as a result of a recent recombination event. *BioRxiv*  
941 2020.01.26.920249.
- 942 Patiño-Galindo, J.Á., Filip, I., AlQuraishi, M., and Rabadan, R. (2020). Recombination  
943 and lineage-specific mutations led to the emergence of SARS-CoV-2. *BioRxiv*  
944 2020.02.10.942748.
- 945 Penzes, Z., Wroe, C., Brown, T.D.K., Britton, P., and Cavanagh, D. (1996). Replication  
946 and Packaging of Coronavirus Infectious Bronchitis Virus Defective RNAs Lacking a  
947 Long Open Reading Frame. *J. VIROL.* *70*, 9.
- 948 Poirier, E.Z., Mounce, B.C., Rozen-Gagnon, K., Hooikaas, P.J., Stapleford, K.A.,  
949 Moratorio, G., and Vignuzzi, M. (2015). Low-Fidelity Polymerases of Alphaviruses  
950 Recombine at Higher Rates To Overproduce Defective Interfering Particles. *J. Virol.* *90*,  
951 2446–2454.
- 952 Randhawa, G.S., Soltysiak, M.P.M., Roz, H.E., Souza, C.P.E. de, Hill, K.A., and Kari, L.  
953 (2020). Machine learning analysis of genomic signatures provides evidence of  
954 associations between Wuhan 2019-nCoV and bat betacoronaviruses. *BioRxiv*  
955 2020.02.03.932350.
- 956 Robinson, J.T., Thorvaldsdóttir, H., Winckler, W., Guttman, M., Lander, E.S., Getz, G.,  
957 and Mesirov, J.P. (2011). Integrative Genomics Viewer. *Nat Biotechnol* *29*, 24–26.

- 958 Routh, A., and Johnson, J.E. (2014). Discovery of functional genomic motifs in viruses  
959 with ViReMa—a Virus Recombination Mapper—for analysis of next-generation  
960 sequencing data. *Nucleic Acids Res* 42, e11.
- 961 Schaad, M.C., and Baric, R.S. (1994). Genetics of mouse hepatitis virus transcription:  
962 evidence that subgenomic negative strands are functional templates. *Journal of Virology*  
963 68, 8169–8179.
- 964 Schumacher, A.J., Mohni, K.N., Kan, Y., Hendrickson, E.A., Stark, J.M., and Weller,  
965 S.K. (2012). The HSV-1 Exonuclease, UL12, Stimulates Recombination by a Single  
966 Strand Annealing Mechanism. *PLOS Pathogens* 8, e1002862.
- 967 Scobey, T., Yount, B.L., Sims, A.C., Donaldson, E.F., Agnihothram, S.S., Menachery,  
968 V.D., Graham, R.L., Swanstrom, J., Bove, P.F., Kim, J.D., et al. (2013). Reverse  
969 genetics with a full-length infectious cDNA of the Middle East respiratory syndrome  
970 coronavirus. *PNAS* 110, 16157–16162.
- 971 Smith, E.C., Blanc, H., Vignuzzi, M., and Denison, M.R. (2013). Coronaviruses Lacking  
972 Exoribonuclease Activity Are Susceptible to Lethal Mutagenesis: Evidence for  
973 Proofreading and Potential Therapeutics. *PLoS Pathog* 9, e1003565.
- 974 Subissi, L., Imbert, I., Ferron, F., Collet, A., Coutard, B., Decroly, E., and Canard, B.  
975 (2014). SARS-CoV ORF1b-encoded nonstructural proteins 12-16: replicative enzymes  
976 as antiviral targets. *Antiviral Research* 101, 122–130.
- 977 Taiaroa, G., Rawlinson, D., Featherstone, L., Pitt, M., Caly, L., Druce, J., Purcell, D.,  
978 Harty, L., Tran, T., Roberts, J., et al. (2020). Direct RNA sequencing and early evolution  
979 of SARS-CoV-2 (*Microbiology*).
- 980 Tang, A.D., Soulette, C.M., Baren, M.J. van, Hart, K., Hrabeta-Robinson, E., Wu, C.J.,  
981 and Brooks, A.N. (2018). Full-length transcript characterization of *SF3B1* mutation in  
982 chronic lymphocytic leukemia reveals downregulation of retained introns (*Genomics*).
- 983 Viehweger, A., Krautwurst, S., Lamkiewicz, K., Madhugiri, R., Ziebuhr, J., Hölzer, M.,  
984 and Marz, M. (2019). Direct RNA nanopore sequencing of full-length coronavirus  
985 genomes provides novel insights into structural variants and enables modification  
986 analysis. *Genome Res.* 29, 1545–1554.
- 987 Wahba, L., Jain, N., Fire, A.Z., Shoura, M.J., Artiles, K.L., McCoy, M.J., and Jeong, D.E.  
988 (2020). Identification of a pangolin niche for a 2019-nCoV-like coronavirus through an  
989 extensive meta-metagenomic search. *BioRxiv* 2020.02.08.939660.
- 990 Weiss, S.R., Hughes, S.A., Bonilla, P.J., Turner, J.D., Leibowitz, J.L., and Denison,  
991 M.R. (1994). Coronavirus polyprotein processing. In *Positive-Strand RNA Viruses*,  
992 (Vienna: Springer Vienna), pp. 349–358.

- 993 Wong, M.C., Javornik Cregeen, S.J., Ajami, N.J., and Petrosino, J.F. (2020). Evidence  
994 of recombination in coronaviruses implicating pangolin origins of nCoV-2019  
995 (Microbiology).
- 996 Woodman, A., Lee, K.-M., Janissen, R., Gong, Y.-N., Dekker, N.H., Shih, S.-R., and  
997 Cameron, C.E. (2018). Predicting Intraserotypic Recombination in Enterovirus 71. *J*  
998 *Virol* 93, e02057-18, [/jvi/93/4/JVI.02057-18.atom](#).
- 999 Wu, H.-Y., and Brian, D.A. (2010). Subgenomic messenger RNA amplification in  
1000 coronaviruses. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States*  
1001 *of America* 107, 12257–12262.
- 1002 Wu, F., Zhao, S., Yu, B., Chen, Y.-M., Wang, W., Song, Z.-G., Hu, Y., Tao, Z.-W., Tian,  
1003 J.-H., Pei, Y.-Y., et al. (2020). A new coronavirus associated with human respiratory  
1004 disease in China. *Nature* 1–5.
- 1005 Yi, H. (2020). 2019 novel coronavirus is undergoing active recombination. *Clin Infect*  
1006 *Dis*.
- 1007 Yount, B., Denison, M.R., Weiss, S.R., and Baric, R.S. (2002). Systematic Assembly of  
1008 a Full-Length Infectious cDNA of Mouse Hepatitis Virus Strain A59. *Journal of Virology*  
1009 76, 11065–11078.
- 1010 Yusof, M.F., Queen, K., Eltahir, Y.M., Paden, C.R., Al Hammadi, Z.M.A.H., Tao, Y., Li,  
1011 Y., Khalafalla, A.I., Shi, M., Zhang, J., et al. (2017). Diversity of Middle East respiratory  
1012 syndrome coronaviruses in 109 dromedary camels based on full-genome sequencing,  
1013 Abu Dhabi, United Arab Emirates. *Emerging Microbes & Infections* 6, 1–10.
- 1014 Zaki, A.M., van Boheemen, S., Bestebroer, T.M., Osterhaus, A.D.M.E., and Fouchier,  
1015 R.A.M. (2012). Isolation of a novel coronavirus from a man with pneumonia in Saudi  
1016 Arabia. *The New England Journal of Medicine* 367, 1814–1820.
- 1017 Zhou, P., Yang, X.-L., Wang, X.-G., Hu, B., Zhang, L., Zhang, W., Si, H.-R., Zhu, Y., Li,  
1018 B., Huang, C.-L., et al. (2020). Discovery of a novel coronavirus associated with the  
1019 recent pneumonia outbreak in humans and its potential bat origin. *BioRxiv*  
1020 2020.01.22.914952.
- 1021









